

Contents

| | |
|---|----------|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | v |
| <i>Summary Contents</i> | vii |
| <i>List of Abbreviations</i> | xv |
| | |
| PART 1 Key Conceptual Issues of the International Trade Law and International Human Rights Systems | 1 |
| 1 The Justice Dimension of the WTO | 3 |
| I. Introduction | 3 |
| II. The Broader Context | 4 |
| III. The Development of the International System – History and Ethos | 7 |
| IV. The Formation of the WTO | 9 |
| V. Concepts of Justice in the WTO | 10 |
| VI. International Human Rights Law Obligations in a Trade Law Context | 14 |
| 2 A Human Rights Methodology for Analysis | 17 |
| I. Introduction | 17 |
| II. A Legal Positivist Approach to Human Rights | 17 |
| III. Differentiating Human Rights from Other Moral Theories | 19 |
| IV. Challenges to the Use of a Human Rights Methodology for Assessing Trade Law Rules | 21 |
| V. The Importance of a Conception of Human Rights that Includes Equal Recognition of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights | 26 |
| VI. Conclusions | 32 |
| 3 The Rationale for a Human Rights Methodology in the WTO Context | 33 |
| I. Introduction | 33 |
| II. Traditional Hostility to Human Rights and Trade Linkage | 33 |
| III. The Need for a Re-evaluation of the Human Rights and Trade Relationship? | 35 |
| IV. The Potential of International Trade Rules to Enhance Human Rights | 38 |
| V. The Importance of an Explicit Human Rights Discourse | 41 |
| A. Does Open Trade Work in All Situations? | 41 |
| B. The Reality of the Current WTO System | 43 |
| C. The Added Value of a Human Rights Approach to International Trade | 45 |

x Contents

| | |
|---|-----------|
| D. The Importance of an Explicit Human Rights Discourse for a Holistic Conception of Human Rights | 46 |
| VI. Conclusions | 47 |
| | |
| PART 2 Key Legal Issues in Assessing the Human Rights Impact of the WTO | 49 |
| | |
| 4 A Legal Framework for the Analysis of the Human Rights Impacts of the WTO | 51 |
| I. Introduction | 51 |
| II. International Trade Law, International Human Rights and the International Legal System | 51 |
| III. Accounting for Human Rights in the Trade Law Context | 54 |
| IV. Disputed Hierarchies: Human Rights and Trade Law Norms and Standards | 56 |
| V. <i>Ius Cogens</i> and <i>Erga Omnes</i> Obligations | 58 |
| VI. A Methodology for Dealing with Human Rights in the Trade Law Context | 61 |
| A. Conditionality-Based Measures | 62 |
| B. Compliance-Based Measures | 62 |
| C. Cooperation-Based Measures | 63 |
| VII. A Rationale for the Proposed Methodology for Dealing with Human Rights In the Trade Law Context | 64 |
| VIII. Conclusions | 67 |
| | |
| 5 Some Background Issues on Conditionality-Based Measures | 69 |
| I. Introduction | 69 |
| II. Typologies of Conditionality-Based Measures | 70 |
| III. General Trade Restrictions | 73 |
| IV. Tailored Trade Restrictions | 76 |
| V. Conclusions | 81 |
| | |
| 6 Conditionality-Based Measures in Multilateral Frameworks | 83 |
| I. Introduction | 83 |
| II. Trade Restrictions Authorised by the United Nations | 84 |
| III. Trade Restrictions Authorised by the International Labour Organisation | 87 |
| IV. The Kimberley Process Certification Scheme | 92 |
| V. Conclusions | 95 |
| | |
| 7 Unilateral Conditionality-Based Measures | 97 |
| I. Introduction | 97 |
| II. Treatment of Unilateral Trade Restrictions Under General International Law and International Human Rights Law | 97 |

Contents xi

| | |
|---|-----|
| III. Treatment of Unilateral Trade Measures under WTO law | 102 |
| IV. The Potential for WTO Rules to Prevent Unilateral Trade Restrictions | 102 |
| V. The Potential for WTO Rules to Allow Unilateral Trade Restrictions | 105 |
| A. Human Rights Linkage in Regional and Bilateral Trade Agreements and Generalised Systems of Preferences | 107 |
| B. Regional and Bilateral Trade Agreements | 108 |
| C. Generalised Systems of Preferences | 111 |
| 1. The US's Generalised System of Preferences | 112 |
| 2. The EU's Generalised System of Preferences | 113 |
| D. India's WTO Challenge to the EU's Generalised System of Preferences | 114 |
| E. The EU's Generalised System of Preferences 2006-2015 | 117 |
| VI. A Role for the WTO in Overseeing Unilateral Conditionality-Based Measures? | 119 |
| VII. Conclusions | 121 |
| 8 A Legal Framework for Assessing Compliance and Cooperation-Based Measures | 123 |
| I. Introduction | 123 |
| II. Particular Issues Relating to Compliance and Cooperation-Based Measures | 124 |
| III. The General Methodology of the Reports of the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) | 127 |
| IV. Analysis of the OHCHR Approach to Assessing the Human Rights Impact of WTO Agreements | 128 |
| V. Interpretation of Obligations that Arise from Provisions of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights | 131 |
| VI. Different Methodological Approaches of International Trade Law and International Human Rights Law | 136 |
| VII. Differing Principles of Non-Discrimination | 140 |
| VIII. Mechanisms in the International Trade Agreements for Overcoming Potential Human Rights Violations | 143 |
| IX. Limitations of These Mechanisms | 145 |
| X. Conclusions | 147 |
| 9 A Case Study of Compliance and Cooperation-Based Measures: The TRIPS Agreement and the Access to Essential Medicines | 149 |
| I. Introduction | 149 |
| II. The Effect of Intellectual Property Protection on Access to Essential Medicines | 149 |
| III. A Human Rights Approach to Essential Medicines | 153 |
| IV. A Trade Law Approach to Essential Medicines | 155 |

xii *Contents*

| | |
|---|------------|
| V. Use of the TRIPS Agreement to Enforce Intellectual Property Rights | 157 |
| VI. The Doha Declaration Negotiations | 159 |
| VII. The Impact of a Human Rights Discourse on the TRIPS and Access to Medicines Debate | 163 |
| VIII. Can the Doha Declaration and Decision on Paragraph 6 Effectively Protect Developing Countries' Right to Protect the Public Health of Their Populations? | 165 |
| IX. Conclusions: Lessons to be Learned for other WTO Agreements | 168 |
| | |
| PART 3 Future Strategies for the Protection and Promotion of Human Rights in the International Trade Law Context | 173 |
| | |
| 10 Reappraising the Protection and Promotion of Human Rights in the WTO | 175 |
| I. Introduction | 175 |
| II. Different Approaches for Different Types of Human Rights Measures | 175 |
| III. Similarities in the Treatment of All Trade-Related Human Rights Measures | 179 |
| IV. WTO Trade Rules Versus Rules Negotiated Outside the WTO Framework | 180 |
| V. Strategies for a More Systematic Human Rights Approach to International Trade Law Rules | 182 |
| | |
| 11 Raising Explicit Human Rights Arguments in WTO Dispute Settlement Proceedings | 187 |
| I. Introduction | 187 |
| II. The Jurisdictional Competence of the WTO Dispute Settlement Bodies | 188 |
| III. Methodologies for Raising Human Rights Arguments in WTO Dispute Settlement Proceedings | 189 |
| IV. Mechanisms for Raising Human Rights Issues through WTO Agreements | 192 |
| V. Non-Discrimination Provisions of WTO Agreements | 192 |
| VI. General Exception Clauses | 197 |
| VII. Key Features of the General Exception Clauses | 197 |
| VIII. The Human Rights Applicability of the Public Morals Exception | 200 |
| A. Determining the Scope of Article 31.3(c) | 200 |
| B. An Assessment of the 'Ordinary Meaning' to be given to the term 'Public Morals' | 205 |

Contents xiii

| | |
|--|-----|
| C. Relevant 'Context' including the Preamble to the Treaties and WTO Case Law on the Terms | 205 |
| D. Supplementary Means of Interpretation | 209 |
| E. Conclusions on the Potential Applicability of the Public Morals Exception for Human Rights Arguments at the WTO | 211 |
| F. Approaches to Different Types of Human Rights Measures and Their Jurisdictional Context | 212 |
| IX. Human Rights Interpretation of the Public Morals Exception | 214 |
| A. Problems of a Trade Law Methodology for Raising Human Rights Law Arguments | 215 |
| B. Mechanisms for Advancing a Human Rights Interpretation | 219 |
| X. Conclusions | 221 |
| 12 Broader Strategies for Ensuring Trade Law Rules do not Negatively Impact upon Human Rights | 225 |
| I. Introduction | 225 |
| II. Monitoring the Impact of Trade Agreements on the Protection and Promotion of Human Rights | 226 |
| III. Improving the Specificity of Human Rights in the Trade Law Context | 234 |
| IV. Clarifying the (Potential) Impact of Trade Agreements on the Protection And Promotion of Human Rights | 235 |
| V. The Value of Express Reference to Human Rights in the WTO Context | 238 |
| VI. Procedural WTO Issues in the WTO Context | 242 |
| VII. Conclusions | 245 |
| Concluding Remarks | 247 |
| I. Complex Inter-Linkages Require Multi-Faceted Future Strategies | 247 |
| II. Exploration Beyond Conflict Resolution | 249 |
| III. A Policy-Orientated Approach to Future Strategies | 250 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 253 |
| <i>Index</i> | 265 |