

CONTENTS

Preface	v
Extracts from the Introduction to the First Edition	ix
Acknowledgements	xi
How to use this book	xiii
Table of Cases	xxxvii
Table of Statutes	lix
Table of Statutory Instruments	lxiii
Table of European Materials	lxv
Table of Abbreviations	lxvii
Part I	
Disciplinary and Regulatory Proceedings	
Chapter 1	
The Basis and Extent of Jurisdiction	
1 The legal basis of the disciplinary and regulatory functions	3
Bodies acting under statutory powers	3
Bodies acting under contractual powers	4
What standards will the courts require of a contractual regulator?	4
2 Territorial jurisdiction	5
English or Scottish law?	6
3 Jurisdiction in time	6
The continuance of jurisdiction after cessation of membership or authorisation	7
4 Who may be the subject of disciplinary action?	7
Members in partnerships and companies	7
Jurisdiction over persons other than members	7
The insolvency practitioner	8
5 Responsibility for the acts of another	8
Liability for employees	9
Chapter 2	
The Right to a Fair Trial	
1 The common law right to a fair trial	11
No application to contract	13
Effects of non-compliance with the rules of natural justice	13
Can a defect in natural justice be cured on appeal?	14

2 The Convention right to a fair hearing	15
The Article 6 rights	15
How the Court has extended the Article 6 rights	16
Certain rights absolute	17
The interpretation of Art 6	17
Equality of arms	17
Procedural rules must be established by law	18
3 To what organisations do the rules of natural justice apply and how may they be enforced?	18
The organisations subject to judicial review	19
Judicial review not confined to the acts of judicial bodies	20
Application to private bodies exercising statutory functions	20
Application to private bodies exercising non-statutory but public functions	20
Application to bodies acting under neither statute nor contract	21
4 What organisations constitute a 'public authority' for the purpose of the HRA 1998?	22
Discretion exercised by an individual	25
To what extent are disciplinary proceedings governed by the ECHR?	25
Other examples of loss of professional rights	26
Orders short of loss of professional rights	26
Does the application of Article 6 depend on the powers of the tribunal or the order made in the proceedings?	27
Public servants	28
Disciplinary proceedings as a 'criminal charge' or a 'criminal offence'	29
'Criminal charges': a summary	30
Can a lack of conformity to Article 6 be cured by a right of appeal to a conformable tribunal?	30
Rectification by judicial review	32
Victims	33
Margin of appreciation	34
Waiver of ECHR rights	34
Retrospective application of HRA 1998	34
5 How is the Convention right to a fair hearing enforced?	35
6 Applying to Strasbourg	36
The effect of a decision of the Strasbourg Court	37
Chapter 3	
The Common Framework	39
1 The investigatory body	40
Delegation of the investigative function	40
The tortious liability of reporting accountants and other investigators	40
Screening	41
Investigation by the firm in the first instance	41

2 The adjudicatory body	41
The prosecutor	42
3 The appellate body	42
4 Committees of inquiry	43
The duties of a committee of inquiry	43
5 Alternatives to disciplinary action	44
Issue arbitration	45
The duties of an arbitrator	45
Reasons	46
Private hearings	46
Revocation	46
Non-disclosure duty	47
Tortious liability	47
Enforcement of an arbitration award	47
Appeal from an arbitration award	47
Fee arbitration	48
Other techniques for resolving complaints	48
Mediation	48
Conciliation	48
Mini-trial or executive tribunal	48
Dangerous incident reporting: a special case	49
Chapter 4	
The Grounds for Disciplinary Action	51
1 Epithet misconduct (or misconduct broadly defined)	51
Serious professional misconduct	52
Misconduct in a professional respect	53
Conduct outwith professional practice	54
Expert witnesses	54
'Discreditable conduct'	55
The General Medical Council	56
Question of mixed law and fact	56
2 Breach of rules	56
3 Breach of principles	56
4 Criminal conduct	57
'An offence involving fraud'	57
'An offence of dishonesty'	57
'An offence of violence'	59
Double jeopardy	59
Estoppel	60
Foreign convictions	61
Proof of conviction	61
Certain orders not a conviction	61
Spent convictions	62
5 Bad work	63
Bad work as epithet misconduct	63
'Serious' bad work	64
Architects Registration Board	65

By what professional standard is bad work to be judged?	66
Bad work charged as such	66
Single incident and course of action	66
A single act of bad work	67
Course of conduct	67
Bad work and negligence: a summary	67
6 Insolvency	69
7 Conduct in public office	69
8 Fee complaints	70
Chapter 5	
The Role of Ethical Guides and Codes of Practice	71
1 What the Codes deal with	72
2 Ethical Codes and rules contrasted	72
The test for failure to comply	73
The scope of professional obligations	73
3 The effect of a 'have regard to' provision	73
Departure from codes	74
4 The effect of Codes upon civil liability	74
5 Restrictive practices	75
6 Conflicts of interest	75
<i>Bolkiah v KPMG</i>	75
Irreconcilable duties	78
Chinese walls	78
Chapter 6	
Commencing an Investigation	79
1 The reasons for an investigation	79
Complaints from clients and third parties	80
Complaints and reports from fellow members and competitors	80
Complaints from employees and whistle-blowers	80
Complaints arising from monitoring	83
Other reasons for investigation	84
2 The decision to investigate	84
Meritless complaints	84
Can a person under investigation challenge a decision to investigate?	85
3 Does the person under investigation have a right to know why it was instituted?	86
Anonymous complaints	86
4 The duty to report misconduct	86
5 Inter-regulatory disclosures	87
Mutual disclosure	88
No duty to notify other regulator	88
Disclosure of money laundering, etc	89
Disclosure authorised or required by statute	89
Disclosure by statutory encouragement	89
Disclosure by express consent	90
The need for clear drafting	90

6 Confidentiality and inter-regulatory disclosure	90
Statutory prohibition of confidential information	91
Confidentiality not absolute	91
Disclosure by express consent	91
Disclosure by implied consent	92
Disclosure to a regulator in the public interest	93
Disclosure of wrongful acts	93
Disclosure by a regulator	94
Disclosure for self-protection	95
The need for notice	95
Restricted use of confidential information	96
7 Tortious liability for information supplied to a regulator	97
Absolute privilege	97
Qualified privilege	97
When can information supplied to a regulator give grounds for an action for malicious prosecution?	98
Data protection	98
8 Publicising the commencement of an investigation	98
Chapter 7	
The Investigation	101
1 What legal constraints govern the conduct of an investigation?	101
Application of the European Convention to investigations by public authorities	102
The right to life: a special case?	103
What duty does the investigator owe to the subject of a disciplinary investigation?	103
Confidentiality	104
Entrapment	105
No duty to administer a caution	105
Provisional determination	106
The power to demand information	106
Inspection of computers and similar data collections	107
Demands for information by public authorities	107
Exceptions to the duty to cooperate: privilege and confidentiality	107
The problem of defamation	107
2 When should an investigation be deferred pending action by another regulator?	108
3 When must an investigation be deferred pending criminal proceedings?	109
Where deferment of disciplinary proceedings is justified pending criminal proceedings	110
Police	111
4 When should a disciplinary investigation be deferred pending civil proceedings?	111
Argument	112
The case law	113
' <i>Fayed</i> ' and the principle of prejudice	113

'Conteh' and the undesirability of concurrent proceedings	114
'Brindle'	115
<i>Ex parte Smith</i> ; <i>Brindle</i> distinguished	117
The principles in summary	118
5 Resignation to prevent disciplinary action	119
6 Documents created in the course of an investigation	120
Chapter 8	
The Decision to Prosecute	121
1 The decision to bring disciplinary proceedings	121
Who decides to bring disciplinary proceedings?	121
The decision to set up an investigation	122
The criteria for bringing disciplinary proceedings	122
Can the complainant challenge a decision not to bring disciplinary proceedings?	122
Investigator's decisions not normally subject to judicial review	123
Convention rights not engaged in decision to bring disciplinary proceedings	123
Review of rejection of complaint	123
2 Alternatives to a full disciplinary hearing	123
Informal rebukes	124
Consent orders	124
Compromising proceedings	125
Summary hearing	125
Measures not requiring an adverse finding	125
Dismissal from office as an alternative to disciplinary action	125
Chapter 9	
The Tribunal	127
1 The right to an independent tribunal	127
How can the independence of the tribunal be assured?	127
The assurance of lay (or public interest) membership	128
The assurance of independent appointment	129
The assurance of security of tenure	129
Can a lack of independence be cured by the appointment of a fresh tribunal?	130
Can a lack of independence in the tribunal of first instance be cured by a right of appeal to an ECHR conformable tribunal?	130
2 The right to an impartial tribunal	130
The common law right to an impartial tribunal	130
The fair-minded and informed observer	132
The Convention right to an impartial tribunal	133
Application to tribunals	135
The presumption of impartiality	135
Knowledge of the defendant	135
Disqualification for financial interest	136
Objection on grounds of religion, sex, etc	137
Representative interest	138

The problem of tribunal members having been involved in the investigation or the decision to bring proceedings	138
Prior involvement in an issue	139
The problem of disciplinary tribunal members who have been involved in separate proceedings against the accused	139
Involvement in the law or standard making process	139
The UK cases	140
The problem of informal contacts	140
Practical steps to avoid bias	141
Waiver	142
The problem of prejudicial pre-trial publicity	142
3 The right to a tribunal 'established by law'	142
'Established by law'	142
4 The composition of a disciplinary tribunal	144
The number of members on a tribunal	144
The chairman	144
Voting	144
The confidentiality of the retiring room	145
Transfer to a fresh tribunal	145
The need for training of non-lawyers	145
Interlocutory matters	145
Composition of tribunal after adjournment	145
5 The legal assessor	146
Legal assessor not analogous to judge	147
On what can the legal assessor advise?	147
The legal assessor and the preparation of findings	148
How should the legal assessor give his advice?	149
When may the legal assessor retire with the tribunal?	149
Questions by the legal assessor	150
A role model for a legal assessor	150
Bias on the part of the legal assessor	151
Security of tenure of legal advisers	152
6 Judicial protection of tribunals	152
Immunity from suit	153
Chapter 10	
Pre-trial Issues	155
1 Pre-trial hearings	155
Power of a tribunal to determine its jurisdiction	156
Pleadings and skeleton arguments	156
2 The charges	157
The common law duty to provide particulars	157
The Convention right to receive particulars	157
The adequacy of the particulars	158
Striking out	159
Change in particulars	159
The rule against duplicity	159
The trial of multiple charges	160