

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>xii</i>
<i>Abbreviations</i>	<i>xv</i>

I. Analytical Introduction **1**

1. Introduction	1
2. Scientific Background	4
2.1 Iran's Nuclear Fuel Cycle	5
2.1.1 Uranium Enrichment	5
2.1.2 Plutonium Production	6
2.2 Weaponization	7
3. The NPT Regime	8
3.1 Article IV.1: The Right to Develop Production of Nuclear Energy for Peaceful Purposes	8
3.2 Article II: The Non-Proliferation Commitment of NNWS	10
3.3 Article III.1: The IAEA Safeguards System	11
3.4 Article III.2: Export Controls	14
3.5 Compliance with the NPT	15
4. Referral of Iran's Dossier to the Security Council	16
4.1 Non-compliance under IAEA Statute Article XIIC	16
4.1.1 The Procedure for Determining Non-compliance	17
4.1.2 What Constitutes Non-compliance	17
4.1.3 Iran's Exculpatory Arguments	20
4.2 Peace and Security Concerns under IAEA Statute Article III.B.4	25
4.3 Inability to Verify under Safeguards Agreement Article 19	28
5. IAEA BOG Suspension of Privileges	29
6. The IAEA's Call for Suspension of Enrichment-related and Reprocessing Activities	30
7. Security Council Action	32
7.1 Legality of the Security Council's Demand for Suspension	32
7.2 Security Council Enforcement Measures	34
8. Unilateral Use of Force	36
9. Conclusion	39

II. Chronology **43**

III. Documents **81**

[Document numbers can be found in the top outside corner of each page]

International Agreements **1**

1. Multilateral Agreements	1
Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (NPT)	1
UN Charter	2

Statute of the IAEA	3
2. Agreements between Iran and the IAEA	4
Agreement between Iran and the International Atomic Energy Agency for the Application of Safeguards in Connection with the Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons	
Model Additional Protocol	5
Understanding of the Islamic Republic of Iran and the IAEA on the Modalities of Resolution of the Outstanding Issues, Tehran, 21 August 2007, 27 August 2007	
3. Agreements between the EU3/EU3+3 and Iran	7
Agreed Statement at the End of a Visit to the Islamic Republic of Iran by the Foreign Ministers of Britain, France and Germany, 21 October 2003 ('Tehran Statement')	
Agreement, Paris, 15 November 2004 ('Paris Agreement'), 26 November 2004	
Security Council Documents	9
1. Security Council Resolutions and Presidential Statements	9
Statement by the President of the Security Council, 29 March 2006	9
Security Council Resolution 1696(2006), 31 July 2006	10
Security Council Resolution 1737(2006), 23 December 2006	11
Security Council Resolution 1747(2007), 24 March 2007	12
Security Council Resolution 1803(2008), 3 March 2008	13
Security Council Resolution 1835(2008), 27 September 2008	14
2. Provisional Verbatim Records of the Security Council	15
Security Council Debate on Resolution 1696(2006), 31 July 2006	15
Security Council Debate on Resolution 1737(2006), 23 December 2006	16
Security Council Debate on Resolution 1747(2007), 24 March 2007	17
Security Council Debate on Resolution 1803(2008), 3 March 2008	18
Security Council Debate on Resolution 1835(2008), 27 September 2008	19
3. Reports of the 1737 Committee	20
Letter from the Chairman of the Security Council Committee Established Pursuant to Resolution 1737(2006) Addressed to the President of the Security Council, 31 December 2007	
Letter from the Chairman of the Security Council Committee Established Pursuant to Resolution 1737(2006) Addressed to the President of the Security Council, 31 December 2008	

1. Statements and Resolutions of the IAEA Board of Governors on Implementation of the NPT Safeguards Agreement in the Islamic Republic of Iran and Related Resolutions	22
Statement by the Board (issued by the Chair woman), 19 June 2003	22
Resolution GOV/2003/69, 12 September 2003	23
Resolution GOV/2003/81, 26 November 2003	24
Resolution GOV/2004/21, 13 March 2004	25
Resolution GOV/2004/49, 18 June 2004	26
Resolution GOV/2004/79, 18 September 2004	27
Resolution GOV/2004/90, 29 November 2004	28
Resolution GOV/2005/64, 11 August 2005	29
Resolution GOV/2005/77, 24 September 2005	30
Chair man's Conclusion, 24 November 2005	31
Resolution GOV/2006/14, 4 February 2006	32
2. Reports and Statements of the IAEA Director General on Implementation of the NPT Safeguards Agreement in the Islamic Republic of Iran and Relevant Provisions of Security Council Resolutions	33
GOV/2003/40, 6 June 2003	33
GOV/2003/63, 26 August 2003	34
GOV/2003/75, 10 November 2003	35
GOV/2004/11, 24 February 2004	36
GOV/2004/34, 1 June 2004 and GOV/2004/34 Cor r.1, 18 June 2004	37
GOV/2004/60, 1 September 2004	38
GOV/2004/83, 15 November 2004	39
GOV/2005/67, 2 September 2005	40
GOV/2005/87, 18 November 2005	41
GOV/2006/15, 27 February 2006	42
GOV/2006/27, 28 April 2006	43
GOV/2006/53, 31 August 2006	44
GOV/2006/64, 14 November 2006	45
GOV/2007/7, 9 February 2007	46
GOV/2007/8, 22 February 2007	47
GOV/2007/22, 23 May 2007	48
GOV/2007/48, 30 August 2007 and GOV/2007/48 Cor r.1, 7 September 2007	49
GOV/2007/58, 15 November 2007	50
GOV/2008/4, 22 February 2008	51
GOV/2008/15, 26 May 2008	52
GOV/2008/38, 15 September 2008	53
GOV/2008/59, 19 November 2008	54

GOV/2009/8, 19 February 2009	55
GOV/2009/35, 5 June 2009	56
GOV/2009/55, 28 August 2009	57
3. Official Records of the IAEA Board of Governors' Meetings on Implementation of the NPT Safeguards Agreement in the Islamic Republic of Iran	58
Consideration of GOV/2003/40, 18 June 2003	58
Consideration of GOV/2003/40, 18 June 2003	59
Consideration of GOV/2003/40 (continued), 19 June 2003	60
Consideration of GOV/2003/63, 9 September 2003	61
Consideration of GOV/2003/63 (continued), 9 September 2003	62
Consideration of GOV/2003/63, 68 and Add.1, 12 September 2003	63
Consideration of GOV/2003/75, 21 November 2003	64
Consideration of GOV/2003/75 (continued), 21 November 2003	65
Consideration of GOV/2003/75 and 80, 26 November 2003	66
Introductory Statement by the Director General, 8 March 2004	67
Consideration of GOV/2004/11 and 20, 13 March 2004	68
Consideration of GOV/2004/34 and Corr.1, GOV/2004/42, 18 June 2004	69
Consideration of GOV/2004/34 and Corr.1, GOV/2004/49, 18 June 2004	70
Consideration of GOV/2004/60, GOV/2004/75 Rev.1, GOV/2004/77 and GOV/2004/78, 18 September 2004	71
Consideration of GOV/2004/83 and 89, 29 November 2004	72
GOV/OR.1120, 2 March 2005	73
GOV/OR.1130, 16 June 2005	74
Consideration of GOV/2005/60, 61, 62, 63 and Rev.1; INFCIRC/648, 649 and 651, 75 11 August 2005	75
Consideration of GOV/2005/67, 21 September 2005	76
Consideration of GOV/2005/67, 22 September 2005	77
Consideration of GOV/2005/76, 24 September 2005	78
Consideration of GOV/2005/87, 24 November 2005	79
Consideration of GOV/2005/87 (continued), 24 November 2005	80
GOV/OR.1147, 25 November 2005	81
Consideration of GOV/2006/11 and 12, GOV/INF/2006/1 and 2, INFCIRC/662 and 665, 2 February 2006	82
Consideration of GOV/2006/11 and 12, GOV/INF/2006/1 and 2, INFCIRC/662 and 665, 2 February 2006	83
Consideration of GOV/2006/12/Rev.1, 4 February 2006	84
Consideration of GOV/2006/15, 8 March 2006	85
Consideration of GOV/2006/15 (Continued), 8 May 2006	86
Consideration of GOV/2006/27 and 38, 15 June 2006	87
Consideration of GOV/2006/53 (continued), 14 September 2006	88

Technical Assistance and Cooperation Committee: The Agency's Proposed Programme for 2007-2008, 20 November 2006	89
Technical Assistance and Cooperation Committee: The Agency's Proposed Programme for 2007-2008, 21 November 2006	90
Technical Assistance and Cooperation Committee: The Agency's Proposed Programme for 2007-2008, (GOV/2006/59/Rev.1, Add.1, and Add.1/Corr.1), 22 November 2006	90
Report of the Technical Assistance and Cooperation Committee on its Meetings Held from 20 to 22 November 2006, 22 November 2006	92
GOV/OR.1173, 23 November 2006	93
Consideration of GOV/2006/64 (Continued), 23 November 2006	94
Iranian Statements and Proposals	95
Statement by Iran, IAEA 38th General Conference, 20 September 1994	95
Statement by Iran, 1995 Review and Extension Conference of the Parties to the NPT, 18 April 1995	96
Statement by Iran, ICJ Oral Proceedings <i>Legality of the Use by a State of Nuclear Weapons in Armed Conflict</i> (Request for Advisory Opinion Submitted by the World Health Organization) and <i>Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons</i> (Request for Advisory Opinion Submitted by the General Assembly of the United Nations), 6 November 1995	97
Statement by Iran, UN General Assembly, Report of the International Atomic Energy Agency, 28 October 1996	98
Letter Dated 4 February 2002 from the Permanent Representative of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the United Nations Addressed to the Secretary-General, 4 February 2002	99
Statement by Iran, IAEA 40th General Conference, 16 September 2002	100
Statement by Iran, UN General Assembly, General Debate, 25 September 2003	100
Statement by Iran, UN General Assembly, Report of the International Atomic Energy Agency, 3 November 2003	101
Proposal by Iran, Presented to Political and Security Working Group, Geneva, 17 January 2005	103
Elements of Objective Guarantees, Presented in the Meeting of Steering Committee, Paris, 23 March 2005	104
Proposal Presented to the Meeting of the Steering Committee, London, 29 April 2005	105
Statement by Iran's Minister of Foreign Affairs to the Seventh NPT Review Conference, New York, 3 May 2005	106
Communication Dated 1 August 2005 Received from the Permanent Mission of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the Agency, 1 August 2005	107
Response of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the Framework Agreement Proposed by EU3/EU (Undated)	108

Communication Dated 12 September 2005 from the Permanent Mission of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the Agency, 'Iranian Nuclear Policy and Activities – Complementary Information of the Report of the Director General (GOV/2005/67)', 15 September 2005	
Address by Iran's President, UN General Assembly, 17 September 2005	110
Communication Dated 4 November 2005 Received from the Permanent Mission of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the Agency	
Message of HE. Dr. Larijani, the Secretary of Supreme Security Council of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the Director General of the IAEA dated February 2, 2006	
Communication Dated 7 March 2006 Received from the Permanent Mission of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the Agency, 'Complementary Information and Clarification Provided by the Islamic Republic of Iran on the Report of the Director General to the Board of Governors on Implementation of Safeguards in the Islamic Republic of Iran' (GOV/2006/15)	
Response Dated 22 August 2006 of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the Package Presented on 6 June 2006	
Statement by Iran, IAEA 50th General Conference, 50th Session, 18 September 2006	
Statement by Iran, First Session of the Preparatory Committee for the 12610 NPT Review Conference, 1 May 2007	
Statement by Iran, UN General Assembly, General Debate, 25 September 2007	
Identical Letters Dated 22 February 2008 from the Permanent Representative of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the United Nations Addressed to the Secretary-General and the President of the Security Council	
Letter Dated 24 March 2008 from the Permanent Representative of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the United Nations Addressed to the Secretary-General	
Iran's Proposed Package for Constructive Negotiations, 13 May 2008	120
Letter Dated 6 June 2008 from the Permanent Representative of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the United Nations Addressed to the President of the Security Council, 10 June 2008	
Iran's Proposal to EU3+3, 5 July 2008	122
Iran's Response to the EU3+3 Proposal of 12 June, 5 August 2008	123
Communication Dated 28 September 2008 Received from the Permanent Mission of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the Agency, 1 October 2008	
Communication Dated 4 September 2009 Received from the Resident Representative of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the Agency Regarding the Implementation of Safeguards in Iran	
Statements and Proposals by the EU3+3	126
1. The EU3/EU3+3 Acting Jointly	126
Framework for a Long-term Agreement between the Islamic Republic of Iran and France, Germany & the United Kingdom, with the Support of the High Representative of the European Union, 5 August 2005	

Op-ed in the Wall Street Journal, 'Iran's Nuclear Policy Requires Collective Response', by Philippe Douste-Blazy, Joschka Fischer, Javier Solana and Jack Straw (EU3 Foreign Ministers), 22 September 2005	127
Statement by Germany, United Kingdom, France and the EU High Representative on the Iranian Nuclear Issue, Berlin, 12 January 2006	128
Statement Following Iran Meeting, London, 30 January 2006	129
EU Letter Dated 27 February 2006 to the Secretary of the Supreme Council of National Security of Iran, 2 March 2006	130
Elements of a Long-term Agreement, 6 June 2006	131
Press Statement by P. Douste-Blazy on Behalf of the Foreign Ministers of China, France, Germany, the Russian Federation, the United Kingdom, the United States of America and the High Representative of the European Union, Paris, 12 July 2006	132
Letter and Offer of 12 June 2008 Delivered to the Islamic Republic of Iran	133
EU3+3 Statement on the Iran Nuclear Program, 4 March 2009	134
Statement Following EU3+3 Political Directors' Meeting, London, 8 April 2009	135
2. Statements by the United States	136
Statement by Secretary of State Condoleezza Rice, US Support for the EU3, 11 March 2005	136
US Statement, 2005 NPT Review Conference, 19 May 2005	137
National Intelligence Estimate, Iran: Nuclear Intentions and Capabilities, US National Intelligence Council, November 2007	138
US Statement, 2010 Review Conference Pre-Com, 8 May 20209	139
Remarks by President Barack Obama on a New Beginning, Cairo, Egypt, 4 June 2009	140
3. Statements by the Russian Federation	141
Statement by the Russian Federation, UN General Assembly, Report of the International Atomic Energy Agency, 3 November 2003	141
Statement by the Russian Federation, UN General Assembly, Report of the International Atomic Energy Agency, 1 November 2004	142
Statement by the Russian Federation, UN General Assembly, Report of the International Atomic Energy Agency, 31 October 2005	143
4. Statements by China	144
Statement by China, UN General Assembly, Report of the International Atomic Energy Agency, 1 November 2004	144
Statement by China, UN General Assembly, Report of the International Atomic Energy Agency, 30 October 2006	145
Statements by International Organisations	146
1. Statements by the Non-Alignment Movement	146
Fourteenth Summit Conference of Heads of State or Government of the Non-Aligned Movement, Havana, Statement on the Islamic Republic of Iran's Nuclear Issue, 15-16 September 2006	146

Fifteenth Ministerial Conference of the Non-Aligned Movement, Tehran Statement on the Islamic Republic of Iran's Nuclear Issue, 27-30 July 2008	145
2. Statement by the Organisation of Islamic Conference	148
Resolution No. 9/11-P (IS) on Cooperation by the Islamic Republic of Iran with IAEA, 14 March 2008	148
3. Statements by the G7/G8	149
G7 Summit 1995 Halifax, Chairman's Statement, 17 June 1995	149
G8 Summit 2000 Okinawa, Conclusions of the meeting of the G8 Foreign Ministers' Meeting, Miyazaki, Japan, 13 July 2000	150
G8 Summit 2003 Evian, Non Proliferation of Weapons of Mass Destruction Declaration, 3 June 2003	151
G8 Summit 2007 Heiligendamm, Chair's Summary, Heiligendamm, 8 June 2007	152
G8 Summit 2008 Hokkaido Toyako, Summit Leaders Declaration, Hokkaido Toyako, 8 July 2008	153
G8 Summit 2009, L'Aquila, Statement on Political Issues, 8 July 2009	154
4. Conclusions of the Council of the EU	155
EU Council Conclusions, 17 June 2002	155
EU Council Conclusions, 16 June 2003	156
EU Presidency Conclusions, 16/17 October 2003	157
EU Council Conclusions, 13 December 2004	158
EU Council Conclusions, 18 June 2007	159
EU Council Conclusions, 27 April 2009	160
5. Statement by the European Commission	161
Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council, EU Relations with the Islamic Republic of Iran, 7 February 2001	161
Selected Bibliography	513
Index	519

PREFACE

This book is concerned with legal aspects of the Iranian nuclear dispute. It does not deal directly with the question whether Iran is carrying out a military nuclear programme and what its intentions are. This is not for lack of material; indeed there is vast literature on these questions. However, at the time of writing, whether Iran is pursuing non-peaceful objectives remains a matter for assessment rather than established fact. The legal problem with which this book is concerned, is driven and governed by this factual uncertainty.

The Iranian nuclear dispute raises questions from a variety of legal spheres: the law relating to non-proliferation, treaty interpretation in general and the interpretation of the Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (NPT) in particular, the law of international organizations, most notably of the UN Security Council, international responsibility of states, use of force (*ius ad bellum*) in general and specifically with regard to weapons of mass destruction, and more. The analysis addresses these areas of law as they relate to the treatment of the Iranian dossier in the International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA) and its referral to the Security Council. It is built upon issues that at least at the time of writing are still in the realm of the speculative, such as use of force against Iran.

The purpose of the analysis is to present the legal questions that have arisen and refer them to the documents included in the compilation. As a roadmap for readers wishing to make use of the primary sources, it does not purport to present its own position on the correct application of the law, but rather to delineate the parameters which inform the debate.

The documents are organised according to international players, and within each category of players, chronologically. Each document is allocated a unique number in the table of contents and thereafter navigation within the book is by document number, not page number. References to documents in the footnotes and subject index also use the document number, which can be found at the top outside corner of each page and next to each document's title.

In preparing the compilation I benefited from the kind assistance of the Media and Outreach Section of the IAEA. The Feinberg Fund of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem generously funded the research. Many people offered me their insights and counsel including Dr. Hans Blix, Dr. Daniel Joyner and Dr. Eitan Barak, as well as Prof. Moshe Hirsch, Dr. Emily Landau, Dr. Robbie Sabel, Prof. Yuval Shany and Prof. Stefan Talmon. Moria Cohen and Akiva Miller also assisted in bringing the manuscript to print. Last but not least, Richard Hart and the Hart Publishing team have been patient and helpful throughout the project. I am grateful to them all.

The manuscript was signed on 15 September 2009.

Yaël Ronen
Jerusalem, September 2009