

---

## CONTENTS

---

<i>Foreword</i>	v
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xiii
<i>Table of Legislation and International Instruments</i>	xxv
Introduction	1
1 Concepts, Labels and Limitations	5
A Introduction	5
B Retroactivity	6
C Retrospectivity	9
D Confusing Usage	12
E Problematic Usage	13
1 Waldron on Criminal Sentencing	13
2 Fuller on Tax Liability	16
F The Scope of this Book	17
G Illustrations of Conceptual Distinctions	17
1 Cases Relating to Contractual Rights	18
2 Cases Relating to Personal Status	21
H Conclusion	25
2 Historical Review	27
A Introduction	27
B General History and Statutory Construction	27
C Adjudicative Retroactivity	35
D Conclusion	42
3 Rationales for a General Presumption Against Retroactivity	43
A Introduction	43
B Certainty	44
1 The Meaning of Certainty	44
2 Certainty and Reliance	44
(a) The Case for Actual Reliance	44
(b) Evaluation of the Role of Actual Reliance	45
(c) Certainty and the Ability to Rely on the Law	47
3 Certainty and Autonomy	48

x Contents

C Negative Liberty	50
1 Negative Liberty Generally	50
2 Deprivation of Security Relating to Past Events	50
3 Removal of an Actual Freedom	51
4 Negative Liberty and Criminal Law	52
(a) Nullum Crimen Sine Lege Antea Exstanti	52
(b) Nulla Poena Sine Lege Antea Exstanti	52
D Fair Warning	57
E Defeasibility	60
1 Introduction to Defeasibility	60
2 A General Principle of Fairness	61
3 Where Uncertainty is Inevitable	62
4 The Exceptional Nature of Retroactivity	63
F Conclusion	65
4 The Presumption Against Retroactivity in Statutory Construction	67
A Introduction	67
B The Nature of the Presumption Against Retroactivity	68
C Applications of the Presumption Against Retroactivity	71
D Fairness as a Determinant of the Applicability of the Presumption	76
E A Presumption of Variable Strength?	79
F Rebuttal of the Presumption Against Retroactivity	80
1 Express Words or Necessary Intendment	80
2 Validating Statutes	81
3 Importance of Subject Matter	86
G Detailed Studies	91
1 The Intertemporal Effect of the Human Rights Act 1998 (UK)	91
(a) Was Retroactivity in Issue?	91
(b) Treatment of the Presumption Against Retroactivity	93
(c) Applicability of the Presumption Against Retroactivity	94
(d) Fairness and a Presumption of Variable Strength	96
(e) Statutory Language	101
2 Retroactive Sentencing	102
(a) Article 7 of the ECHR and the Common Law Presumption Against Retroactivity	102
(b) The Common Law Presumption Against Retroactive Sentencing	112
(c) Retroactive Changes in Favour of the Defendant	115
H Conclusion	118
5 Adjudicative Retroactivity	119
A Introductory Matters	119
1 What is Adjudicative Retroactivity?	119
2 The Declaratory Theory	119
3 The Scope of this Chapter	121

Contents xi

B	The Doctrine Of Precedent and Judicial Attachment to Existing Principle in Novel Cases	125
C	The Marital Rape Cases	127
1	Outline of the Facts, Decisions and Issues	127
2	Foreseeability of Legal Change	130
3	Heinous Conduct	133
4	Changed Status of Women	136
5	An Illogical Immunity	136
6	Conclusions on the Marital Rape Cases	137
D	Restitution of Money Paid under a Mistake of Law	138
1	The Facts and Issues in <i>Kleinwort Benson v Lincoln County Council</i>	138
2	Reasons for Retroactivity	142
E	Private Law	143
1	The Creation of New Law without Overruling Prior Authority	144
(a)	Existing Authorities in Disarray Making a Degree of Retroactivity Inevitable	144
(b)	Ability to Rely on the Law not in Issue	145
(c)	Gradual Development of New Law	146
(d)	Moral Obloquy	150
(e)	Use of Obiter Dicta to Signal a Change in the Law	151
2	The Creation of New Law by Overruling a Prior Authority	153
(a)	Ability to Rely on the Law not in Issue	153
(b)	Prior Authority Wrong in Principle	154
(c)	Response to Changed Legal Circumstances	159
(d)	Response to Changed Factual Circumstances	161
(e)	Absence of Effect on Litigants before the Court	163
(f)	Refusal to Overrule a Decision because of Potential Retroactive Effects	165
3	Overruling a Prior Judicial Interpretation of a Statute	166
4	Conclusions on Private Law	171
F	Public Law	172
1	The Creation of New Law without Overruling Prior Authority	172
2	The Creation of New Law by Overruling Prior Authority	175
(a)	Judicial Review of Questions of Law	175
(b)	Judicial Review of Questions of Fact	177
3	Overruling a Prior Judicial Interpretation of a Statute	178
4	Conclusions on Public Law	182
G	Criminal Law	183
1	The Creation of New Law without Overruling Prior Authority	184
(a)	Judicial Response to New Factual Circumstances	184
(b)	Perceived Immorality	185
2	The Creation of New Law by Overruling Prior Authority	189
(a)	Prior Authority Wrong in Principle	189
(b)	Retroactivity in Favour of a Defendant	192

xii *Contents*

3	Overruling a Prior Judicial Interpretation of a Statute	193
4	Conclusions on Criminal Law	196
H	Overruling and the Age of a Decision	197
6	Prospective Overruling	199
A	What is Prospective Overruling?	199
B	The Status Quo	200
1	England	200
2	Australia	204
3	New Zealand	205
4	Canada	205
C	Evaluation of Prospective Overruling	209
1	Inconsistency with the Proper Scope of the Judicial Function in Common Law Systems	209
2	Arbitrariness	212
3	Prospective Overruling of Decisions about Statutory and Constitutional Construction	214
D	Conclusion	215
7	Conclusions	219
A	Foundations	219
B	Comparison of Cases of Statutory and Adjudicative Retroactivity	220
C	Approaching Rebuttal of the Presumption	223
D	Legislative and Judicial Processes	224
E	Final Observations	225
	<i>Bibliography</i>	227
	<i>Index</i>	233

<http://www.lawbookshop.com>