

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>Table of Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxiii
<i>Introduction</i>	xxvii

Part 1: Historical Perspectives on Union Recognition and the Law

1 Reappraising Kahn-Freund: The Coherence of Collective Laissez-Faire	3
I INTRODUCTION	3
II CLF AND ITS CRITICS	3
III CLF AND THE 'PLURALISTIC CONSTITUTION'	7
A Introduction	7
B Collective Bargaining as Industrial Democracy: The Influence of American Political Pluralism	8
C The State and Collective Bargaining: The Influence of English Political Pluralism	9
(i) Sovereignty and Pluralism	11
(ii) The Real Personality of Groups and Pluralism	13
IV CLF DEFENDED: THREE CRITIQUES OF CLF	15
A The Abstentionist Critique	15
B The Neutrality Critique	20
C The Coherence Critique	26
(i) The Legal Duty to Bargain I: The Pragmatic Objection to Direct Auxiliary Support	27
(ii) The Legal Duty to Bargain II: The Normative Argument against Direct Auxiliary Support	29
V CONCLUSION	33
2 The Rise of the Legal Duty to Bargain: The Resilience of Collective Laissez-Faire	35
I INTRODUCTION	35
II TWO CONCEPTIONS OF INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS PLURALISM: PLURALIST AND CIVIC VOLUNTARISM, AND THE DONOVAN COMMISSION REPORT	39
A Flanders, Clegg and the 'Oxford School' of Industrial Relations	39

x Contents

B	Flanders' Evidence to the Donovan Commission: The Proposal for Direct Auxiliary Support	42
C	Pluralist and Civic Voluntarism within the Donovan Commission	43
(i)	Criteria of Union Representativity: The Determination of Bargaining Agents	45
(ii)	The Regulation of the Collective Bargaining Process	46
III	THREE EXPERIMENTS IN DIRECT AUXILIARY INTERVENTION: THE ECLIPSE OF CLF?	50
A	The Legal Duty to Bargain I: The Commission on Industrial Relations 1969–1971	50
(i)	Bargaining Units and Bargaining Agents: The Eclipse of Group Autonomy?	51
(ii)	The Legal Duty to Bargain: The Resilience of Group Autonomy?	52
B	The Legal Duty to Bargain II: The Industrial Relations Act 1971 and CIR II	55
(i)	Bargaining Units and Bargaining Agents: State Neutrality or State Partiality?	57
(a)	Legislative Ideology and Governmental Neutrality	58
(b)	CIR II and State Partiality	60
(ii)	The Legal Duty to Bargain: The Resilience of Group Autonomy?	63
C	The Legal Duty to Bargain III: ACAS and the 'Social Contract' Era	65
(i)	Bargaining Units and Bargaining Agents: The Eclipse of Group Autonomy?	66
(a)	ACAS and the Civic Approach to Allocating Bargaining Rights	67
(b)	The Courts and the Liberal Approach to Allocating Bargaining Rights	68
(ii)	The Legal Duty to Bargain: The Resilience of Group Autonomy?	72
IV	CONCLUSION	75

Part 2: Two Conceptions of Third Way Labour Law: Liberals and Civic Republicans

3	The Third Way and Liberal Labour Law	79
I	INTRODUCTION	79
II	NEW LABOUR'S APPROACH TO COLLECTIVE LABOUR LAW: NEO-LIBERAL OR LIBERAL?	80
A	Varieties of Liberalism	82
B	The Role of Incompletely Theorised Agreements	84

(i)	Incompletely Theorised Agreements I: The Case of the Closed Shop	85
(ii)	Incompletely Theorised Agreements II: The Case of Internal Union Democracy	87
C	The Impossibility of Incompletely Theorised Agreement: The Case of Trade Union Recognition	89
III	NEW LABOUR'S LIBERALISM AND THE CIVIC REPUBLICAN CRITIQUE	90
IV	LIBERALISM, COMMUNITY AND LABOUR LAW: THREE LIBERAL POSITIONS	93
A	Liberal Neutrality: The State, Trade Unions and the Cultural Marketplace	93
(i)	Evaluating the Cultural Marketplace I: The Problem of Deliberative Distortion	96
(ii)	Evaluating the Cultural Marketplace II: Choosing the Time and Place of Organisational Activity	99
B	Beyond Liberal Neutrality: The State, Trade Unions and Liberal Justice	101
C	Beyond Liberal Neutrality: Autonomy, Community and Perfectionist Liberalism	107
(i)	Perfectionist Liberalism and the Compulsory Normative Effect of Collective Agreements	109
(ii)	Perfectionist Liberalism and the Problem of Union Discipline of Individual Dissenters	113
V	CONCLUSION	114
4	The Third Way and Republican Labour Law	117
I	INTRODUCTION	117
II	THE GOOD OF COMMUNITY	119
A	Community in Civic Republican Thought	119
B	Freedom of Association and Civic Community	123
(i)	Civic Community and the Closed Shop	123
(ii)	Civic Community and the Trade Unionist Conscientious Objector	125
(iii)	Civic Community and Secondary Industrial Action	127
(iv)	Civic Community and the Right to Organise	128
III	THE GOOD OF COLLECTIVE SELF-GOVERNMENT	130
A	Freedom as Collective Self-Government as a Political Ideal	130
B	Freedom as Collective Self-Government and Collective Bargaining	132
(i)	Pluralist and Deliberative Democracy: Allocating Bargaining Rights	134
(ii)	Pluralist and Deliberative Democracy: The Duty to Bargain	137

xii *Contents*

(a)	The Legal Duty to Bargain: Passive or Active?	138
(b)	Bargaining Structure: The Perils of Excessive Decentralisation	139
(c)	Towards a Civic Bargaining Agenda?	141
IV	THE GOOD OF NON-DOMINATION	144
A	Non-Domination as a Political Ideal	144
B	Non-Domination as a Labour Law Ideal	146
C	Freedom as Non-Domination in the Workplace: Welfare Capitalism or Collective Bargaining?	147
D	The Civic Limitations of New Labour's Conception of 'Social Partnership'	150
(i)	The Civic Limitations of Consultation	150
(ii)	The Civic Limitations of Voluntary Recognition: The Need for a Company Union Ban	151
V	CONCLUSION	154

Part 3: Evaluating the Schedule A1 Recognising Procedure

5	The Political Theory of Union Recognition Campaigns I: Liberal Neutrality and the Cultural Marketplace	159
I	INTRODUCTION	159
II	REGULATING THE CULTURAL MARKETPLACE I: THE PROBLEM OF UNFAIR PRACTICES	161
A	The North American Model of 'Unfair Labor Practices'	161
B	Unfair Practices and Ballot Regulation under Schedule A1	164
(i)	ERA 2004 and the Unfair Practice Regime	166
(a)	Problems of Definition	166
(b)	Problems of Interpretation	168
(ii)	The CAC's General Supervisory Jurisdiction over the Ballot Procedure	173
(iii)	Minimising Legal Delay: Regulatory and Reconstructive Conceptions of Statutory Recognition	175
(a)	Paragraph 22(4)(c)	177
(b)	Paragraph 22(4)(b)	178
(c)	Paragraph 22(4)(a)	183
III	REGULATING THE CULTURAL MARKETPLACE II: ENSURING EQUAL CAMPAIGN OPPORTUNITIES	186
A	The Sanctity of Private Property in the US Recognition Procedure	186
(i)	The Right to Private Property: Realism and Neutrality	188
(ii)	The Union's Right to Organise	191
B	Employer Property Rights and Union Organisational Access under Schedule A1	193
IV	CONCLUSION	197

6 The Political Theory of Union Recognition Campaigns II: The Problem of Adaptive Preferences	201
I INTRODUCTION	201
II MODELS OF POLITICAL AND INDUSTRIAL DEMOCRACY: DEMOCRACY AS PREFERENCE AGGREGATION AND THE PROBLEM OF DISTORTED PREFERENCES	202
A Adaptive Preferences and Collective Bargaining	203
B Endowment Effects and Collective Bargaining	205
III FIVE CIVIC STRATEGIES FOR COUNTERING DISTORTED PREFERENCES	208
A CAC Interpretation of Admissibility Thresholds	209
(i) Union Membership and Support for Recognition: What is the Relationship?	210
(ii) Adaptive and Non-Adaptive Conceptions of Preference Formation	212
(a) Non-Adaptive Preferences: Narrowing the Time Frame	213
(b) Adaptive Preferences: Broadening the Time Frame	214
B Preference Shaping through Deliberative Democracy	219
C Shifting Default Arrangements through Voluntary Recognition	223
D Shifting the Default Position through Staged Recognition	227
(i) The Dilemma of Union Substitution	228
(ii) The Dilemma of Union Instrumentality	233
E The Right to Organise	235
(i) Legal Constraints: Union Activists and Confrontational Tactics	236
(ii) Legal Support: The Case of Bargaining Unit Determination	239
IV CONCLUSION	244
7 The Political Theory of Collective Bargaining: Pluralism, Deliberation and the Duty to Bargain	245
I INTRODUCTION	245
II TWO CONCEPTIONS OF POLITICS: PLURALIST AND DELIBERATIVE DEMOCRACY	245
III A DELIBERATIVE CONSTITUTION OF INDUSTRIAL DEMOCRACY: DELIBERATION DEFENDED	249
A Consensus and Disagreement: Unitary or Pluralist?	251
B Real Politics is about Interests and Power—Deliberation is a Sanitising Distraction	253
C A Deliberative Conception of the Right to Strike	255

xiv *Contents*

IV	THE US DUTY TO BARGAIN IN GOOD FAITH: PLURALIST OR DELIBERATIVE?	257
A	Good Faith Bargaining: The Ascendancy of Pluralist Politics	258
B	Subjects of Bargaining: The Mandatory/Permissive Distinction in the Duty to Bargain	263
	(i) Challenging 'Status Quo' Neutrality	266
	(ii) The Intrinsic Value of Deliberation	267
C	The Demands of Political Equality: Bolstering the Right to Strike	269
V	THE DUTY TO BARGAIN IN BRITISH LABOUR LAW: PLURALISM, DELIBERATION AND SOCIAL PARTNERSHIP	272
A	The Primacy of Voluntary Practices: Undermining Deliberative Democracy	273
	(i) The Nature of Voluntary Collective Bargaining	274
	(ii) The Priority of Subsisting Voluntary Recognition Arrangements	276
B	The Statutory Duty to Bargain: Pluralist or Deliberative?	277
	(i) The Legal Duty to Bargain I: Scope	278
	(ii) The Legal Duty to Bargain II: Procedural Nature	280
VI	CONCLUSION: COLLECTIVE BARGAINING IN THE DELIBERATIVE IMAGE	282
A	Constructive Mediation	282
B	Expanding the Bargaining Agenda	283
C	Expanding the Employer's Informational Duties	284
D	A Deliberative Conception of the Right to Strike	285
E	National and Sectoral Bargaining Structures	286
F	An Active Duty to Bargain?	287
	<i>Index</i>	289