Foreword

Harold Hongju Koh

Until recently, the juxtaposition of domestic violence and international law would seem an oxymoron. For by its nature, violence that is ‘domestic’ would seem, by definition, to stand outside the scrutiny of ‘international law’. For generations, domestic violence has lived beyond the shadows not just of international law, but of all law. Banished from international law’s gaze, and too often treated as an immutable face of particular cultures, domestic violence has too often been typecast as a ‘soft’ social issue that must take a back seat to other, ‘more pressing’ economic and political issues.

Today, this is finally changing. Increasingly, governments, courts and policymakers are recognising systemic forms of domestic violence as an important international problem. Not only does domestic violence shatter lives and homes, it carries with it tangible and damaging economic and communal consequences. Over the last decade, various parts of the United Nations, including the Office of the Secretary-General, the Special Rapporteur on torture and the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, have turned their attention to systemic forms of domestic violence, finally recognising it for what it is: one of the most pervasive and pressing human rights concerns faced by the international community. Following the call of non-governmental organisations and community representatives, the world is finally taking note that just because some violence begins at home, that does not mean that it lacks global consequences.

Until now, no single volume has captured the arguments that view systemic domestic violence through an international law lens. There are no existing studies arguing for the internationalisation of extreme and systemic forms of domestic violence in a way that so comprehensively addresses both academic and practical needs. Domestic Violence and International Law fills that gap, by providing an original, provocative and much needed legal framework for the coherent development of a norm prohibiting systemic forms of domestic violence in international human rights law.

I have known the author, Dr Bonita Meyersfeld, for many years as a talented human rights lawyer, dedicated academic, and shrewd political policy adviser. Whilst gaining human rights expertise in many fields, Dr Meyersfeld has developed a thoroughgoing analysis that asks and addresses the most difficult questions often neglected by academics, lawyers and activists who dismiss the...
This book advances the frontiers of academic and political thought on this important intellectual debate. It analyses the current position and history of international law regarding the practice of systemic forms of domestic violence, investigates what an emerging norm against that practice might look like, explores how meaningful reform could be achieved, and explains why the problem of domestic violence would benefit from articulation of clearer rules of international law.

Domestic Violence and International Law breaks new ground and will surely provide a valuable resource for lawyers, judges and policymakers for many years to come. Dr Meyersfeld creatively reformulates academic and political debate on domestic violence to focus upon the responsibility of states under international law to protect citizens from certain extreme forms of what she dubs ‘systemic intimate violence’. Dr Meyersfeld focuses her attention in this book on violence perpetrated by men against women. But her analysis transcends this focus, and offers a useful and important blueprint for possible development of international law principles applicable to state responsibility for all forms of systemic intimate violence committed by private persons.

This book offers lawyers the legal arguments necessary to galvanise change, whether in international, regional or national courts. Judges can find in these pages balanced guidance on the jurisprudence in the field and considerations to guide their decisions. And policymakers at the national, regional and international levels will find tools and standards necessary to enhance protections for victims and survivors of domestic violence.

Most fundamentally, this book is memorable for the hope and optimism it expresses about the transformative possibilities of international law. Without compromising such intensely human values as privacy, autonomy and cultural identity, Dr Meyersfeld moves her reader with an abiding conviction: that international law, buoyed by the power of transnational actors, can propel public actors to protect abused and vulnerable people in their most private worlds.
Acknowledgement

This book has its source in the pain and fear of countless people who have endured the terrible shock of violence. It also has its source in the intellectual, ideological and emotional fortitude of many people, for whose encouragement and love, I thank you.

My deepest gratitude to Professor Harold Hongju Koh of Yale Law School, whose commitment to the vulnerable and whose consistent intellectual acumen have been driving forces behind this book. Thank you to Professors Michael Reisman, Judith Resnik and Jim Silk for your guidance and dedication to the completion of this project, and to the librarians at Yale Law School, who sourced a great deal of the material on which I have relied. Thank you too to Irum Khan-Lodhi for her selfless and excellent research assistance.

I am indebted to the reviewers and the staff at Hart Publishing, who contributed to the creation of this book. In particular, Ruth Massey has refined and edited this book with patience, skill and unfaltering attention to detail.

To my family who are my friends and my friends who are my family—and my parents (natural, in-laws and adopted)—thank you for your endless support.

There are two people who have been at the heart of this book and to whom this book is dedicated. To my mother Sandra Du Trevou, you are my hero and inspiration in all I do. Thank you. To my husband Charles Young, thank you for reading, re-reading, questioning, editing and dissecting this book. Thank you for enduring this process and making me as happy as you do.
Contents

Foreword v
Acknowledgement ix
Table of Cases xv
Table of International and Regional Instruments xxii
Table of National Legislation xxix
Introduction xxxi

1 Domestic Violence as a Violation of International Human Rights Law 1

Introduction 1
Sources of International Law 3
Complexities of Customary International Law 7

The Elements of Customary International Law 7
Traditional Theories of Customary International Law 10
Contemporary Theories of Customary International Law 11

Applying Customary International Law to Domestic Violence 13

Traditional Theories of Customary International Law 13
Contemporary Theories of Customary International Law 14

Is there an Emerging Norm Prohibiting Domestic Violence? 15
Women’s Rights in International Law—Historical Overview 16
Violence against Women in International Law—Historical Overview 18
Domestic Violence in International Law—Historical Overview and Status Quo: 1946–2000 24

1946: Commission on the Status of Women 24
1979: CEDAW 26
1979: CEDAW Committee 29
1985: UN Resolution 30
1990: UN Resolution 32
1992: CEDAW Committee General Recommendation 19 34
1994: DEVAW 37
1995: Beijing Platform for Action 39

Domestic Violence in International Law—Historical Overview and Status Quo: 2000–09 41

2000: The CEDAW Optional Protocol 41
2000: UN General Comment No 28 58
2004: General Assembly Resolution on the Elimination of Domestic Violence against Women 60
Contents

1994–2009: Reports of the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, its causes and consequences 62
2005–06: Resolutions and Action by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights 67
2004–09: Further General Assembly Resolutions 69
2006–08: Work of the Secretary-General 74
2000–09: Work of the Treaty Monitoring Bodies 77
The Approach of Regional Human Rights Law and Bodies to Domestic Violence 79
Inter-American System 79
European System 82
African System 89
Specification of Certain Forms of Violence against Women in International Law 91
Mass Rape 92
Female Genital Cutting 95
Trafficking 97
The Writings of Respected Authors and Scholars 98
The Distinction between Public and Private 100
The State’s Role 102
Cultural Relativism 103
Discrimination and Violence 105
Conclusion 106

2 Freedom from Systemic Intimate Violence: The Human Right and Corresponding State Obligation 108
The Substance of the Right 108
Exploring the Internationalising Elements of Domestic Violence 109
The Elements of Systemic Intimate Violence 111
Severe Acts of Emotional or Physical Harm 111
Continuum of Harm 118
Between Intimates 122
Group Vulnerability of Women 123
The Failure of the State to Help 134
Moving from an Emerging Norm to a Right in International Law 142
Steps Needed in International Law 142
The First Step: The Enunciation of a Specific Legal Right 144
The Second Step: Political Consequences of Domestic Violence 147
The Third Step: Bringing Domestic Violence into the Remit of Non-Gender-Specific Human Rights Bodies 150

Good Governance Practices: What States Should Do to Protect Against Systemic Intimate Violence 151

Legislative Steps 152
  Anti-discrimination Provisions 154
  Acts of Violence 156
  Continuum of Harm 159
  Relationship 160
  Criminal v Civil Sanctions 160
  Balancing Civil and Criminal Sanctions: The Protection Order 164
  Compensation and Damages 169
  Evidence and Burden of Proof 170
  Labour Laws 170
  Murder by Victims 172
  Fair Procedure and Rules of Justice 175
  Remedies and the Provision of Services 176

Police Protection and Implementation of the Law 176
  Statutory Obligation to Protect 180
  Training 180
  Specialised Units 181
  Female Officers 181
  Data and Inter-departmental Communication 181
  Police Powers 182

Judiciary and Judicial Agents 182
  Knowledge of Rights 184
  Shelters 186
  Emergency and Long-term Health and Economic Well-being 188
  Statistics, Indicators and Budget 189
  National Action Plans 190
  Conclusion 191

3 State Responsibility in Relation to Systemic Intimate Violence 193

Principles of State Responsibility 193
  Background 194
  Who are the Subjects of International Law? 195
  Doctrine of Denial of Justice 200
  Is a State Responsible for the Actions of Non-State Actors? 203

Elements of State Responsibility and their Application to Systemic Intimate Violence 205
xiv  Contents

Conduct Element 205
Wrongfulness Element 227
Circumstances Precluding Wrongfulness 237
Application of the Justification Principles to Systemic Intimate Violence 241
Competing Values: Privacy 243
Fault and Knowledge 246
Role of the Judiciary 249
Consequences of an Internationally Wrongful Act 250
Conclusion 250

4 The Benefits of International Law for Victims of Systemic Intimate Violence 252
Non-coercive Compliance Theory 252
The Great Debate: Is International Law Effective? 254
Suspicion of International Law in Brief 254
Support of International Law in Brief 255
The Multi-Faceted Process of International Law 256
Norm Infiltration 256
Symbiotic Relationship between National and International Law 257
Deficiency Not Nugatory 258
Proliferation of Actors Facilitating Compliance with International Law 259
Functions of International Human Rights Law in respect of Violence against Women 266
International Law Leading to Change: The Expressive and Implementing Functions 266
How International Law Changed the Legal Response to Mass Rape 269
How International Law Changed the Legal Response to Enforced Disappearances 275
How International Law Changed the Legal Response to FGC 279
How International Law has Already Changed the Legal Response to Asylum and Domestic Violence 284
Non-coercive Compliance Theory in respect of Systemic Intimate Violence 289
Before DEVAW 290
After DEVAW 291
Domestic Violence in Mexico Before and After DEVAW 292
Domestic Violence in Nicaragua Before and After DEVAW 300
Domestic Violence in Sweden Before and After DEVAW 306
General Examples of Improvements in Domestic Violence Laws and Policies 311
Conclusion 316
Index 317