

# Contents

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <i>Series Editor's Preface</i>                                    | v         |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i>   | vii       |
| <i>Table of Cases</i>   | xiii      |
| <b>1 Introduction</b>   | <b>1</b>  |
| <b>PART I: JURISDICTIONS</b>                                      | <b>7</b>  |
| <b>2 United States of America: Section 1983 and <i>Bivens</i></b> | <b>9</b>  |
| A. Introduction   | 9         |
| B. Actions against State Governments                              | 11        |
| 1. Historical Background  | 11        |
| 2. <i>Monroe v Pape</i> : A Seminal Decision                      | 13        |
| 3. Range of Bodies that can be Sued: Extension by <i>Monell</i>   | 15        |
| 4. Range of Bodies that can be Sued: Immunities                   | 16        |
| 5. Range of Bodies that can be Sued: Persons                      | 18        |
| 6. Nature of Protected Rights                                     | 21        |
| 7. Standard of Liability  | 22        |
| 8. Identity of the Plaintiff                                      | 23        |
| 9. The Remedy   | 25        |
| 10. Summary   | 29        |
| C. Actions against Federal Officers                               | 29        |
| 1. History  | 30        |
| 2. <i>Bivens</i>  | 30        |
| 3. <i>Butz, Davis and Carlson</i> : the Approach is Developed     | 31        |
| 4. Existence of Alternative Remedies                              | 33        |
| 5. Special Factors Counselling Hesitation                         | 35        |
| 6. Immunities   | 35        |
| 7. Potential Defendants   | 36        |
| 8. The Remedy   | 37        |
| 9. Summary  | 38        |
| D. Summary: the Causes of Action in the United States             | 38        |
| <b>3 India: Article 32</b>  | <b>39</b> |
| A. Introduction   | 39        |
| B. The Constitution and the Supreme Court                         | 39        |
| C. The Centrality of Article 32                                   | 41        |

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| D. The Relationship between Articles 32 and 226                 | 43        |
| E. Standing   | 45        |
| F. The Development of a Monetary Remedy                         | 46        |
| G. Expansion of the Remedy                                      | 51        |
| H. Summary  | 55        |
| <b>4 New Zealand: <i>Baigent's Case</i></b>                     | <b>57</b> |
| A. Introduction   | 57        |
| B. New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990                          | 57        |
| C. The Cause of Action  | 59        |
| 1. <i>Baigent's Case</i>  | 59        |
| 2. Which Acts and Actors are Covered?                           | 61        |
| (a) Is the Judiciary Included?                                  | 61        |
| (b) Is the Common Law Included?                                 | 62        |
| (c) What does Public Mean?                                      | 64        |
| 3. Protections from Suit  | 66        |
| (a) Immunities  | 66        |
| (b) What Injury is Required?                                    | 67        |
| 4. The Remedy   | 68        |
| (a) Remedial Discretion   | 68        |
| (b) Calculation of Remedy                                       | 71        |
| (c) Who Pays?   | 73        |
| (d) Procedural Issues   | 75        |
| D. Summary  | 75        |
| <b>PART II: COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS</b>                            | <b>77</b> |
| <b>5 Structure of the Cause of Action</b>                       | <b>79</b> |
| A. Introduction   | 79        |
| B. What does the Cause of Action Protect?                       | 80        |
| 1. Introduction   | 80        |
| 2. Is a Constitutional Right Required?                          | 80        |
| 3. Upon which Right was the Cause of Action Originally Based?   | 82        |
| 4. Is the Breach of a Right Sufficient for the Cause of Action? | 84        |
| 5. What amounts to the Breach of a Right?                       | 85        |
| 6. Does it matter which Right was Breached?                     | 86        |
| 7. Summary  | 87        |
| C. Who does the Cause of Action Protect?                        | 87        |
| 1. Introduction   | 87        |
| 2. What is the Statutory Basis?                                 | 88        |
| 3. Who is a Rights-holder?                                      | 90        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 4. Is Public Interest Litigation Available?                              | 91         |
| 5. Is Injury Required?   | 96         |
| 6. Summary   | 97         |
| D. Against whom Is the Cause of Action Directed?                         | 98         |
| 1. Does the Cause of Action Apply to Private as well as Public Entities? | 98         |
| 2. What Immunities Apply?  | 106        |
| 3. Is the Nature of the Pleadings Important?                             | 108        |
| 4. Is Fault Relevant?  | 110        |
| 5. Summary   | 112        |
| E. What does the Court Order?  | 113        |
| 1. What Terminology is Used?   | 113        |
| 2. Step 1: Should the Monetary Remedy be Ordered?                        | 117        |
| 3. Step 2: What Amount to Order?   | 120        |
| (a) What Method is Used to Calculate Quantum?                            | 120        |
| (b) What Factors are Relevant in the Calculation?                        | 122        |
| 4. Step 3: Should other Directions be Ordered?                           | 128        |
| 5. Summary   | 130        |
| F. Conclusions   | 131        |
| <b>6 Overarching Influences</b>  | <b>133</b> |
| A. Introduction  | 133        |
| B. What is the Source of the Cause of Action?                            | 133        |
| 1. Introduction  | 133        |
| 2. What is the Foundation Document?                                      | 134        |
| 3. From what Legal Provision did the Cause of Action Develop?            | 135        |
| 4. Summary   | 141        |
| C. What is the Age of the Cause of Action?                               | 142        |
| 1. Introduction  | 142        |
| 2. The Relative Ages of the Causes of Action                             | 143        |
| 3. Tidal Fluctuations  | 144        |
| 4. Number of Cases   | 147        |
| 5. International Human Rights Common Law                                 | 150        |
| 6. Summary   | 152        |
| D. What is the Wider Context of the Cause of Action?                     | 152        |
| 1. Introduction  | 152        |
| 2. What is the Cultural Context?   | 153        |
| 3. What is the Legal Context?  | 161        |
| 4. Summary   | 163        |
| E. What is the Internal Context of the Cause of Action?                  | 164        |
| 1. Introduction  | 164        |
| 2. What are the Aims and Rationale?                                      | 164        |

xii *Contents*

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 3. How are Principle and Pragmatism Balanced?                                     | 166        |
| 4. Is it a Public or Private Cause of Action?                                     | 169        |
| 5. How is Comparative Jurisprudence Integrated?                                   | 172        |
| 6. Summary  | 176        |
| F. Conclusion   | 176        |
| <b>PART III: TURNING THE ANALYSIS AROUND</b>                                      | <b>179</b> |
| <b>7 The United Kingdom Human Rights Act 1998</b>                                 | <b>181</b> |
| A. Introduction   | 181        |
| B. Completing the Framework: the Overarching Influences                           | 183        |
| 1. Introduction   | 183        |
| 2. The Nature of the Foundation Document  | 183        |
| 3. The Age of the Cause of Action   | 188        |
| 4. The Wider Context  | 190        |
| 5. The Internal Context   | 196        |
| 6. Summary  | 198        |
| C. Answering the Common Questions: Towards an Application to the Human Rights Act | 198        |
| 1. Introduction   | 198        |
| 2. What does the Cause of Action Protect?   | 199        |
| 3. Who does the Cause of Action Protect?  | 200        |
| 4. Who is the Cause of Action Directed Against?                                   | 201        |
| 5. What does the Court Order?   | 202        |
| 6. Summary  | 206        |
| D. Conclusions  | 206        |
| <b>8 Conclusion</b>   | <b>209</b> |
| <i>Index</i>  | 213        |