
Contents

1 Introduction: Human Rights in Healthcare	1
I. Sources of Human Rights Law	4
(a) International Human Rights Treaties	4
(b) The British Constitution and Common Law Rights	7
(c) The Human Rights Act 1998.....	9
II. The Human Rights Relevant to Medical Law.....	12
(a) Privacy-related Rights.....	12
(b) The Right to Life	13
(c) The Right to Dignity.....	14
(d) Reproductive Autonomy.....	15
Recommended Further Reading.....	15
2 A Right to Treatment? The Allocation of Resources in the National Health Service	17
I. Rights, Health and Resources	17
(a) Rights to Healthcare.....	17
(b) The Ministerial Duty to Promote a Comprehensive and Free Health Service.....	20
(c) Ethical Issues in Resource Allocation	23
II. The General Rule: No Right to Treatment.....	27
III. Procedural Aspects of a Right to Treatment.....	29
(a) The Equality Principle	29
(b) Procedural Propriety.....	30
IV. A Right to Basic Life-Sustaining Treatment?.....	33
IV. Conclusion	36
Recommended Further Reading.....	36
3 Ensuring Quality Healthcare: An Issue of Rights or Duties?	37
I. The Doctor-Patient Relationship.....	37
II. The Legal Requirements of Negligence.....	39
(a) Establishing a Duty of Care.....	39
(b) Proving that the Doctor has Breached his Duty of Care	41
(c) The Final Hurdle: Did the Breach Cause the Harm?	47
(d) Negligence: Conclusion	53
III. Non-fault Compensation: Escaping the Blame Culture	53
IV. Conclusion	56
Recommended further reading	57

4	Autonomy and Consent to Medical Treatment	59
I.	Autonomy, Consent and Choices	59
	(a) Autonomy: The Ethical Principle.....	59
	(b) Autonomy: The Legal Principle	61
II.	The Nature of Consent.....	65
	(a) To what can we consent?	65
	(b) How do we consent?	68
III.	Competent Consent.....	72
	(a) Assessing Capacity.....	72
	(b) The Capacity Test in Practice	75
IV.	Informed Consent	79
	(a) The Meaning of Informed Consent.....	79
	(b) The Legal Consequences of a Failure to Inform of Risks	80
	(c) The Doctor's Standard of Care	82
	(d) Causation of Harm	87
V.	Conclusion	89
	Recommended Further Reading.....	90
5	Treating Incompetent Patients: Beneficence, Welfare and Rights	91
I.	The Principle of Beneficence and Conflicting Rights.....	91
II.	The Best Interests Test.....	94
	(a) Medical Best Interests	94
	(b) Broader Social Interests	98
	(c) The Interests of Others.....	100
	(d) Best Interests on a Statutory Footing	104
III.	Who Decides?.....	106
	(a) Decision-making under the MCA	106
	(b) Conflict Between Parents and Doctors.....	108
	(c) Conflicts between Mature Minors and Parents or Doctors.....	111
IV.	Conclusion	116
	Recommended Further Reading.....	117
6	Medical Confidentiality And The Right To Privacy	119
I.	Rights to Privacy and Confidentiality in the Medical Context	119
	(a) The Concept of a Right to Privacy	119
	(b) The Protection of Privacy in English Law.....	121
	(c) Confidentiality and Privacy in the Medical Context	124
II.	Exceptions to the Duty of Confidentiality: Balancing Privacy Against Other Public Interests.....	126
	(a) Disclosure with Consent.....	126
	(b) Public Safety	128
	(c) Freedom of the Press	130
	(d) Parental Responsibility.....	131
	(e) Anonymised Data for Research and Other Purposes.....	134
III.	Conclusion	136
	Recommended Further Reading.....	137

7	Property Rights in the Body	139
I.	The Theory of Self-Ownership and the Role of Rights.....	139
II.	Property Rights in Human Material taken from Living Persons	143
III.	Property Rights and Dead Bodies	147
	(a) The No Property Rule and Its Exceptions.....	147
	(b) Organ Retention Scandals	150
	(c) The Human Tissue Act 2004	154
	(d) Shortage of Organs for Transplant	155
IV.	Conclusion	157
	Recommended further reading	157
8	Medically Assisted Conception and a Right to Reproduce?	159
I.	The Origins of a Right to Reproduce.....	160
II.	Access to Treatment: A Right to Reproduce in Practice?	164
	(a) Conflicting Interests I: Welfare of the Child	165
	(b) Conflicting Interests II: Consent of Gamete Donors	167
	(c) Conflicting Interests III: Parties to a Surrogacy Arrangement ..	170
	(d) Conflicting Interests IV: Interests of Society.....	173
III.	Assigning Parentage: Giving Legal Recognition to the Right to Reproduce?	173
	(a) Identifying the Mother	174
	(b) Identifying the Father	175
IV.	A Right to Reproduce a Healthy Child? Selection of Embryos.....	177
V.	Conclusion	178
	Recommended Further Reading.....	179
9	Termination of Pregnancy: A Conflict of Rights	181
I.	The Fetus.....	181
	(a) A Right to Life for the Fetus?	181
	(b) The Ethical Background to the Right to Life Debate	184
	(c) The Fetus in English Law	187
II.	The Mother	190
	(a) A Right to Choose for the Mother?	190
	(b) The Mother's Rights in English Law.....	192
III.	The Father.....	197
IV.	The Medical Professionals.....	199
V.	Conclusion	201
	Recommended Further Reading.....	202
10	Pregnancy and Freedom of Choice	203
I.	Refusal of Medical Treatment During Pregnancy	203
	(a) Freedom of Choice and the Pregnant Woman	203
	(b) Competency during Pregnancy.....	208
II.	Preventing Pre-natal Harm	212
	(a) Harming the Fetus	212

ix Contents

(b) Harming the Future Child.....	214
III. Wrongful Conception and Birth: Financial Recompense for an Unwanted Pregnancy?	218
(a) The Nature of Wrongful Conception and Wrongful Birth Claims	219
(b) Is a Child Always a Blessing? Reasons for Denying Compensation for an Unwanted Pregnancy	220
(c) The Post-McFarlane Fudge.....	223
IV. Conclusion	224
Recommended Further Reading.....	225
11 The Right to Life at the End of Life	227
I. The Right to Life in Context.....	227
(a) The Right to Life in Article 2 ECHR	227
(b) The Boundaries of the Right to Life: Defining Death.....	229
(c) The Sanctity of Human Life.....	231
II. The <i>Bland</i> Principles	233
(a) Was Bland still alive?	234
(b) Bland's Best Interests.....	235
(c) Is Artificial Feeding a Form of Medical Treatment?	238
(d) Is Withdrawing Treatment an Act or an Omission (and does it matter)?	239
(e) Conclusion: The Bland Principles.....	242
III. The <i>Bland</i> Principles in Practice.....	242
(a) The Beginning of a Slippery Slope?	242
(b) Duty to Provide ANH to Competent Patients	244
(c) The Bland Principles in a Human Rights Age	245
IV. Equal Rights to Life: The Conjoined Twins Case.....	248
V. Conclusion	251
Recommended Further Reading:.....	251
12 The Law and Ethics of Assisted Dying: Is There a Right to Die?	253
I. The Criminal Law Prohibition on Assisted Dying.....	253
II. Life and Death: A Right to Die as a Corollary of a Right to Life?	259
III. A Right to Die with Dignity?	261
IV. Autonomy, Private Life and Death	264
(a) The Right to Respect for Private Decisions about Dying	264
(b) Proportionate State Interference: Protecting the Rights of the Vulnerable.....	265
V. Discrimination of the Disabled: Suicide versus Assisted Suicide.....	271
VI. Conclusion	272
Recommended Further Reading.....	274