

# Contents

---

|            |   |           |
|------------|---|-----------|
|            | Preface . . . . .   | vii       |
|            | Acknowledgments. . . . .  | ix        |
|            | About the Authors. . . . .  | xi        |
|            | List of Abbreviations . . . . .   | xiii      |
| <b>1.0</b> | <b>Executive Summary . . . . .</b>  | <b>1</b>  |
| 1.1        | Overview . . . . .  | 1         |
| 1.2        | Purposes of the Endangered Species Act . . . . .                                | 2         |
| 1.3        | Basic Structure of the ESA . . . . .  | 4         |
| <b>2.0</b> | <b>Listing and Critical Habitat Designation . . . . .</b>                       | <b>5</b>  |
| 2.1        | Overview . . . . .  | 5         |
| 2.2        | What Is a Species?. . . . .   | 7         |
| 2.2.1      | Distinct Population Segments . . . . .  | 8         |
| 2.2.2      | Throughout All or a Significant Portion of Its Range . . . . .                  | 13        |
| 2.3        | Listing Criteria and Best Scientific and Commercial<br>Data Available . . . . . | 14        |
| 2.4        | The Petition Process . . . . .  | 19        |
| 2.4.1      | The 90-Day Finding . . . . .  | 20        |
| 2.4.2      | The 12-Month Finding . . . . .  | 21        |
| 2.5        | Informal Rulemaking Necessary for Listing Species . . . . .                     | 23        |
| 2.5.1      | Proposed Listing Contents . . . . .   | 23        |
| 2.5.2      | Notice and Comment . . . . .  | 24        |
| 2.5.3      | The Final Rule. . . . .   | 25        |
| 2.6        | Emergency Listings . . . . .  | 28        |
| 2.7        | Candidate Species. . . . .  | 29        |
| 2.8        | Critical Habitat . . . . .  | 31        |
| 2.8.1      | Prudent and Determinable . . . . .  | 33        |
| 2.8.2      | Economic Analysis . . . . .   | 34        |
| 2.8.3      | Critical Habitat Designation and Revision. . . . .                              | 35        |
| <b>3.0</b> | <b>Conservation: Section 7(a)(1) and Recovery Planning . . . . .</b>            | <b>37</b> |
| 3.1        | Overview . . . . .  | 37        |
| 3.2        | Section 7(a)(1) Conservation Obligations. . . . .                               | 38        |
| 3.3        | Recovery Plans . . . . .  | 41        |
| 3.3.1      | Discretion of FWS/NMFS in Recovery Plan Preparation<br>and Content . . . . .    | 42        |
| 3.3.2      | Federal Agency Discretion in Implementing Recovery Plans . . . . .              | 43        |

|            |   |    |
|------------|---|----|
| <b>4.0</b> | <b>Prohibited Acts and Penalties: Sections 9 and 11</b>                     | 47 |
| 4.1        | Overview  | 47 |
| 4.2        | Conduct Prohibited  | 48 |
| 4.3        | Threatened Species and Section 4(d) Rules                                   | 49 |
| 4.4        | Plants  | 50 |
| 4.5        | Prohibited “Take”: What Constitutes Harm                                    | 52 |
| 4.5.1      | <i>Palila I and II</i> : Habitat Modification May Result in Prohibited Harm | 53 |
| 4.5.2      | <i>Sweet Home</i> : “Harm” Definition Upheld                                | 54 |
| 4.6        | Causation: Reasonable Certainty and the New Era of Section 9 Litigation     | 57 |
| 4.7        | Section 11 Penalties: Overview  | 61 |
| 4.7.1      | Monetary Penalties, Imprisonment, Forfeiture                                | 61 |
| 4.7.2      | Scienter  | 62 |
| 4.8        | Bodily Harm Defense   | 63 |
| <b>5.0</b> | <b>Consultation: Section 7(a)(2)</b>  | 65 |
| 5.1        | Overview  | 65 |
| 5.2        | Agency Action   | 66 |
| 5.3        | Effects of the Action   | 69 |
| 5.3.1      | The Environmental Baseline  | 70 |
| 5.3.2      | Direct and Indirect Effects   | 72 |
| 5.3.3      | Cumulative Effects  | 73 |
| 5.3.4      | Interrelated and Interdependent Activities                                  | 74 |
| 5.3.5      | “Incremental Step” Consultation   | 75 |
| 5.4        | The Consultation Process  | 76 |
| 5.4.1      | Presence of Listed Species or Critical Habitat in the Action Area           | 77 |
| 5.4.2      | “May Affect” Determination  | 78 |
| 5.4.3      | Biological Assessment Preparation or Informal Consultation                  | 79 |
| 5.4.4      | Formal Consultation and the Biological Opinion                              | 81 |
| 5.4.5      | Biological Opinion  | 82 |
| 5.4.5.1    | Jeopardy  | 83 |
| 5.4.5.2    | Adverse Modification or Destruction   | 84 |
| 5.4.5.3    | Reasonable and Prudent Alternatives   | 85 |
| 5.4.5.4    | Incidental Take Statements  | 87 |
| 5.4.5.5    | Challenges to Biological Opinions   | 88 |
| 5.5        | Reinitiation of Consultation  | 89 |
| 5.6        | Irreversible/Irretrievable Commitments of Resources                         | 90 |
| 5.7        | Conferencing  | 93 |

|            |  |            |
|------------|--|------------|
| 5.8        | The Role of Tribes . . . . .   | 94         |
| 5.9        | The Role of Private Applicants . . . . .                                       | 95         |
| <b>6.0</b> | <b>Incidental Take Permits and Other Allowable Take . . . .</b>                | <b>101</b> |
| 6.1        | Overview . . . . .   | 101        |
| 6.2        | Incidental Take Permits . . . . .  | 102        |
| 6.3        | Habitat Conservation Plans . . . . .   | 103        |
| 6.3.1      | Scope of an HCP . . . . .  | 104        |
| 6.3.2      | HCP Mitigation Requirements . . . . .  | 106        |
| 6.3.3      | No Surprises Policy and Adaptive Management . . . . .                          | 107        |
| 6.4        | Enhancement of Survival and Safe Harbor Permits . . . . .                      | 111        |
| 6.5        | Candidate Conservation Agreements . . . . .                                    | 114        |
| 6.6        | Transferability . . . . .  | 117        |
| 6.7        | Conservation Banks . . . . .   | 118        |
| 6.8        | Intra-agency Section 7 Consultation Requirement<br>and NEPA . . . . .          | 119        |
| 6.9        | Other Specific Section 10 Exceptions . . . . .                                 | 119        |
| <b>7.0</b> | <b>Section 7 Exemption Process . . . . .</b>                                   | <b>121</b> |
| 7.1        | Overview . . . . .   | 121        |
| 7.2        | Applying for an Exemption . . . . .  | 122        |
| 7.2.1      | Who May Apply for an Exemption . . . . .                                       | 122        |
| 7.2.2      | When to Apply for an Exemption . . . . .                                       | 123        |
| 7.2.3      | Contents of the Exemption Application . . . . .                                | 123        |
| 7.2.4      | Initial Secretarial Action on the Application . . . . .                        | 124        |
| 7.3        | The Exemption Process, Phase I: Consideration<br>by the Secretary . . . . .    | 125        |
| 7.3.1      | Threshold Determinations . . . . .   | 125        |
| 7.3.2      | Hearings . . . . .   | 126        |
| 7.3.3      | The Secretary's Report . . . . .   | 127        |
| 7.4        | The Exemption Process, Phase II: The Endangered Species<br>Committee . . . . . | 128        |
| 7.4.1      | The Committee . . . . .  | 128        |
| 7.4.2      | The Exemption Decision . . . . .   | 129        |
| 7.4.3      | Mitigation and Enhancement . . . . .   | 130        |
| 7.5        | Special Cases . . . . .  | 130        |
| <b>8.0</b> | <b>Federal Interaction with States and Tribes . . . . .</b>                    | <b>133</b> |
| 8.1        | Overview . . . . .   | 133        |
| 8.2        | The ESA as a Valid Exercise of Congressional<br>Commerce Power . . . . .       | 134        |

|             |  |            |
|-------------|--|------------|
| 8.3         | Preemption of State Law . . . . .  | 135        |
| 8.4         | Section 6 Cooperative Agreements . . . . .                                 | 136        |
| 8.5         | Role of Tribal Governments . . . . .                                       | 137        |
| <b>9.0</b>  | <b>International Application of the ESA . . . . .</b>                      | <b>141</b> |
| 9.1         | Overview . . . . .   | 141        |
| 9.2         | International Applicability . . . . .                                      | 142        |
| 9.3         | Listing of Species . . . . .   | 142        |
| 9.4         | Limits on the ESA's Applicability . . . . .                                | 143        |
| 9.5         | Implementation of CITES and the Western Hemisphere<br>Convention . . . . . | 144        |
| 9.5.1       | CITES . . . . .  | 145        |
| 9.5.2       | Western Hemisphere Convention . . . . .                                    | 148        |
| 9.6         | Prohibited Acts . . . . .  | 149        |
| <b>10.0</b> | <b>Experimental Populations . . . . .</b>                                  | <b>151</b> |
| 10.1        | Overview . . . . .   | 151        |
| 10.2        | Establishing an Experimental Population . . . . .                          | 152        |
| 10.3        | Essential versus Nonessential Experimental Populations . . . . .           | 154        |
| 10.4        | Geographic Separation . . . . .  | 155        |
| 10.5        | Critical Habitat . . . . .   | 156        |
| 10.6        | Section 7 Consultation . . . . .   | 156        |
| 10.7        | Special Rules with Respect to Experimental Populations . . . . .           | 157        |
| <b>11.0</b> | <b>Citizen Suits, Standing, and Procedure . . . . .</b>                    | <b>159</b> |
| 11.1        | Overview . . . . .   | 159        |
| 11.2        | Scope of ESA Section 11(g) . . . . .                                       | 159        |
| 11.3        | 60-Day Notice Requirement . . . . .  | 160        |
| 11.4        | APA Review as an Alternative to an ESA Citizen Suit . . . . .              | 163        |
| 11.5        | Standing . . . . .   | 164        |
| 11.5.1      | Article III Standing . . . . .   | 165        |
| 11.5.1.1    | Prong 1: "Injury in Fact" . . . . .  | 166        |
| 11.5.1.2    | Prong 2: "Causation" . . . . .   | 167        |
| 11.5.1.3    | Prong 3: "Redressability" . . . . .  | 169        |
| 11.5.2      | Prudential Standing . . . . .  | 170        |
|             | Appendix A. Frequently Asked Questions . . . . .                           | 173        |
|             | Appendix B. Key Cases . . . . .  | 187        |
|             | Glossary . . . . .   | 195        |
|             | Bibliography . . . . .   | 209        |
|             | Table of Cases . . . . .   | 213        |
|             | Index . . . . .  | 225        |