

Table of Contents

Preface	xi
Ch. I. The Constitutional Law of Federal Taxation	1
A. Summary of Book.....	1
B. Constitutional Law Generally	5
C. The Constitution's Tax Rules	10
D. Types of Taxes	17
E. The Supreme Court's Constitutional Tax Jurisprudence.....	21
1. Overview.....	21
2. Federal Tax Provisions Ruled Unconstitutional by the Supreme Court.....	25
a. Summary.....	25
b. The 25 Federal Tax Provisions Ruled Unconstitutional	26
c. Analysis of the 25 Decisions	38
3. The Determined Bar.....	42
4. A Methodology for Judging the Constitutionality of Federal Taxes	46
a. Presumptions.....	46
b. Bill of Rights and Political Process Challenges: Strict Scrutiny	50
c. Practicable Construction	55
5. Statutory Construction Generally and the Constitution	56

THE SUPREME COURT, FEDERAL TAXATION, AND THE CONSTITUTION

6.	Reliance on History of Taxation	57
7.	Severability and Remedy	59
8.	The Great Issues: From Substance to Form	67
9.	Economics Versus Law	70
10.	The Justices Themselves	73
a.	Individual Justices	73
b.	The Court's Use of Its "Old" Decisions.....	77
Ch. II.	The Power to Tax	79
A.	Taxation and Sovereignty	79
1.	Taxation Is the Essential Feature of Sovereignty.....	79
2.	The Extent of the Sovereign's Taxing Power	82
3.	The Subjects of the Sovereign's Taxing Power.....	89
4.	Conceptual Outer Limit on the Sovereign's Power of Taxation .	98
B.	The Federal and State Taxing Powers in the Constitution.....	100
1.	The Federal Power to Tax.....	100
2.	The States' Power to Tax	102
3.	Concurrent Jurisdiction to Tax	103
C.	Intergovernmental Tax Immunity	106
1.	Overview.....	106
2.	Federal Supremacy Established	109
3.	Expansion of Federal Immunity	114
4.	Destruction to Nondiscrimination	118
5.	Federal Immunity from Chief Justice Marshall to Today	119
6.	Federal Enclaves	124
7.	States' Implied Immunity from Federal Taxation	125
a.	Overview.....	125
b.	<i>Collector v. Day</i>	129
8.	Chronology of Intergovernmental Immunity Cases	134
9.	<i>James v. Dravo</i> : Back Story.....	165
10.	Indian Tribes	167
11.	Indians Not Taxed	170
12.	Other Federal Supremacy Interactions.....	172
Ch. III.	Taxes Versus Regulation	173
A.	Overview.....	173
B.	Why Characterization Matters	181
C.	Definitions of Tax	183
D.	Clause One's Definition of Taxes: Purposes.....	187
1.	The Spending Power.....	187
2.	Butler and Spending Purpose	188
3.	Purpose and Motive	192
a.	Taxing Purpose.....	192
b.	Congress' Motives	196
c.	Public Purpose Doctrine.....	201

TABLE OF CONTENTS

4.	Another Understanding of the Taxing Power	203
5.	Actual Use of Funds: Tracing.....	205
6.	Paying Debts	206
7.	Common Defense	207
8.	General Welfare.....	207
a.	Meaning.....	207
b.	Coercive General Welfare Spending.....	211
E.	Taxes Can Regulate	214
1.	The General Rule	214
2.	Federal Taxes Can Regulate Matters Beyond Federal Control	220
a.	General	220
b.	Taxes Can Regulate to Strongly Encourage Positive Action..	222
c.	The 2012 Health Insurance Tax Case.....	225
(1)	Summary of Decision	225
(2)	Future Stare Decisis Effects.....	226
(a)	The Opinions.....	226
(b)	Stare Decisis.....	227
(c)	Holding, Reasoning, and Dicta As to the Tax	229
(3)	Discussion of Holdings.....	230
(a)	The Power to Tax.....	230
(b)	Substance over Form	232
(c)	Objective Facts, Congress' Motives	235
(d)	Taxes that Regulate	238
(e)	Taxing Inactivity	241
(f)	Direct Taxation	242
(4)	Discussion of Reasoning.....	244
(a)	The Child Labor Tax Case.....	244
(b)	The Three Part Test	247
(5)	Commerce Clause	249
(6)	Conclusion As to <i>Sebelius</i>	250
3.	Taxes Can Regulate As Incident to Their Own Collection	250
4.	When Congress Has the Powers to Both Regulate and Tax.....	251
a.	Taxes That Regulate As Necessary and Proper to Another Power	251
b.	When It Doesn't Matter	253
c.	Taxes Can Regulate What Is Already Regulated.....	256
5.	The Self Defeating Tax	256
6.	Poll Taxes	263
7.	Taxes That Are Too Light.....	264
8.	Taxation As Punishment.....	265
9.	Contrast State Taxation and Regulation.....	266
F.	Supreme Court Rulings That a Federal Tax Was Not a Tax	267
1.	Overview.....	267
2.	Tax and Regulation Chronology.....	270

3.	Tenth Amendment	298
Ch. IV.	User Fees, Special Assessments, and Privilege License Taxes	305
A.	User Fees for Benefits	305
1.	Overview.....	305
2.	Constitutional Standards for User Fees	308
3.	General Rules.....	311
4.	Case Chronology.....	313
5.	User Fee Distinguishing Factors	325
B.	Special Assessments.....	328
1.	Assessments for Benefits	328
2.	Specific Rulings	329
3.	Contrast Police Power	331
C.	The Tax-Sovereignty Connection: Privilege License Taxes	335
Ch. V.	Direct Taxes and Other Taxes.....	339
A.	Summary.....	339
B.	Two Types of Federal Taxes.....	341
C.	Direct Taxes.....	345
1.	The Direct Tax Issue	345
2.	Limit on Direct Taxes.....	347
3.	Identifying Direct Taxes	348
a.	Overview.....	348
b.	Identification: The British Background.....	353
c.	Identification: The Economic Explanation.....	354
d.	Identification: The Colonies, the Confederation and the New Congress	358
4.	Direct Taxes: Reasons for the Distinction	360
a.	Reasons: Political Motivations Overview	360
b.	Reasons: Regions and Large States Versus Small States.....	361
c.	Reasons: Primary Source of Tax	363
d.	Reasons: Favored Versus Disfavored Taxes	365
e.	Reasons: Internal Versus External Taxes	366
f.	Reasons: Episodic Versus Ongoing Taxes	368
g.	Reasons: Consumption or Not	370
h.	Reasons: Administrability	371
i.	Reasons: Slaves	372
j.	Reasons: The Advantage of Ambiguity.....	375
D.	Other Taxes	375
1.	Overview.....	375
2.	Identifying Taxes That Are Not Direct	377
a.	Imposts, Duties, and Excises, and What Else?.....	377
b.	Income Taxation and the Sixteenth Amendment: The Politics.....	381

TABLE OF CONTENTS

c. The Pollock Case	382
d. 1909 Corporate Tax	389
e. The Sixteenth Amendment.....	392
f. What Is Income?	394
3. Limits on Duties, Imposts, and Excises.....	397
a. The Uniformity Requirement	397
(1) General Rule	397
(2) Uniformity: The Golsen Rule and Circuit Disuniformity .	402
(3) Uniformity: Taxing Power in the District of Columbia....	404
(4) Uniformity:Taxing Power in the Territories.....	408
b. Fifth Amendment.....	411
(1) Procedural Limits	414
(2) Discrimination and Equal Protection	418
(a) General Principles	418
(b) Tax Discrimination and Equal Protection	422
(c) Tax Discrimination: The Equal Protection Cases.....	429
(3) Arbitrary or Capricious.....	452
(4) Retroactive Tax	458
(5) Conclusive Presumption.....	468
(6) Administrative Convenience.....	469
(7) Substantive Due Process	471
(a) General	471
(b) Taking from One to Give to Another.....	481
(c) Taxing One on the Income or Property of Another	483
(8) The Eminent Domain Clause	484
(a) General Rule	484
(b) Takings Without Just Compensation/Confiscation	486
(9) Coercion Through Taxation.....	487
 Ch. VI. The Taxation of Imports and Exports	 491
A. Overview.....	491
B. Import Duties	492
C. Imports: Regulation of Revenue.....	493
D. No Tax on Exports.....	495
E. The Import-Export Clause	498
F. Tonnage	500
 Ch. VII. Criminal Tax Constitutional Issues	 501
A. Tax Crimes	501
B. Willfulness	502
C. Self-Incrimination.....	507
D. Fourth Amendment.....	516
E. Double Jeopardy	518
1. Overview.....	518

THE SUPREME COURT, FEDERAL TAXATION, AND THE CONSTITUTION

2.	Where the Crime Is the Nonpayment of the Tax	522
3.	Where the Crime Is Not Directly Related to Tax Collection ..	526
F.	Eighth Amendment.....	530
G.	Vagueness.....	530
H.	Forfeitures.....	532
Ch. VIII. Other Constitutional Issues		537
A.	Taxing Corporate Income	537
B.	No Taxation Without Representation.....	538
C.	Origination Clause.....	540
D.	First Amendment	542
1.	The First Amendment in Constitutional History	542
2.	Federal Taxation and Freedom of Speech Issues Not Involving Churches	544
a.	Deductions and Exemptions for Lobbying	544
b.	Political Speech.....	547
c.	Content of Speech.....	548
d.	Tax Expenditures and the Level Playing Field for Free Speech	550
e.	Taxes As Compelled Speech.....	553
f.	Taxes and Commercial Speech.....	554
3.	Freedom of the Press	554
4.	Establishment Clause	560
a.	General	560
b.	Taxpayer Suits and Standing.....	561
(1)	General.....	561
(2)	Taxpayer Refund Standing Generally	562
(3)	Taxpayer Lack of Standing Without Refund: The Establishment Clause Exception	564
c.	Establishment of Religion: The Substantive Law.....	572
5.	Free Exercise Clause	577
a.	In General	577
b.	Direct Tax Burdens.....	578
c.	Religious Objections to Government Actions and Spending	578
d.	Exemptions, Charitable Deductions and Churches.....	579
(1)	General.....	579
(2)	Exemptions, Charitable Deductions, and Free Speech of Religious Organizations.....	582
E.	Administrative Authority and Enforcement	583
1.	General	583
2.	Chevron and Delegation of Authority	585
3.	Other Separation of Powers Issues	590
a.	Joint Committee	590
b.	Tax Court.....	591
c.	Public Policy Doctrine.....	593

TABLE OF CONTENTS

d. Executive Versus Judicial Responsibility.....	594
F. Other Explicit Limits on the Subjects of Federal Taxation	594
G. Novelty.....	595
Ch. IX. Conclusion	597
Table of Cases	599

http://www.pbookshop.com