

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xix
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	xxxvii
Chapter 1 Scheme, Administration and Reach of the Commerce Act 1986	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Object of the Act	2
1.2.1 Statutory object	2
(a) Original long title	2
(b) Public benefit developments	2
(c) New purpose test	3
1.3 The Substantive Parts of the Commerce Act 1986	6
1.4 Exceptions and Exemptions	7
1.4.1 Matters specifically authorised by any enactment	7
1.4.2 Specific exceptions — s 44	9
1.4.3 Statutory intellectual property rights	10
1.5 Penalties and Remedies	10
1.5.1 Pecuniary penalties	10
1.5.2 Matters relevant to penalty	11
1.5.3 Limitation period	13
1.5.4 Provisions designed to increase individual compliance	13
1.5.5 Injunctions	14
1.5.6 Damages and exemplary damages	15
1.5.7 Offence relating to cartel prohibition	16
1.5.8 The Commission's leniency policy	17
1.6 Commerce Commission	18
1.6.1 Membership and application of Crown Entities Act 2004	18
1.6.2 Functions of the Commission	19

1.6.3	Powers of the Commission	21
1.6.4	The role of the Commission in appeals	25
1.7	The Role of the Courts Under the Commerce Act 1986	26
1.8	The Reach of the Commerce Act 1986	28
1.8.1	The reach of the Commerce Act 1986	28
1.8.2	Attribution of conduct under s 90(2)	30
1.8.3	The interpretation and scope of s 4(1)	33
1.8.4	Proposed Legislative Reforms	36
Chapter 2	Fundamental Concepts	37
2.1	Introduction	37
2.2	Contracts, Arrangements and Understandings	37
2.3	Contract	37
2.4	Arrangement	38
2.4.1	“Arrangement”	38
2.4.2	Arrangement is not a term of art	38
2.4.3	The <i>British Basic Slag</i> case	38
2.4.4	The <i>Mileage Conference</i> case	39
2.4.5	The Australian and New Zealand judicial approach to “arrangement”	40
2.4.6	<i>Giltrap City</i> — the most recent discussion of an arrangement	43
	(a) Facts	43
	(b) The Court’s discussion of “arrangement”	44
	(c) Establishing the necessary consensus	44
	(d) The question of authority	46
2.5	Understanding	47
2.6	Proof of the Contract, Arrangement or Understanding	48
2.6.1	Proof	48
2.6.2	Conscious parallelism	48
2.6.3	Contemporary United States evidentiary standard	50
2.6.4	Australasian standard in relation to proof	51
2.7	Trade and Professional Association Activity	52
2.8	Attempts and Secondary Participation Conduct	53
2.9	Concept of Competition	55
2.9.1	The concept of competition	55
2.9.2	The <i>QCMA</i> discussion of competition	56
2.9.3	Judicial reaction to <i>QCMA</i>	58
2.9.4	Judicial recognition of competition as a dynamic process	60
2.9.5	Judicial endorsement of the Heydon definition of “workable competition”	61

2.10	Concept of Market	61
2.10.1	The concept of market	61
2.10.2	The statutory definition of “market”	62
2.10.3	The leading Australian cases	63
2.10.4	Supply substitutability and ease of entry	64
2.10.5	Geographic market	66
2.10.6	The <i>Air Cargo</i> case	68
2.10.7	Multidimensional nature of market	70
2.10.8	Market as an instrumental concept	71
2.10.9	The SSNIP (or hypothetical monopolist) test	72
Chapter 3	General Prohibition Section	75
3.1	Introduction	75
3.2	Section 27	76
3.2.1	“Person”	76
3.2.2	“Enter into” and “arrive at”	77
3.2.3	“Give effect to”	78
3.3	Contract, Arrangement or Understanding	78
3.3.1	Provision	78
3.3.2	Enforceability	79
3.4	Purpose	81
3.4.1	The meaning of “purpose”	81
3.4.2	Multiple purposes	82
3.4.3	Subjective or objective test of purpose	82
3.4.4	The Australian cases	82
3.4.5	The New Zealand cases	84
3.5	Common or Unilateral Purpose	88
3.5.1	The Australian cases	88
3.5.2	The New Zealand cases	89
3.6	Difference Between s 27 Anti-Competitive Purpose and s 36 Exclusionary Purposes	91
3.6.1	Liability under s 27	91
3.6.2	Liability under s 36	92
3.7	“Effect” and “likely effect”	93
3.8	Substantial Lessening of Competition in a Market	94
3.9	Evaluation of Whether Competition has been Substantially Lessened	95
3.10	The Future-With-and-Without Test	97
3.11	Proportionality Approach not Required	100
3.12	Functional Character of the Statutory Standard	101
3.13	The Temporal Aspect of Any Lessening of Competition	102

3.14	Net Approach: Pro- and Anti-Competitive Effects	103
3.15	Relevance of Market Power	104
3.16	Doctrine of Ancillary Restraints	105
3.17	Effect on Individual Competitor	107
3.18	Market	108
3.19	Other Relevant Statutory Provisions	108
3.19.1	Preventing or hindering competition	108
3.19.2	Factors affecting competition	108
3.19.3	Market	109
3.19.4	Aggregation	109
3.20	Authorisation	109
3.21	Jurisdiction	110
3.22	Commission's Methodology	110
Chapter 4	Exclusionary Provisions	113
4.1	Boycott and Other Types of Exclusionary Conduct	113
4.1.1	Preliminary note	113
4.1.2	Section 29 and exclusionary conduct	113
4.1.3	New Zealand legislative developments	115
4.1.4	The Australian legislative developments	117
4.2	Parties in Competition with Each Other	121
4.2.1	Contract, arrangement or understanding between two or more parties "in competition with each other"	121
4.2.2	The requirement for at least two competitors	121
4.2.3	Horizontal arrangement or a series of vertical arrangements	122
4.2.4	The statutory expansion of a competitive relationship	123
4.2.5	Parties must be competitive in relation to the goods or services to which the exclusionary provision relates	124
4.2.6	Is a market definition exercise called for?	126
4.2.7	Time for ascertaining when parties must be in competition with each other	128
4.3	Purpose	129
4.3.1	The purpose test	129
4.3.2	General issues relating to purpose	129
4.3.3	The role of purpose	129
4.3.4	Inferring purpose	130
4.3.5	Time for ascertaining purpose	131
4.3.6	Relevance of the Australian s 45D authorities on purpose	132
4.3.7	Relationship between purpose as used in ss 29 and 36	133

4.4	Preventing, Restricting or Limiting	133
4.4.1	Preventing, restricting or limiting	133
4.4.2	Quantitative interpretation generally accepted	133
4.4.3	In particular circumstances or on particular conditions	135
4.4.4	Preventing, restricting or limiting must be by "all or any of the parties"	135
4.4.5	Indirect boycott	136
4.4.6	The supply of goods or services	136
4.5	To or From a Particular Person or Class	138
4.5.1	To or from any particular person or class of persons	138
4.5.2	The <i>South Sydney</i> case	140
4.5.3	The <i>Rural Press</i> case	142
(a)	Facts	142
(b)	The ACCC's allegations	142
(c)	Full Federal Court's decision in relation to exclusionary provisions	143
(d)	The High Court of Australia's decision in relation to exclusionary provisions	143
4.5.4	The <i>Liquorland</i> case	145
4.5.5	Lessons for New Zealand's exclusionary provisions law	146
4.6	Target in Competition with Boycotting Party	147
4.6.1	Target must be in competition with one or more of the boycotting parties	147
4.6.2	Potential competitors	148
4.7	Authorisation of Exclusionary Provisions	148
4.8	Application of Other Sections of the Act to Exclusionary Conduct	149
4.9	The Proposed Repeal of s 29	150
Chapter 5	Price-Fixing and the Proposed Cartel Prohibition	153
	Preliminary Note	153
	Part A — The Current Price-Fixing Law	153
5.1	Overview of Price-Fixing	153
5.2	The Relationship Between the s 30(1) Deeming Provision, the s 27(1) and (2) Prohibitions, and the Sanctions for Breach	154
5.3	Contract, Arrangement or Understanding Required	156
5.4	Purpose, Effect, or Likely Effect of Fixing, Controlling or Maintaining Price	157
5.4.1	Meaning of "purpose", "effect", and "likely effect"	157

5.4.2	Fixing, controlling, or maintaining	157
	(a) "Fixing"	158
	(b) "Maintaining"	158
	(c) "Controlling"	159
	(d) "Providing"	160
	(e) Must there be a degree of "specificity" as to the price?	161
	(f) Must there be a degree of proximity between the arrangement and the price?	162
5.5	Price-Fixing Practices Caught by s 30	163
5.5.1	Practices caught by s 30	163
5.5.2	The characterisation question	166
5.5.3	The Commission's challenge to interchange fees	170
5.6	Two Limbs of s 30	172
5.7	"Supplied", "Acquired", "Resupplied" in s 30(1)(a)	174
5.8	Parties Must be "in Competition with Each Other"	175
5.9	Statutory Exemption for Joint Ventures	177
5.9.1	Introduction	177
5.9.2	Statutory definition of "joint venture"	178
5.9.3	Analysis of s 31(2)(a)-(c)	178
5.9.4	Competitive impact of joint ventures	178
5.9.5	Authorisation	179
5.10	Statutory Exemption for Recommended Prices	179
5.10.1	Background	179
5.10.2	Recommendation	180
5.10.3	Legal status of price recommendation schemes	180
5.10.4	Competitive impact of price recommendation schemes	181
5.10.5	Professional fee schedules	181
5.11	Statutory Exemption for Joint Buying and Promotion Arrangements	182
5.11.1	Analysis of statutory exemption	182
5.11.2	The competitive impact of joint buying and promotion schemes	182
5.11.3	The scope for authorisation	183
5.12	Price Information Exchanges	184
5.12.1	Legal analysis of price information exchanges	184
5.12.2	Scope for lawful information exchanges	185
5.13	Authorisation of Price-Fixing	185

Part B — The Proposed Cartel Prohibition	186
5.14 Hard Core Cartel Conduct	186
5.14.1 Introduction	186
5.14.2 The case for criminalisation	187
5.14.3 The evolution of the new law	188
5.15 Parallel Civil and Criminal Prohibition	189
5.15.1 Cartel provision	189
5.15.2 Price-fixing	190
5.15.3 Restricting output	190
5.15.4 Market allocating	191
5.15.5 Bid rigging	192
5.15.6 Meaning of "competitor"	193
5.15.7 Temporal application of cartel prohibition	193
5.15.8 Cartel provisions generally unenforceable	194
5.16 Exemption for Collaborative Activity	194
5.16.1 Introduction	194
5.16.2 Policy developments	194
5.16.3 Analysis of the exemption for collaborative activity	195
5.16.4 The dominant purpose requirement	196
5.16.5 The reasonably necessary requirement	196
5.16.6 Reasonably necessary	197
5.16.7 Commerce Commission's concerns	198
5.16.8 <i>Radio 2UE</i> as an illustrative case	198
5.17 Clearances for Collaborative Activity	199
5.18 Repeal of Current s 32 Relating to Trade and Professional Association Price Recommendations	200
5.19 Exemption for Vertical Supply Contracts	201
5.20 Exemption for Joint Buying and Promotion Agreements	202
5.21 Penalties for Civil and Criminal Breaches	202
Chapter 6 Taking Advantage of Market Power	203
6.1 Section 36 of the Commerce Act	203
6.2 Statutory Prohibition	205
6.2.1 The current prohibition in s 36	205
6.2.2 Person	205
6.2.3 Correct approach to interpreting the statutory prohibition	207
6.3 Relevant Market	209
6.3.1 Identification of the relevant market	209
6.3.2 <i>Queensland Wire</i> guiding principles	209
6.3.3 Potential for dealings sufficient	210

6.4	Substantial Degree of Power in a Market	211
6.4.1	Meaning of "substantial"	211
6.4.2	Absence of any statutory guidance	212
6.4.3	Judicial guidance	214
6.5	Taking Advantage	218
6.5.1	Introduction	218
6.5.2	"Taking advantage" simply means "use"	218
6.5.3	The development of the counterfactual test	218
6.5.4	The refinement of the counterfactual test	220
6.5.5	What degree of connection must exist between the respondent's market power and the conduct at issue?	223
6.5.6	The business rationale for conduct	224
6.5.7	Taking advantage of market power does not necessarily encompass conduct which has the purpose of protecting existing market power	227
6.5.8	Early New Zealand cases on s 36	229
6.5.9	The <i>Clear v Telecom</i> litigation	231
	(a) The High Court	231
	(b) The Court of Appeal	233
	(c) The Privy Council	233
6.5.10	The <i>Carter Holt</i> case	234
6.5.11	Post <i>Carter Holt</i> cases	238
6.5.12	The "data tails" litigation	239
	(a) Introduction	239
	(b) The High Court proceedings	239
	(c) The Court of Appeal	242
	(d) The penalty proceedings	243
6.5.13	The Supreme Court reaffirms the counterfactual test	247
	(a) Factual background	247
	(b) The old and the new tests	248
	(c) Court reaffirms Privy Council test	248
	(d) Court endorses materially facilitated approach	249
	(e) Comment on Deane J's approach	249
	(f) Comment on Heerey J's business rationale test	250
	(g) Court rejects Commission's arguments	250
	(h) Court formulates test	250
	(i) Court provides guidance	250
	(j) Court's conclusion	251
6.5.14	<i>Turners and Growers v Zespri Group</i>	251

6.6	Purpose Requirement	252
6.7	Statutory Exceptions	254
6.7.1	Authorisation	254
6.7.2	Exercise of intellectual property rights	255
6.8	Types of Conduct Caught by s 36	257
6.9	Taking Advantage of Market Power in Trans-Tasman Markets	258
Chapter 7	Resale Price Maintenance	261
7.1	Introduction	261
7.2	Specified Price	262
7.2.1	Specified price	262
7.2.2	The s 37(4) deeming provisions	262
7.2.3	Price need not be specified exactly	264
7.2.4	Specification of recommended price	265
7.2.5	Reference to previously distributed document	266
7.3	"Supply" to "Another Person"	266
7.4	"Selling"	267
7.5	Making Known that Supply is Subject to RPM Condition	268
7.6	Inducing Sale at or Above Specified Minimum Price	269
7.6.1	Recommended Prices	271
7.7	Agreement Not to Resell Below Specified Price	272
7.8	Withholding Supply for Reasons Involving Specified Minimum Prices	273
7.9	Meaning of "Withholding Supply"	273
7.9.1	Refuses or fails to supply: s 40(a)	273
7.9.2	Supply on disadvantageous terms: s 40(b)	274
7.9.3	Less favourable treatment: s 40(c)	274
7.9.4	Causing or procuring another to withhold supply: s 40(d)	274
7.10	Reason for Withholding	275
7.11	Proof of Reason for Withholding	275
7.12	RPM by Third Parties	276
7.13	Categories of RPM by Third Parties	276
7.13.1	Making it known that the third party proposes to engage in hindering or preventing conduct in the absence of an RPM agreement: s 38(1)(a)	276
7.13.2	Engaging in conduct for the purpose of inducing RPM: s 38(1)(b)	278

7.14	Possible Liability Under Other Provisions	279
7.15	Authorisation	279
Chapter 8	Merger Control	283
8.1	Mergers	283
8.1.1	Why does competition law deal with mergers?	283
8.1.2	Why firms merge	283
8.2	Types of Mergers	284
8.2.1	Horizontal mergers	284
8.2.2	Vertical mergers	286
8.2.3	Conglomerate mergers	288
8.3	New Zealand's Merger Control System	288
8.3.1	Summary of current system	288
8.3.2	Key terms in s 47	290
	(a) "Person"	290
	(b) "Acquire"	291
	(c) "Assets" of a business	292
	(d) "Shares"	292
	(e) "Would have ... the effect"	293
	(f) Would be likely to have the effect	294
8.3.3	Substantial lessening of competition	294
8.4	Determining a SLC	294
8.5	The Counterfactual	295
8.6	Counterfactual Principles	299
8.6.1	Woolworths	299
8.7	Metcash	302
8.7.1	Metcash on appeal	304
8.7.2	New Zealand and Australian positions	305
	(a) "Likely"	305
	(b) Australian authority	306
8.8	Market	309
8.9	Analysis of Existing Competition	309
8.9.1	Imports	309
8.9.2	Market concentration	310
8.9.3	Safe harbours	310
8.9.4	Unilateral market power	310
8.9.5	Coordinated market power	311
8.9.6	Constraints on market entry and expansion	311
8.9.7	Elimination of a vigorous and effective competitor	312

8.9.8	Constraints from buyers or suppliers	312
8.9.9	Efficiencies	313
8.9.10	Failing firms	313
8.10	Satisfied	315
8.11	Effect of Substantially Lessening	315
8.12	Merger Models	317
8.13	Authorisations	318
8.13.1	Public benefit	319
8.13.2	Economic background to authorisation	322
8.13.3	Quantification	325
8.14	Detriments	326
8.14.1	Allocative efficiency	327
8.14.2	Productive efficiency	328
8.14.3	Dynamic efficiency	329
8.14.4	Authorisation case study	330
	(a) Detriments	331
	(b) Public benefit	332
8.15	Appeals	333
	<i>Index</i>	335