

# Contents

|                                                                  |      |
|------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| <i>Acknowledgements</i>                                          | vii  |
| <i>Tables</i>                                                    | xiii |
| Introduction: Reform and Non-reform                              | 1    |
| Reform and Non-reform                                            | 1    |
| A Century of Non-reform                                          | 3    |
| The Evolution of the House of Lords                              | 4    |
| Twelve Instances of Reform and Non-reform                        | 11   |
| 1 Veto Limitation over Reform: The Parliament Act 1911           | 15   |
| The Political Situation, 1906–07                                 | 15   |
| Cabinet Discussions on Lords Reform, 1907                        | 16   |
| Budget Rejection, 1909                                           | 20   |
| Between the 1910 Elections                                       | 23   |
| The Parliament Bill 1911                                         | 28   |
| Reform following Veto Limitation? 1911–14                        | 30   |
| Conclusion                                                       | 31   |
| 2 ‘The Battle is Over’: House of Lords Reform, 1917–45           | 35   |
| The Bryce Conference, 1917–18                                    | 35   |
| Cabinet Committees, 1921–22                                      | 39   |
| The Cabinet Committee, 1925–27                                   | 43   |
| Lords reform in the 1920s                                        | 46   |
| Avoiding Reform, 1928–45                                         | 46   |
| 3 A Pre-emptive Strike: The Parliament Act 1949                  | 51   |
| Labour and the House of Lords                                    | 52   |
| Moves Towards reform, 1943–47                                    | 54   |
| Nationalisation and House of Lords Reform                        | 56   |
| The Parliament Bill 1947                                         | 59   |
| The Party Leaders’ Conference 1948                               | 64   |
| The Parliament Bill Resumed                                      | 69   |
| The Iron and Steel Bill                                          | 71   |
| Conclusion                                                       | 73   |
| 4 Diluting the Hereditary Principle?: The Life Peerages Act 1958 | 75   |
| Life Peers                                                       | 77   |
| Inter-Party Discussions                                          | 77   |

|                                                                                                     |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| Discussions, 1953–55                                                                                | 81  |
| Limiting the Hereditaries: Proposals                                                                | 83  |
| Wider Reform: The Cabinet Committee, 1955–56                                                        | 85  |
| Short and Long Bills                                                                                | 87  |
| The Life Peerages Bill                                                                              | 93  |
| Limiting the Hereditary Peers                                                                       | 94  |
| Conclusion                                                                                          | 97  |
| 5 ‘The Wedgwood Benn Enabling Bill’: The Peerage Act 1963                                           | 101 |
| A Hereditary Life Peerage                                                                           | 103 |
| Earlier Attempts at Renouncing Peerages                                                             | 104 |
| The Persistent Commoner                                                                             | 106 |
| Fears over Loss of the Hereditary System                                                            | 107 |
| Party Support for Benn                                                                              | 108 |
| The Committee of Privileges                                                                         | 109 |
| ‘Re-election’                                                                                       | 110 |
| Seating the ‘Defeated’ Candidate                                                                    | 113 |
| The Joint Select Committee                                                                          | 114 |
| The Peerage Bill                                                                                    | 118 |
| Conclusion                                                                                          | 122 |
| 6 Adding to Wilson’s Strife: The Inter-Party Conference and the<br>Parliament (No 2) Bill [1968–69] | 127 |
| Abandoning the Unilateral, Two-Stage Approach                                                       | 131 |
| The Inter-Party Conference                                                                          | 133 |
| The Southern Rhodesia (United Nations Sanctions) Order 1968                                         | 137 |
| The White Paper and the Decision to Proceed with the Bill                                           | 140 |
| The Parliament (No 2) Bill                                                                          | 142 |
| Abandoning the Bill                                                                                 | 150 |
| 1970                                                                                                | 153 |
| Conclusion                                                                                          | 153 |
| Epilogue: House of Lords Reform, 1970–74                                                            | 154 |
| After 1974                                                                                          | 158 |
| 7 Stage One of Two?: The House of Lords Act 1999                                                    | 159 |
| Turning the Tide of Constitutional Reform                                                           | 160 |
| John Smith’s Leadership                                                                             | 162 |
| Tony Blair and House of Lords Reform                                                                | 162 |
| Post-election 1997                                                                                  | 163 |
| Priorities for the First Session                                                                    | 164 |
| The Cabinet Committee                                                                               | 166 |
| The Queen’s Speech 1998                                                                             | 169 |
| The Weatherill Amendment: Origins                                                                   | 169 |
| The House of Lords Bill                                                                             | 173 |

|                                                                       |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| By-elections for Hereditary Peers                                     | 174 |
| Conclusion                                                            | 177 |
| 8 The Long Stage Two: The Wakeham Commission and Beyond               | 179 |
| The Royal Commission on the Reform of the House of Lords              | 179 |
| Follow-up to the Royals Commissions's Report                          | 189 |
| 2001–05: Indecision, then a Surprising Move on Reform                 | 190 |
| Lords Reform in Labour's Third Term                                   | 200 |
| 2010: General Election and Coalition Government                       | 204 |
| Conclusion                                                            | 209 |
| 9 Reasons for Reform and Non-reform                                   | 211 |
| How and Why Does House of Lords Reform Reach the Cabinet's<br>Agenda? | 214 |
| How Do Proposals Change When Under Consideration?                     | 215 |
| How and Why Do Proposals Succeed or Fail?                             | 216 |
| Conclusion                                                            | 219 |
| Further Reading                                                       | 221 |
| <i>Bibliography</i>                                                   | 225 |
| <i>Index</i>                                                          | 241 |