

for the OECD for which warm thanks are due to Anne Carblanc and Michael Donohue.

Many persons have provided valuable assistance and suggestions over the course of this research, in particular the following: Marty Abrams; Amit Ashkenazi; Paula Bruening; Barbara Bucknell; Cédric Burton; Prof. Fred Cate; Malcolm Crompton; Gary T. Davis; Anne-Marije Fontein-Bijnsdorp; Clarisse Giro; Prof. Graham Greenleaf; Ayesha Hassan; Dr Jörg Hladjk; Yukiko Ko; Dr Waltraut Kotschy; John Kropf; Sophie Kwasny; Olivier Matter; Pablo Palazzi; Anna Pateraki; Jörg Polakiewicz; Kenneth Propp; Olivier Proust; Florence Raynal; Anne Ruwet; Dr Eva Souhrada-Kirchmayer; Blair Stewart; Jennifer Stoddart; Dan Jerker B. Svantesson; Dr Omer Tene; Richard Thomas; Micah Thorner; and Mason Weisz. Much background research was performed during a visitorship at the Oxford Internet Institute, to which I am grateful. Ruth Anderson and her colleagues at Oxford University Press also deserve my thanks for their help in bringing this book to fruition.

I am also indebted to the law firms of Hunton & Williams and Wilson, Sonsini, Goodrich & Rosati, to the members of the European Privacy Officers Forum (EPOF) and the European Privacy Advisory Group (EPAG), and to all my clients throughout the years, for helping me to learn about the practical side of transborder data flow regulation.

Special thanks are due to the Cambridge University Centre for European Legal Studies and to Wolfson College, Cambridge, where much of this book was written while a visiting fellow. I am deeply grateful to them, and in particular to Prof. Catherine Barnard of Trinity College, Cambridge.

I would also like to express my gratitude to Peter Hustinx for taking the time from his very busy schedule to write the foreword.

This book is largely based on my PhD dissertation for Tilburg Law School of Tilburg University, the Netherlands (with some changes and updating). Many thanks are due for the valuable input provided by the members of my PhD committee, namely Dr Lee Bygrave; Prof. Paul De Hert; Dr Lokke Moerel; and Prof. Dr Spiros Simitis. And fortunate is the PhD candidate with a supervisor like Prof. Corien Prins, whose encouragement, graciousness, insight, and patience have been both crucial and exemplary.

Analysis of the legal framework for data protection has too often neglected both the practicalities of how the law actually works and its international implications. If this book succeeds in illuminating transborder data flow regulation in light of the relevant practical issues and its global impact, then it will have made a contribution to a discussion that has frequently produced more heat than light.

Christopher Kuner

Brussels
December 2012

Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xi
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxi
1. Background and Introduction	1
A. Growth of transborder data flows	1
B. Growth of transborder data flow regulation	10
C. What are transborder data flows?	11
D. The changing role of the individual	14
E. Differentiating data transfers from 'mere transit'	15
F. Scope of the study	16
G. Towards a normative framework	19
2. International Regulation of Transborder Data Flows	25
A. Introduction	25
B. Early transborder data flow regulation	26
C. Protection of informational sovereignty	28
D. Free flow of data and freedom of information	31
E. Transborder data flows in international law	33
F. OECD Privacy Guidelines of 1980	35
G. Council of Europe Convention 108 and Additional Protocol	36
H. EU Data Protection Directive 95/46	40
I. APEC Privacy Framework	50
J. ECOWAS	51
K. World trade law	52
L. Organization of American States (OAS)	52
M. Data transfers by States, governments, and regulatory agencies	53
N. Madrid Resolution	58
O. Conclusions	58
3. Typology of Regulatory Approaches	61
A. Introduction	61
B. Differences between regulatory systems	61
C. Conclusions	79
4. National, Private Sector, and Technological Approaches	81
A. Introduction	81
B. Listing of national approaches	83
C. Private sector initiatives	92

D. Regulation through technology	96
E. Conclusions	99
5. Analysis of Underlying Policies	101
A. Introduction	101
B. Benefits and risks of transborder data flows	102
C. Underlying policies and corresponding risks	107
D. Conclusions	120
6. Applicable Law, Extraterritoriality, and Transborder Data Flows	121
A. Introduction	121
B. Transborder data flow regulation and applicable law rules	125
C. Extraterritorial application of fundamental rights law	129
D. Conflict of laws involving transborder data flow regulation	133
E. Example of Council of Europe Convention 108	138
F. Conclusions	141
7. Compliance and Enforcement	143
A. Introduction	143
B. Compliance responsibilities and informational requirements	144
C. Level of compliance and enforcement	146
D. Compliance in practice	148
E. Example of EU data protection law	151
F. Conclusions	154
8. A Global Regulatory Framework for Transborder Data Flows	157
A. Major trends and issues	157
B. Transborder data flow regulation as a form of legal pluralism	160
C. Suggestions for an improved regulatory framework	165
D. Concluding remarks	186
<i>Appendix: Data Protection and Privacy Law Instruments Regulating Transborder Data Flows (as of January 2013)</i>	189
<i>Bibliography</i>	257
<i>Index</i>	279

Table of Cases

European Court of Human Rights

Al-Jedda v United Kingdom (2011) 53 EHRR 23	129, 133, 139
Al-Skeini v United Kingdom (2011) 53 EHRR 18	129, 139
Amann v Switzerland (2000) 30 EHRR 843	37, 148
Dickson v United Kingdom (2008) 46 EHRR 927	115
Handyside v United Kingdom (1976) 1 EHRR 737	111
Kudla v Poland (2002) 35 EHRR 198	132
Rotaru v Romania (2000) ECHR 191	37, 62, 75
Z v Finland (1997) 25 EHRR 371	115
Z v United Kingdom (2002) 34 EHRR 97	115

European Union

European Court of Justice

Air Transport Association of America v Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change (C-366/10) [2012] CMLR 4	123, 181
ASNEF and FECEMD v Administración del Estado (C-468/10 & C-469/10) [2012] CMLR 48	26
Bavarian Lager (C-28/08) [2010] ECR I-6055	19
Boil Lindqvist (C-101/01) [2003] ECR I-12971	12, 13, 63, 174, 175, 182
Centros Ltd v Erhvervs-og Selskabsstyrelsen (C-212/97) [1999] ECR I-1459	109
Emsland-Stärke v Hauptzollamt Hamburg-Jonas (C-110/99) [2000] ECR I-11569	109
Google Spain, SL, Google Inc. v Agencia Española de Protección de Datos, Mario Costeja González (C-131/12)	127
Halifax plc v Customs and Excise Commissioners (C-255/02) [2006] ECR I-1609	109
Kadi & Al Barakaat Int'l Foundation v Council & Commission (C-402/05 & C-415/05) [2008] ECR I-6351	162, 183
Rechnungshof v Osterreichischer (C-465/00 & C-138/01) [2003] ECR I-4989	26, 62, 148
Volker und Markus Schecke v Land Hessen (C-92/09 & C-93/09) [2010] ECR I-11063	168, 169

Court of First Instance/General Court

Bavarian Lager v Commission (T-194/04) [2007] ECR II-4523	19
---	----

International Court of Justice

Case concerning Barcelona Traction, Light and Power Co. Ltd (Belgium v Spain) [1970] ICJ Reports 65	131
--	-----

Permanent Court of International Justice

SS Lotus (France v Turkey), PCIJ Reports, Series A, No.10, p 19 (1927)	131
--	-----

United States

Columbia Pictures, Inc. v Bunnell, 245 FRD 443, 69 FedRServ3d 173 (C.D. Cal. 2007)	18
Google Inc., In the Matter of, Docket No. C-4336, 13 October 2011, FTC	179
Volkswagen v Valdez, 909 SW2d 900 (Tex. 1995)	136