

## Acknowledgments

The following companies and persons kindly granted their permission to reproduce the materials for which they own copyright:

Australian Government Publishing Service for the material from Australian Tax Cases.

Butterworth & Co (Publishers) Ltd (UK) for the materials from All England Law Reports and Simon's Tax Cases.

Butterworths Pty Ltd (Australia) for the material from Australian Law Reports.

MA Olesnicki for an extract from his book Hong Kong tax.

The Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office for the materials from Tax Cases and CMD Papers.

The Hong Kong Government Information Services.

The Incorporated Council of Law Reporting for England and Wales for the materials from the Council's Law Reports and Weekly Law Reports.

The Law Book Company, North Ryde, New South Wales for the extracts from Commonwealth Law Reports.

West Publishing Company, St Paul, Minnesota for the material from Black's Law Dictionary.

## Contents

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <i>Preface to sixth edition</i>                                    | v         |
| <i>Preface to first edition</i>                                    | vii       |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>   | ix        |
| <i>Table of Cases</i>  | xv        |
| <i>Table of Board of Review Cases</i>                              | xxv       |
| <i>Table of Statutes</i>   | xxix      |
| <i>List of Abbreviations</i>                                       | xxxiii    |
| <br>   |           |
| <b>Chapter 1 Principles of Interpretation of Tax Legislation</b>   | <b>1</b>  |
| A. Legislative purpose   | 4         |
| B. An example  | 11        |
| C. Relevance of tax decisions from Commonwealth jurisdictions      | 12        |
| <br>   |           |
| <b>Chapter 2 Profits Tax: Trade, Profession or Business</b>        | <b>13</b> |
| A. Introduction to profits tax                                     | 13        |
| B. The definitions in section 2(1)                                 | 13        |
| C. Meaning of 'trade'  | 15        |
| 1. General meaning of 'trade'                                      | 15        |
| 2. The 'badges of trade'   | 17        |
| 3. The 'badges of trade' – summary and restatement                 | 28        |
| 4. Does it all depend on intention?                                | 32        |
| 5. Application of the general principles to land and share dealing | 39        |
| 6. Special considerations relating to a company                    | 42        |
| 7. Lack of profit motive   | 43        |
| 8. Hedge against inflation   | 43        |
| 9. Change of intention   | 44        |
| 10. Illustrative cases   | 48        |
| D. Meaning of 'business'   | 50        |
| 1. Definitions   | 50        |
| 2. Letting of property   | 52        |
| 3. Use of a corporate vehicle                                      | 55        |
| 4. Normal versus abnormal exploitation of property                 | 58        |
| 5. Continuity  | 59        |
| 6. Summary   | 59        |

|  |  |            |
|--|--|------------|
| E.   | Meaning of 'profession'                                | 60         |
| F.   | Cessation of a trade, profession or business           | 61         |
| <b>Chapter 3 Profits Tax: The Source Concept</b>             |  | <b>63</b>  |
| A.   | Business must be carried on in Hong Kong               | 63         |
| B.   | Profits must arise in or be derived from Hong Kong     | 73         |
| 1.   | 'Arise in' versus 'derived from'                       | 73         |
| 2.   | Generally  | 73         |
| 3.   | Services   | 80         |
| 4.   | Trading profits  | 92         |
| 5.   | Manufacturing  | 102        |
| 6.   | Exploitation of intellectual property                  | 105        |
| 7.   | Share dealing  | 108        |
| 8.   | Interest on loans                                      | 109        |
| 9.   | Concept of apportionment                               | 112        |
| 10.  | Deemed source  | 119        |
| 11.  | Inland Revenue Department practice                     | 120        |
| <b>Chapter 4 Profits Tax: Assessable Profits</b>             |  | <b>133</b> |
| A.   | Capital versus revenue receipts                        | 135        |
| B.   | Receipts of a compensatory nature: capital or revenue? | 146        |
| 1.   | Payment for covenant not to work or trade              | 147        |
| 2.   | Sterilisation of a capital asset                       | 148        |
| 3.   | Loss of profits  | 149        |
| 4.   | Cancellation of business contracts                     | 153        |
| C.   | Timing of assessability of trading receipts            | 158        |
| D.   | Trading stock  | 160        |
| 1.   | Adjustment of profits annually                         | 160        |
| 2.   | Deemed sales   | 164        |
| 3.   | Cessation of business                                  | 170        |
| E.   | Exempt receipts  | 170        |
| F.   | Special classes of business and taxpayers              | 172        |
| 1.   | Special classes of business                            | 172        |
| 2.   | Clubs and trade associations                           | 172        |
| 3.   | Partnerships   | 173        |
| 4.   | Husband and wife                                       | 174        |
| 5.   | Non-residents carrying on business in Hong Kong        | 174        |
| <b>Chapter 5 Profits Tax: Deductible Expenses and Losses</b> |  | <b>177</b> |
| A.   | Deductible expenses                                    | 177        |
| 1.   | Has an outgoing or expense been incurred?              | 178        |

|   |  |            |
|---|--|------------|
| 2.  | Effect of generally accepted accounting principles on deductibility              | 184        |
| 3.  | To what extent was the expense incurred in the production of chargeable profits? | 188        |
| 4.  | Was it capital in nature?  | 200        |
| 5.  | Was the expense a private or domestic expense?                                   | 212        |
| 6.  | Is the expense covered by a special provision?                                   | 215        |
| B.  | Losses   | 220        |
| 1.  | Losses of an individual  | 221        |
| 2.  | Losses of a corporation  | 221        |
| 3.  | Losses of a partnership  | 222        |
| <b>Chapter 6 Profits Tax: Depreciation Allowances</b> |  | <b>223</b> |
| A.  | Industrial buildings   | 223        |
| B.  | Commercial buildings   | 233        |
| C.  | Plant and machinery  | 235        |
| 1.  | Definition of 'plant'  | 238        |
| 2.  | Anti-avoidance provisions  | 248        |
| <b>Chapter 7 Property Tax</b>                         |  | <b>251</b> |
| A.  | Who is liable?   | 251        |
| B.  | Rate of property tax   | 252        |
| C.  | What land is caught?   | 252        |
| D.  | What amount is property tax levied on?   | 252        |
| 1.  | Consideration for the right to use land  | 253        |
| 2.  | Consideration 'payable' to the owner   | 253        |
| 3.  | Payable 'to, to the order of, or for the benefit of' the owner                   | 253        |
| 4.  | Payable in 'money or money's worth'  | 253        |
| 5.  | Payment for 'right to use' land  | 254        |
| 6.  | Payment for services   | 254        |
| 7.  | Payment of premiums  | 254        |
| 8.  | Use of 'land and/or buildings'   | 254        |
| E.  | Deductions from gross consideration  | 254        |
| 1.  | Advantage of using a service company   | 255        |
| 2.  | Irrecoverable rentals  | 255        |
| 3.  | Interest payments  | 255        |
| F.  | Relationship with profits tax  | 256        |
| 1.  | Companies  | 256        |
| 2.  | Individuals  | 256        |
| 3.  | Avoidance of double tax  | 256        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>Chapter 8 Salaries Tax</b>  | <b>261</b> |
| A. Employment or office versus trade, profession or business             | 262        |
| B. Does the income arise in Hong Kong?                                   | 273        |
| 1. Departmental Interpretation and Practice                              |            |
| Notes No 10: The Charge to Salaries Tax                                  | 282        |
| a. Basic charge – Employment   | 282        |
| b. Extension of charge – Employment                                      | 288        |
| c. Exclusion from charge – Employment                                    | 289        |
| d. Directors' fees   | 290        |
| e. Exclusion – Tax paid outside Hong Kong                                | 290        |
| C. Is the income from the employment?                                    | 302        |
| 1. Reimbursement of expenses   | 318        |
| 2. Assessability of income: fringe benefits                              | 320        |
| D. Statutory exemptions and other special provisions                     | 327        |
| 1. Share options   | 327        |
| 2. Housing benefits  | 331        |
| E. Deductibility of expenses   | 338        |
| F. Timing of receipt   | 347        |
| G. Personal allowances, personal assessment and concessionary deductions | 351        |
| <b>Chapter 9 Administration</b>  | <b>355</b> |
| A. Returns: Part IX, ss 51–58  | 355        |
| B. Assessments: Part X, ss 59–63 and 70                                  | 357        |
| C. Objections and appeals: Part XI, ss 64–70A                            | 364        |
| D. Payment of tax: Part XII, ss 71–77A                                   | 371        |
| E. Penalties: Part XIV, ss 80–84   | 372        |
| F. Advance rulings: s 88A and Schedule 10                                | 377        |
| <b>Chapter 10 Anti-Avoidance Rules and Doctrines</b>                     | <b>379</b> |
| A. Tax avoidance versus tax evasion                                      | 379        |
| B. Case law doctrines  | 381        |
| 1. Form over substance   | 381        |
| 2. Purposive interpretation  | 383        |
| C. Statutory anti-avoidance rules  | 395        |
| 1. Specific provisions   | 395        |
| 2. Specific anti-avoidance provisions                                    | 395        |
| 3. General anti-avoidance provisions                                     | 397        |
| <i>Reading and Resources List</i>  | 421        |
| <i>Index</i>   | 423        |

## Table of Cases

Page references printed in **bold type** indicate where the case is set out in part or in full

|   | PAGE           |   | PAGE                    |
|---|----------------|---|-------------------------|
| <b>A</b>  |                | <b>B</b>  |                         |
| A Solicitor v Law Society of Hong Kong [2008] 2 HKLRD 576, FACV No 24 of 2007           | 12             | Banin v MacKinlay [1985] 1 All ER 842                                   | 368                     |
| Abenheim, Re (1913) 109 LT 219  | 59             | Bank of India v Gobindram Naraindas Sadhwant [1988] 2 HKLR 262          | 284                     |
| AG v Ashton [1904] 2 Ch 621, [1906] AC 10   | 197            | Bank Voor Handel v Slatford [1952] 2 All ER 956                         | 263                     |
| AG v Chino Industries Ltd (in voluntary liquidation) [1997] HKLRD 833                   | 360            | Banque Nationale de Paris v IR (1985) 2 HKTC 139                        | 183                     |
| AL et al v The Commissioner of Income Tax [FATC Vol 2 at page 148]                      | 146            | Barclays Bank v Naylor [1961] 1 Ch 7, 39 TC 256                         | 318, 319, 325           |
| Alexander v Wallington General Commissioners [1993] STC 588                             | 357            | Barclays Mercantile Business Finance Ltd v Mawson [2002] All ER (D) 195 | 394                     |
| Allied Mills Industries Pty Ltd v FCT (1988) 19 ATR 1724, (1988) 83 ALR 368             | 154, 156       | Barr, Crombie & Co v IRC (1945) 26 TC 406                               | 155                     |
| American Leaf Blending Co Sdn Bhd v DGIR (Malaysia) [1978] 3 WLR 985, [1979] AC 676, PC | 42, 55, 56, 57 | Beak v Robson [1943] AC 352   | 147, 318                |
| Ammonia Soda Co Ltd v Chamberlain [1918] 1 Ch 266, [1918] 1 Ch D 286                    | 138, 206       | Beautiland Co Ltd v CIR [1991] 2 HKLR 511, PC                           | 33, 49                  |
| Anglo-French Exploration Co Ltd v Clayson (1956) 36 TC 545                              | 155            | Bennet v Marshall [1938] 1 KB 591, (1937) 22 TC 73                      | 275, 276, 279, 280, 281 |
| Anglo-Persian Oil Co Ltd v Dale [1932] 1 KB 124   | 203            | Benson (Inspector of Taxes) v Yard Arm Club Ltd (1979) 53 TC 67         | 242                     |
| Argosy Co Ltd v CIR (Guyana) [1971] 1 WLR 514, PC                                       | 360, 360       | Black Nominees Ltd v Nicol (1975) 50 TC 229                             | 384                     |
| Artemis, The [1983] HKLR 364  | 66             | Blake v Shaw (1860) John 732  | 238                     |
| Associated Portland Cement Manufacturers Ltd v IRC [1946] 1 All ER 68                   | 203            | BP Australia Ltd v Commissioner of Taxation [1966] AC 224, PC           | 205                     |
| Auckland Gas Co Ltd v CIR (NZ) [2000] 1 WLR 1783, [2000] STC 527, PC                    | 208            | Braitrim (Far East) Ltd v CIR (2012) CACV 45/2012                       | 249                     |
| Autoclenz v Belcher [2011] UKSC 41  | 270            | Brand Dragon Ltd v CIR (2002) HKRC 90, (2001) HCIA 2/2001               | 33, 36                  |
| Avco Financial Services Ltd v FCT 82 ATC 4246, (1983) 13 ATR 63                         | 210            | Bray v Best [1989] 1 WLR 167  | 351                     |
| Aviation Fuel Supply Company v CIR (2012) CACV 150/2011                                 | 149            | Bray v Colenbrander and Harvey v Breyfogle (1953) 34 TC 138             | 275, 279                |
|   |                | Brigg Neumann & Co v IRC (1928) 12 TC 1191                              | 162                     |
|   |                | British Insulated and Helsby Cables Ltd v Atherton [1926] AC 205        | 202, 206                |