

Contents

PAGE

<i>Preface</i>	v
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xiii
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	xxxiii
<i>Table of Foreign Legislation</i>	xxxix
<i>Table of Practice Directions</i>	xli
<i>Table of Conventions</i>	xlili

Chapter 1	Purpose of Administrative Law in Hong Kong	1
1.	Purpose of Administrative Law in Hong Kong	1
2.	Constitutional Basis for Judicial Review in Hong Kong	5
	(a) Ultra Vires Doctrine	6
	(b) Common Law Theory of Judicial Review	11
	(c) Alternatives to Ultra Vires and Common Law Theories: Rights-based Approach, Abuse of Power and Fairness	12
	(i) Rights-based Approach	12
	(ii) Abuse of Power	13
	(iii) Fairness	14
	(d) Conclusion	14
Chapter 2	Government in the Hong Kong SAR	17
1.	Introduction	17
2.	Before 1997: Colonial Government in Hong Kong	17
3.	1997, Basic Law and 'New' Government of Hong Kong	22
	(a) Implementing the New Government Structure: Challenges and Disappointments	26
4.	Nature of Government in Hong Kong Today	58
Chapter 3	Non-Judicial Controls on Government	63
1.	Introduction	63
2.	Relationship between Judicial Review and Non-Judicial Controls	63
3.	Red, Green and Amber Light Theories of Administrative Law	64
	(a) Red Light Theory	65
	(b) Green Light Theory	65
	(c) Amber Light Theory	66
4.	Non-Judicial Controls in Hong Kong	75
	(a) Tribunals	75
	(b) Commissions of Inquiry	90
	(c) Ombudsman	100
	(d) Political Accountability Through the Legislative Council	108
	(i) Questions During Legislative Council Meetings	109
	(ii) Special Committees/ Sub-Committees	109
	(iii) Special Powers and Privileges of the Legislative Council	110
Chapter 4	Procedural Exclusivity and Public-Private Divide	117
1.	Introduction	117

2. Exclusivity Principle.....	117
3. Exceptions to Exclusivity Principle.....	123
4. What is a 'Public Law' Matter?	134
5. Conclusion	147
Chapter 5 Leave and Standing.....	149
1. Introduction.....	149
2. Leave.....	149
(a) Threshold for Granting Leave: Potential Arguability.....	151
(b) Threshold for Granting Leave: Reasonable Arguability.....	156
(c) Procedural Issues at Leave Stage.....	165
3. Standing.....	167
(a) Rationale Behind Rules on Standing.....	168
(b) Starting Point for Rules on Standing: 'Sufficient Interest'.....	170
(c) Personal Standing.....	182
(d) Representative Standing.....	184
Chapter 6 Remedies.....	199
1. Introduction to Public and Private Law Remedies.....	199
2. Public Law Remedies.....	201
(a) Certiorari and Prohibition.....	201
(b) Mandamus.....	203
3. Private Law Remedies.....	204
(a) Declarations.....	204
(i) Academic or Hypothetical Declarations.....	206
(ii) Suspension of Declaration/Declarations of Temporary Validity.....	207
(b) Injunctions.....	208
(c) Damages.....	209
(i) Damages for Private Law Wrongs.....	209
(ii) Damages for Public Law Wrongs.....	211
4. Discretion to Refuse a Remedy.....	212
(a) Misconduct by the Applicant.....	212
(b) Futility.....	213
(i) Inapplicability or Impossibility of Relief.....	213
(ii) Interaction between Futility and Damages.....	215
(c) Delay.....	216
(d) Suitable Alternative Remedy.....	218
Chapter 7 Express and Implied Limits on Judicial Review.....	223
1. Introduction.....	223
2. Express Limits on Judicial Review.....	224
(a) Constitutional Institutions.....	224
(i) Acts of State.....	224
(ii) Prerogative of Mercy.....	226
(iii) Prosecutorial Discretion.....	230
(b) Statutory Limitation.....	242
(i) Time Limit Clauses.....	242
(ii) Ouster Clauses.....	243
(iii) Imprecise Statutory Provisions.....	256
3. Implied Limits on Judicial Review.....	262

(a) Expertise.....	262
(b) Polycentric Decisions/ Policy Formulation.....	263
Chapter 8 Procedural Impropriety.....	271
1. Introduction.....	271
2. Statutory Requirements.....	271
3. Common Law Principles of Natural Justice.....	276
(a) Right to a Fair Hearing.....	276
(b) Requirements for a Fair Hearing.....	283
(i) Notice and Hearing.....	283
(ii) Right to Challenge the Opposing Case.....	287
(iii) Legal Representation.....	290
(iv) Reasons.....	295
(c) Limits on the Right to a Fair Hearing.....	302
(i) National Security and Emergencies.....	302
(ii) Waiver.....	306
(d) Rule Against Bias.....	306
Chapter 9 Illegality.....	315
1. Introduction.....	315
2. Unfettered Statutory Discretion or Subjective Statutory Language.....	315
3. Improper Purpose.....	320
4. Excess of Power.....	329
5. Relevant and Irrelevant Considerations.....	334
6. Fettering Discretion.....	341
7. Wrongful Delegation.....	347
8. Error of Law and Jurisdiction.....	352
9. Error of Fact.....	361
10. Conclusion.....	366
Chapter 10 Irrationality.....	367
1. Introduction.....	367
2. Dual Use of Irrationality.....	367
3. Using Irrationality with Other Grounds of Review.....	370
(a) Relevancy of Considerations.....	371
(b) Material Error of Fact.....	379
(c) Irrationality as a Longstop for Other Grounds of Review.....	381
(d) Irrationality as a Tool for Statutory Interpretation.....	382
4. Irrationality as an Independent Ground of Review: Starting Point.....	384
5. Irrationality as an Independent Ground of Review: Use of the Original Threshold.....	387
(a) Exercises of Statutory Discretion.....	387
(b) Relative Expertise of Courts and the Decision Maker.....	389
(i) Allocation of Scarce Resources.....	389
(ii) Specialist Areas of Policy: Planning and Immigration.....	389
(iii) Disciplinary Bodies.....	391
(c) Decisions Subject to Political Control.....	392

6. Irrationality as an Independent Ground of Review: Heightened Scrutiny (1) – Non-rights Cases	393
7. Irrationality as an Independent Ground of Review: Heightened Scrutiny (2) – Human Rights Cases	396
(a) Approach 1: Amendment of Original Wednesbury Test and Use of Anxious Scrutiny	396
(b) Approach 2: Assimilation of Proportionality and Irrationality	400
(c) Approach 3: Approach in Hong Kong	402
8. Irrationality as an Independent Ground of Review: Evaluation	405
Chapter 11 Proportionality	411
1. Introduction	411
2. Nature of Proportionality	411
3. Uses of Proportionality	412
(a) Proportionality and Procedural Impropriety	412
(b) Proportionality and Substantive Legitimate Expectations	417
(c) Proportionality and Statutory Interpretation	419
(d) Proportionality and Penalties	423
4. Future of Proportionality	425
Chapter 12 Human Rights and Judicial Review	433
1. Introduction	433
2. System of Rights Protection in Hong Kong: BORO, Basic Law and the ICCPR	433
(a) Rights in BORO and the Basic Law	433
(b) 'Incorporation' of the ICCPR by BORO and the Basic Law	434
(c) Constitutional Significance of BORO	435
3. Assessing Restrictions on Rights: General Approach	436
4. Assessing Restrictions on Rights: Interpretation of Rights	438
5. Assessing Restrictions on Rights: Justifying Infringements (1) – Proportionality and Other Tests	443
6. Assessing Restrictions on Rights: Justifying Restrictions (2) – Margin of Appreciation	454
7. Assessing Restrictions on Rights: Remedies	466
Chapter 13 Legitimate Expectations	483
1. Introduction	483
2. How Legitimate Expectations Arise	484
3. Protection of Legitimate Expectations	499
Index	517

TABLE OF CASES

A

A Company, In re [1981] AC 374	355
Abbasi v Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs [2002] EWCA 1598	224
Airedale N.H.S. Trust v Bland [1993] AC 789	207
Aita Bahadur Limbu v Director of Immigration HCAL 133/1999, 10 December 1999, CFI	390
Aita Bahadur Limbu v Director of Immigration HCAL 133/1999, 10 December 1999, CFI	153
Akram v Secretary for Security [2000] 1 HKLRD 164	249
Alconbury Developments Ltd & Ors v Secretary of State for the Environment, Transport and the Regions [2003] 2 AC 295, HL	338
American Cyanamid Co v Ethicon Ltd [1975] AC 396	209
Amoy Properties Ltd v The Committee for Takeovers and Mergers and the Commissioner for Securities [1989] 1 HKLR 170 (HC)	314
An Bord Bainne Cooperative Ltd v Milk Marketing Board [1984] 2 CMLR 584	128, 130
Anderson Asphalt & Ors v The Secretary for Justice [2009] HKCU 378 CFI	134, 140
Anderson Asphalt and Others v Town Planning Board and Another [2007] 3 HKLRD 18, CA	181, 182
Anisminic Ltd v Foreign Compensation Commission (No 2) [1969] 1 All ER 208	250, 251, 252, 253, 255
Anisminic Ltd v Foreign Compensation Commission [1969] 2 AC 147, HL	243, 353, 355, 356, 358, 359
Apple Daily Ltd v Commissioner of the Independent Commission against Corruption [2000] 1 HKC 295	202
Armah v Government of Ghana [1966] 3 All ER 177	245
Ashbury Railway Carriage and Iron Co Ltd v Riche (1875) LR 7 HL 653	330
Asia Master Ltd v Commissioner of Inland Revenue [2006] HKEC 2187 CFA	218
Associated Provincial Picture Houses Ltd v Wednesbury Corp [1947] 2 All ER 680, [1948] 1 KB 223	6, 354, 368, 373, 376, 382, 384, 386, 387, 389, 399, 427, 503, 510, 512
Association of Expatriate Civil Servants of Hong Kong v Secretary for the Civil Service (1996) 6 HKPLR 333	403, 404
Attorney General of Hong Kong v Ng Yuen Shiu [1983] 2 AC 629	503
Attorney-General of Hong Kong v Ng Yuen Shiu [1983] 2 All ER 346, PC	347
Attorney-General of Hong Kong v Ng Yuen Shiu [1983] HKC 23	500
Attorney-General v Fulham Corp [1912] 1 Ch 440	330
Attorney-General v Great Eastern Ry Co (1880) 5 App Cas 473	330
Attorney-General v Ng Yuen Shiu [1983] 2 AC 629, PC	281
Au Kwok Hung, Re [2001] 1 HKLRD 169	274
Auckland Casino Ltd v Casino Control Authority [1995] 1 NZLR 142	308

B

Barnard v National Dock Labour Board [1953] 2 QB 18, CA	350–351
Bhagat Singh v King-Emperor (1931) LR 58 IA 169 (PC)	305