

## Table of Contents

<b>Bibliography</b> .....	XVII
<b>List of Abbreviations</b> .....	XXIX
<b>1 Introduction</b> .....	1
1.1 Methodology, Scope and Aim of the Study .....	1
1.2 Outline of the Study .....	2
1.2.1 The Different Parts .....	2
1.2.2 The Comparative Research .....	2
1.2.3 Distribution of Responsibilities .....	5
<b>2 Executive Summary</b> .....	7
2.1 General Assessment .....	7
2.2 The Scope of the Regulation .....	7
2.2.1 Main Issues .....	7
2.2.1.1 The Definition of Insolvency Proceedings .....	7
2.2.1.2 The Insolvency of Private Individuals and Self-employed Persons .....	8
2.2.1.3 The Exception Rule of Article 1 (2) EIR .....	8
2.2.1.4 Absence of Provisions for the Recognition of Insolvency Proceedings Opened outside the EU or the Coordination between Proceedings inside and outside the EU .....	9
2.2.2 Policy Options and Recommendations .....	9
2.2.2.1 The Definition of Insolvency Proceedings .....	9
2.2.2.2 The Coordination between Article 1 (1) EIR and Annex A .....	9
2.2.2.3 The Exception Rule of Article 1 (2) EIR .....	10
2.3 Pre-insolvency and Hybrid Proceedings not Listed in the Annex A of the EIR .....	10
2.4 Article 3 EIR .....	11
2.4.1 The COMI of Corporations .....	12
2.4.2 The COMI of Natural Persons .....	12
2.4.3 Improving the Procedural Framework .....	12
2.4.4 Territorial Proceedings (Articles 3 (2) – (4) EIR) .....	14
2.5 Insolvency-related Actions (Article 3 a EIR) .....	14
2.5.1 Main Issues .....	14
2.5.2 Policy Options and Recommendations .....	15
2.6 Groups of Companies .....	15
2.7 Applicable Law .....	17
2.7.1 Article 4 EIR .....	17
2.7.2 Articles 5 and 7 EIR .....	17
2.7.3 Article 6 EIR .....	17
2.7.4 Article 8 EIR .....	17
2.7.5 Article 9 EIR .....	17
2.7.6 Article 10 EIR .....	18
2.7.7 Article 11 EIR .....	18
2.7.8 Article 12 EIR .....	18
2.7.9 Article 13 EIR .....	18
2.7.10 Article 14 EIR .....	19
2.7.11 Article 15 EIR .....	19
2.8 Coordination of Proceedings .....	19
2.9 Lodgement of Claims – Main Findings .....	21
2.9.1 Substantial Issues .....	21
2.9.2 Procedural Issues .....	22

## Table of Contents

<b>3 Scope of the Regulation</b> .....	24
3.1 Underlying Policies .....	24
3.2 Main Issues .....	25
3.2.1 The Definition of Insolvency Proceedings .....	25
3.2.2 The Insolvency of Private Individual and Self-employed Persons .....	29
3.2.3 The Exception Rule of Article 1 (2) EIR .....	30
3.2.4 Absence of Provisions for the Recognition of Insolvency Proceedings Opened outside the EU or the Coordination between Proceedings inside and outside the EU .....	31
3.3 National Legislation and Case-Law .....	32
3.3.1 Pre-insolvency and Hybrid Proceedings in EU-Member States .....	32
3.3.1.1 Austria .....	32
3.3.1.2 Belgium .....	32
3.3.1.3 Czech Republic .....	35
3.3.1.4 France .....	35
3.3.1.5 Germany .....	36
3.3.1.6 Greece .....	37
3.3.1.7 Italy .....	38
3.3.1.8 Latvia .....	38
3.3.1.9 Malta .....	39
3.3.1.10 Netherlands .....	39
3.3.1.11 Poland .....	39
3.3.1.12 Romania .....	40
3.3.1.13 Spain .....	40
3.3.1.14 Sweden .....	41
3.3.1.15 United Kingdom (England and Wales) .....	41
3.3.2 Assessment: Common Features of Pre-insolvency and Hybrid Proceedings .....	43
3.3.3 Insolvency Proceedings of Consumers and of Self-Employed Persons .....	45
3.3.3.1 Austria .....	45
3.3.3.2 Belgium .....	46
3.3.3.3 Bulgaria .....	46
3.3.3.4 Cyprus .....	46
3.3.3.5 Czech Republic .....	46
3.3.3.6 Estonia .....	46
3.3.3.7 Finland .....	47
3.3.3.8 France .....	47
3.3.3.9 Germany .....	47
3.3.3.10 Greece .....	47
3.3.3.11 Hungary .....	48
3.3.3.12 Ireland .....	48
3.3.3.13 Italy .....	48
3.3.3.14 Latvia .....	49
3.3.3.15 Lithuania .....	49
3.3.3.16 Luxembourg .....	49
3.3.3.17 Malta .....	50
3.3.3.18 Netherlands .....	50
3.3.3.19 Poland .....	51
3.3.3.20 Portugal .....	51
3.3.3.21 Romania .....	52
3.3.3.22 Slovakia .....	52
3.3.3.23 Slovenia .....	53
3.3.3.24 Spain .....	53
3.3.3.25 Sweden .....	53
3.3.3.26 United Kingdom (England and Wales) .....	54
3.3.4 Assessment of the Findings of the National Reports .....	54
3.3.5 Absence of Provisions for Proceedings Opened outside the EU and for the Coordination of Proceedings inside and outside of the European Union .....	56
3.3.5.1 Austria .....	56

## Table of Contents

3.3.5.2 Belgium .....	56
3.3.5.3 Estonia .....	57
3.3.5.4 Finland .....	57
3.3.5.5 France .....	57
3.3.5.6 Germany .....	58
3.3.5.7 Greece .....	59
3.3.5.8 Hungary .....	59
3.3.5.9 Italy .....	59
3.3.5.10 Latvia .....	60
3.3.5.11 Lithuania .....	60
3.3.5.12 Malta .....	60
3.3.5.13 Netherlands .....	61
3.3.5.14 Poland .....	61
3.3.5.15 Romania .....	61
3.3.5.16 Slovakia .....	62
3.3.5.17 Slovenia .....	62
3.3.5.18 Spain .....	62
3.3.5.19 Sweden .....	62
3.3.5.20 United Kingdom (England and Wales) .....	62
3.3.6 Assessment: the Application of the EIR with Regard to Third States .....	63
3.4 Policy Options .....	63
3.4.1 Extention of the Regulation to Pre-insolvency Proceedings .....	63
3.4.2 Improving the Interfaces between the Definitions in Articles 1 and 2 and the Annexes to the EIR .....	65
3.5 Recommendations .....	67
<b>4 Jurisdiction</b> .....	<b>69</b>
4.1 Article 3 EIR: Definition and Determination of the Centre of Main Interests .....	69
4.1.1 Underlying Policies .....	69
4.1.2 Main Issues .....	71
4.1.2.1 COMI of Corporations .....	72
4.1.2.2 COMI of Individual Persons .....	74
4.1.2.3 Relocation Cases .....	75
4.1.2.4 Territorial Proceedings .....	76
4.1.3 The Application of the Regulation in the Member States .....	78
4.1.3.1 The COMI of Corporations .....	78
4.1.3.2 The COMI of Natural Persons .....	92
4.1.3.3 Investigation <i>ex officio</i> .....	96
4.1.3.4 Relocation Cases .....	97
4.1.3.5 Territorial Proceedings .....	103
4.1.3.6 Policy Options and Recommendations .....	109
4.1.3.7 Territorial Proceedings (Articles 3 (2) – (4) EIR) .....	111
4.2 Annex Proceedings .....	112
4.2.1 Introduction and Underlying Policy .....	112
4.2.2 The Case-Law of the ECJ .....	114
4.2.2.1 Gourdain v. Nadler .....	114
4.2.2.2 Seagon v. Deko Marty Belgium .....	115
4.2.2.3 SCT Industri AB i likvidation v. Alpenblume AB .....	116
4.2.2.4 German Graphics Graphische Maschinen GmbH v. Alice van der Schee, acting as liquidator of Holland Binding BV .....	116
4.2.2.5 F-Tex SIA v. Lietuvos-Anglijos UAB “Jadecloud-Vilma” .....	117
4.2.2.6 ERSTE Bank Hungary Nyrt v. Magyar Állam, BCL Trading GmbH, ERSTE Befektetési Zrt .....	117
4.2.2.7 Rastelli v. Hidoux .....	118
4.2.2.8 Pending Cases .....	118
4.2.3 The Implementation of the ECJ’s Ruling in the Member States .....	119
4.2.4 Methodological Aspects .....	122
4.2.5 Delimitation between the Scope of the EIR and the Brussels I Regulation .....	124
4.2.5.1 Principles .....	124

## Table of Contents

4.2.5.2 Key Criteria .....	125
4.2.5.3 The Objective Scope of the <i>vis attractiva concursus</i> : Examples of Specific Types of Actions .....	128
4.2.6 Exclusive or Elective Jurisdiction .....	141
4.2.6.1 Current Legal Situation .....	141
4.2.6.2 Policy Options .....	142
4.2.6.3 Related Claims and Jurisdiction on the ground of Connectedness .....	143
4.2.7 Annex Proceedings Related to Secondary or Territorial Insolvency Proceedings ..	145
4.2.8 Conflicting Proceedings and Decisions .....	145
4.2.9 Annex Proceedings Against Third State Defendants on the Example of Avoidance Actions .....	146
4.2.9.1 General Remarks .....	146
4.2.9.2 Annex Jurisdiction in Cases Related to Third States? .....	148
4.2.10 Recommendations .....	151
<b>5 Groups of Companies</b> .....	<b>153</b>
5.1 The Problem .....	153
5.1.1 General .....	153
5.1.1.1 Status Quo: No Specific Provisions in the EIR .....	153
5.1.1.2 The Need for Legislation .....	153
5.1.1.3 Groups of Companies Come in All Shapes and Sizes .....	154
5.1.1.4 Respect Company Law .....	155
5.2 Ways to Improve Coordination .....	157
5.2.1 General .....	157
5.2.2 Coordination between Insolvency Proceedings against Group Companies .....	158
5.2.2.1 General .....	158
5.2.2.2 “Soft” Coordination .....	159
5.2.2.3 Who Could Take the Lead? .....	159
5.2.2.4 A Market Economy Oriented Approach to Group of Companies Insolvencies .....	162
5.2.3 From “Head Office” to “Group COMI”? .....	162
5.2.3.1 The Head Office Approach .....	162
5.2.3.2 <i>Eurofood</i> : Hard Case: Make Bad Law .....	164
5.2.3.3 <i>Interedil</i> : The Return of Pragmatism .....	165
5.2.3.4 Safeguarding the <i>Interedil</i> Approach: One Step in the Right Direction .....	166
<b>6 Applicable Law</b> .....	<b>168</b>
6.1 Article 4 EIR: Applicability of the Law of the State of the Opening of the Proceedings ( <i>Thomas Pfeiffer</i> ) .....	168
6.1.1 The General Principle .....	168
6.1.2 Qualification .....	169
6.1.2.1 General Aspects .....	169
6.1.2.2 Scope in Relation to Company Law .....	171
6.1.3 Other Questions Relating to General Concepts of Private International Law .....	172
6.1.4 Specific Issues .....	173
6.1.4.1 Determination of the Debtor (Article 4(2)(a)) .....	173
6.1.4.2 Determination of the Assets Belonging to the Estate (Article 4(2)(b)) .....	173
6.1.4.3 Powers of the Debtor and the Liquidator (Article 4(2)(c)) .....	174
6.1.4.4 Conditions for Set-off (Article 4(2)(d)) .....	174
6.1.4.5 Effects of Insolvency Proceedings on Current Contracts (Article 4(2)(e)) ..	174
6.1.4.6 Effects of the Insolvency Proceedings on Individual Proceedings not Pending (Article 4(2)(f)) .....	175
6.1.4.7 Treatment of Claims against Estate and Debtor (Article 4(2)(g)) .....	175
6.1.4.8 Lodging, Verification and Admission of Claims (Article 4(2)(h)) .....	176
6.1.4.9 Distribution, Ranking and Set-off Article (4(2)(i)) .....	176
6.1.4.10 Conditions for and the Effects of Closure of Insolvency Proceedings (Article 4(2)(j)) .....	176
6.1.4.11 Creditors’ Rights after the Closure of Insolvency Proceedings (Article 4(2)(k)) .....	176

## Table of Contents

6.1.4.12 Costs and Expenses (Article 4(2)(l)) .....	176
6.1.4.13 Voidness, Voidability or Unenforceability of Legal Acts Detrimental To All Creditors (Article 4(2)(m)) .....	176
6.1.4.14 Applicability in Primary and Secondary Proceedings .....	176
6.2 Article 5 EIR: Third Parties' <i>rights in rem</i> (Andreas Piekenbrock) .....	177
6.2.1 The Underlying Policy .....	177
6.2.2 The Main Issues .....	178
6.2.2.1 How to Achieve the Policy Goals? .....	178
6.2.2.2 Scope of Application .....	178
6.2.2.3 Localisation of Intangible Assets .....	179
6.2.2.4 Adjustment, Reduction or Discharge of the Secured Claim .....	179
6.2.3 ECJ Case-Law .....	180
6.2.4 Implementation by the Member States .....	180
6.2.4.1 Practical Problems Reported .....	181
6.2.4.2 The National Legal Context on <i>rights in rem</i> .....	184
6.2.5 Discussion .....	187
6.2.5.1 The First Issue: How to Achieve the Policy Goals? .....	187
6.2.5.2 Discussion of the Other Issues .....	194
6.2.6 Recommendations .....	197
6.3 Article 6 EIR: Set-off (Andreas Piekenbrock) .....	198
6.3.1 The Underlying Policy .....	198
6.3.2 The Main Issues .....	198
6.3.2.1 Third-State-Cases .....	198
6.3.2.2 Applicability to Netting Agreements .....	198
6.3.3 Implementation of Article 6 by the Member States .....	199
6.3.3.1 Practical Problems Reported .....	199
6.3.3.2 The National Legal Framework on Set off .....	199
6.3.4 Recommendations .....	202
6.4 Article 7 EIR: Reservation of Title (Andreas Piekenbrock) .....	202
6.4.1 The Underlying Policy .....	202
6.4.2 The Main Issue .....	202
6.4.3 ECJ Case-Law .....	202
6.4.4 Implementation by the Member States .....	203
6.4.5 Discussion .....	203
6.4.5.1 Case 1 .....	203
6.4.5.2 Case 2 .....	204
6.4.6 Recommendations .....	204
6.5 Article 8 EIR: Contracts Relating to Immoveable Property (Andreas Piekenbrock) .....	204
6.5.1 Underlying Policy .....	204
6.5.2 Discussion .....	205
6.5.3 Recommendation .....	205
6.6 Article 9 EIR: Payment Systems and Financial Markets (Thomas Pfeiffer) .....	205
6.7 Article 10 EIR: Employment Contracts (Thomas Pfeiffer) .....	206
6.7.1 Employment Law Standards and Insolvency .....	206
6.7.1.1 General Aspects .....	206
6.7.1.2 Transfer of an Undertaking .....	207
6.7.2 Issues of Qualification .....	207
6.7.3 Issues of Assimilation (Adaptation) .....	207
6.7.4 Coordination with Guarantee Institutions .....	208
6.8 Article 11 EIR: Effects on Rights Subject to Registration (Andreas Piekenbrock) .....	208
6.8.1 Underlying Policy .....	208
6.8.2 Discussion .....	209
6.8.3 Recommendation .....	209
6.9 Article 12 EIR: Community Patents and Trade Marks (Robert Magnus) .....	209
6.9.1 Scope and Underlying Policy .....	209
6.9.2 Article 12 EIR and Article 5 EIR .....	211
6.9.3 Article 12 EIR and Article 3 (4) lit a) EIR .....	212
6.9.4 Recommendation .....	212

## Table of Contents

6.10 Article 13 EIR: Avoidance, Avoidability and Voidness ( <i>Thomas Pfeiffer</i> ) .....	213
6.10.1 General Questions .....	213
6.10.2 Need for an Abolishment or Limitation of Article 13 EIR? .....	213
6.10.2.1 Legitimate Expectations of the Parties .....	213
6.10.2.2 Complexity of the Provision? .....	214
6.10.2.3 Fraudulent Manipulations? .....	214
6.10.2.4 The Proposal to Protect against Changes of the COMI Only .....	215
6.10.2.5 Result .....	215
6.10.3 Need for an Extension? .....	215
6.11 Article 14 EIR: Protection of Third-party Purchasers ( <i>Andreas Piekenbrock</i> ) .....	216
6.11.1 Underlying Policy .....	216
6.11.2 Main Issue .....	216
6.11.3 Implementation in the Member States .....	216
6.11.4 Discussion .....	216
6.11.5 Recommendation .....	217
6.12 Article 15 EIR: Effect of the Insolvency Proceedings on Individual Proceedings in Other Member States ( <i>Thomas Pfeiffer</i> ) .....	217
6.12.1 Information Problem .....	217
6.12.2 Qualification Issues .....	218
6.12.3 Arbitration .....	218
<b>7 Coordination of Proceedings</b> .....	<b>219</b>
7.1 General .....	219
7.2 Tools .....	220
7.2.1 Jurisdiction .....	220
7.2.1.1 Uniform Law as Tool of Coordination: The COMI .....	220
7.2.1.2 Territorial Proceedings .....	221
7.2.1.3 Coordination of Putative Main Proceedings .....	223
7.2.1.4 Jurisdiction for Insolvency-Related Litigation .....	229
7.2.2 Recognition .....	229
7.2.3 Applicable Law .....	232
7.3 Coordination of Main and Secondary Proceedings .....	234
7.3.1 Politics as the <i>Raison d'Être</i> for Secondary Proceedings .....	234
7.3.1.1 Universality and Territorial Sovereignty .....	234
7.3.1.2 Recital 19: The Truth Well Told .....	234
7.3.1.3 "The Protection of Local Interest": An Opaque Approach .....	236
7.3.1.4 Secondary Proceedings in Practice .....	237
7.3.1.5 Two Options: Reduction of Secondary Proceedings and Improvement of Coordination .....	240
7.3.2 Opening of Secondary Proceedings .....	241
7.3.2.1 The Right to Apply for Secondary Proceedings .....	241
7.3.2.2 The Opening Procedure .....	241
7.3.2.3 Requirements for the Opening of Secondary Proceedings .....	242
7.3.2.4 Undertakings in Order to Avoid Secondary Proceedings .....	243
7.3.3 Coordination of Parallel Proceedings .....	244
7.3.3.1 General .....	244
7.3.3.2 Duties under Art 31 EIR .....	246
7.3.3.3 Cooperation between Courts or Liquidators and Courts .....	246
7.3.3.4 Poor Excuses for Non-Cooperation .....	248
7.3.3.5 Art 33 EIR: The Mechanism for Resolving Disputes between the Main and the Secondary Liquidator .....	248
7.3.3.6 Secondary Proceedings: Not Necessarily Winding-Up Proceedings .....	251
<b>8 Information for Creditors and Lodging of Claims</b> .....	<b>253</b>
8.1 Introduction .....	253
8.2 Regulatory Framework and Underlying Policies .....	253
8.3 Main Issues .....	255
8.3.1 Challenges of Ensuring a Pan-European Notification of Creditors .....	255
8.3.1.1 Application of Articles 40 and 42 (1) EIR in Practice .....	255

## Table of Contents

8.3.1.2 Public Register as Information Tool .....	257
8.3.2 Procedural Intricacies of the (Transnational) Lodging of Claims .....	259
8.3.3 Lodging of Claims: Substantive Issues .....	262
8.4 Conclusion and Policy Options .....	263
<b>9 The Recognition of Decisions on Insolvency Proceedings under the European Insolvency Regulation .....</b>	<b>264</b>
9.1 Automatic Recognition of Decisions Opening Insolvency Proceedings (Article 16) .....	265
9.1.1 Problems Concerning the Recognition of Decisions Opening Insolvency Proceedings .....	265
9.1.1.1 Austria .....	265
9.1.1.2 Belgium .....	266
9.1.1.3 France .....	266
9.1.1.4 Germany .....	266
9.1.1.5 Poland .....	266
9.1.1.6 Slovakia .....	267
9.1.1.7 Spain .....	267
9.1.2 Practical Problems Concerning the Recognition of Decisions Opening Insolvency Proceedings .....	267
9.1.2.1 Belgium .....	267
9.1.2.2 United Kingdom (England and Wales) .....	268
9.1.2.3 Estonia .....	268
9.1.2.4 Germany .....	268
9.1.2.5 Latvia .....	268
9.1.2.6 Poland .....	269
9.2 The Public Policy Exception (Article 26 EIR) .....	269
9.2.1 General .....	269
9.2.2 The Application of the Public Policy Exception in the EU-Member States .....	270
9.2.2.1 Austria .....	270
9.2.2.2 Belgium .....	271
9.2.2.3 France .....	271
9.2.2.4 Germany .....	271
9.2.2.5 Lithuania .....	272
9.2.2.6 Poland .....	272
<b>Index .....</b>	<b>273</b>
<b>Annex – Systematic Summary of National Reports .....</b>	<b>285</b>
<b>Annex – Systematic Compilation of Case-Law .....</b>	<b>725</b>