

The International Survey of Family Law

2014 Edition

<http://www.pbookshop.com>

<http://www.pbookshop.com>

The International Survey of Family Law

Published on behalf of the International Society of Family Law

2014 Edition

General Editor

Bill Atkin

Faculty of Law

Victoria University of Wellington

PO Box 600

Wellington

New Zealand

Associate Editor (Africa)

Fareda Banda

Reader in the Laws of Africa

School of Oriental and African Studies

London



Family Law

Published by Family Law
a publishing imprint of
Jordan Publishing Limited
21 St Thomas Street
Bristol BS1 6JS

Whilst the publishers and the author have taken every care in preparing the material included in this work, any statements made as to the legal or other implications of particular transactions are made in good faith purely for general guidance and cannot be regarded as a substitute for professional advice. Consequently, no liability can be accepted for loss or expense incurred as a result of relying in particular circumstances on statements made in this work.

© Jordan Publishing Limited 2014

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any way or by any means, including photocopying or recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher.

Crown Copyright material is reproduced with kind permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978 1 84661 991 5

<http://www.pbookshop.com>

Typeset by Letterpart Limited, Caterham on the Hill, Surrey CR3 5XL

Printed in Great Britain by Hobbs the Printers Limited, Totton, Hampshire SO40 3WX

CONTENTS

The International Society of Family Law – Members	xvii
The International Society of Family Law – Overview	xxiii
Preface	xxvii
Australia	
Gender Identity Dysphoria Update and Developments in Property Settlement Law	1
<i>Lisa Young</i>	
I Introduction	1
II Special medical procedures and gender identity dysphoria: an update	3
III The process for resolving property disputes	7
IV Big money cases – where to now?	11
V Conclusion	20
Brazil	
Same-Sex Families in Brazil: An Overview after the Trial of ADI 4277 and ADPF 132 by the Supreme Court	23
<i>Marianna Chaves</i>	
I Introduction	23
II Right to diversity, and free sexual orientation	25
III The homo-affective union as a family	26
IV Stable union and marriage	28
V Same-sex adoption	30
VI Conclusion	31
Canada	
Unmarried Cohabitation in Quebec – Libert� ou �galit�?	33
<i>Martha Bailey</i>	
I Introduction	33
II Limited statutory coverage for unmarried cohabitation	34
III The Supreme Court	36
IV Lev Tahor, child abuse, and escape from the jurisdiction	39

Chile	
The Mapuches and Chilean Family Law	45
<i>Ursula Pohl</i>	
China	
Empirical Research on Judicial Practice of the Post-divorce Relief System – Targeted on Sampled Cases Handled in a Grass-roots People’s Court in Chongqing in 2010–2012	51
<i>Wei Chen, Lei Shi and Wenjun He</i>	
I Overview of the survey of China’s judicial practice of the post-divorce relief	51
(a) Survey background	51
(b) Survey targets	52
(c) Survey methods	52
II Statistics of judicial practice of the post-divorce relief system in China	53
(a) The basic information of divorce cases’ parties	53
(i) Parties’ gender	53
(ii) Parties’ age	54
(iii) Length of marriage	55
(iv) Divorcees’ professions	56
(b) Petitioners’ grounds for divorce	58
(c) How divorce cases closed	58
(d) Claims for divorce damages	59
(e) Claims for divorce financial assistance	61
(f) Claims for economic compensation	62
III Inadequacies of post-divorce relief system and its judicial practice in China	63
(a) Lack of gender awareness of some judges	63
(b) Difficulties in proving divorce damages	64
(c) Strict conditions applying to financial assistance after divorce	64
(d) Limited application of post-divorce economic compensation	66
IV Proposals on the post-divorce relief system and its judicial practice	67
(a) Strengthening training of judges in gender theory	67
(b) Establishing family courts	67
(c) Improving the burden of proof in cases concerning divorce damages	68
(d) Reframing the standard to determine ‘living difficulties’ in post-divorce financial assistance	69
(e) Expanding the scope of application of post-divorce economic compensation	69
Czech Republic	
New Family Law in the Czech Republic: Back to Traditions and Towards Modern Trends	71
<i>Zdeňka Králíčková</i>	
I Introduction	71

II	Principles of new civil and family law	72
III	Marriage, cohabitation and registered partnership	74
	(a) General	74
	(b) Solemnisation of marriage	75
	(c) Rights and duties of spouses	77
	(d) Dissolution of marriage	80
	(e) Legal consequences of dissolution of marriage	82
IV	Kinship and parenthood	84
	(a) General	84
	(b) Motherhood	84
	(c) Fatherhood	86
	(d) Adoption	87
	(i) Adoption of minors	87
	(ii) Adoption of adults	90
	(e) Parental responsibility	90
	(f) Maintenance duty towards children	93
V	Conclusion	94
England and Wales		
The Battle for Parenthood – Lesbian Mothers and Biological Fathers		97
<i>Mary Welstead</i>		
I	Introduction	98
II	The six cases	100
	(a) <i>Re D (Contact and PR: Lesbian mothers and known father)</i> (No 2)(2006)	100
	(i) The facts	100
	(ii) The decision in 2001	100
	(iii) The decision in 2006	100
	(iv) Comment	102
	(b) <i>Re B (Role of Biological Father (sub nom TJ v CV, S and BA))</i> (2008)	103
	(i) The facts	103
	(ii) The decision	103
	(iii) Comment	106
	(c) <i>T v T (shared residence)</i> (2011)	107
	(i) The facts	107
	(ii) The County Court judgment	107
	(iii) The decision in the Appeal Court	107
	(iv) Comment	109
	(d) <i>ML and AR v RW and SW</i> (2011)	110
	(i) The facts	110
	(ii) The decision	111
	(iii) Comment	113
	(e) <i>A v B and C (Lesbian co-parents: role of father)</i> (2012)	113
	(i) The facts	113
	(ii) The decision in the High Court	114
	(iii) The decision in the Court of Appeal	115
	(iv) Comment	118

(f)	<i>Re G (a child) (sperm donor: contact order); Re Z (a child) (sperm donor: contact order) (2013)</i>	118
(i)	The Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 2008	118
(ii)	The facts in <i>Re G</i>	119
(iii)	The facts in <i>Re Z</i>	121
(iv)	The conjoined decision	122
(v)	Comment	123
III	Conclusion	124
France		
A Chronicle of French Family Law		127
<i>Centre for Family Law, University Jean Moulin, Lyon</i>		
I	Misadventures of the ‘great family law’: a French comedy (Hugues Fulchiron)	128
II	Conformity with the Constitution of the monopoly of marriage in the granting of a residence permit to the foreign spouse of a French national (Aurélien Molière)	129
III	Abortion – on the proposal to eliminate the ‘woman in distress’ circumstance (Jezabel Jannot)	131
IV	Premises for a reform of family court proceedings? About the report on ‘The 21st century Judge’ (Marine Bathias)	134
(a)	Divorce by mutual consent: redefining the office of judge	134
(b)	PACS: transfer of powers to registrars	135
V	Reform of family policy: the reduction of the family quotient cap (Younès Bernand)	135
VI	Issues regarding the movement of family status documents and the proposed EU Regulation on civil status records (Amélie Panet)	137
VII	Requirement for registrars to celebrate marriage between same-sex couples (Stessy Tetard)	139
VIII	Same-sex marriage between a French and a Moroccan: can it be celebrated with respect to the Franco-Moroccan agreement? (Colin Reydellet)	140
IX	The situation of children born abroad with the assistance of a surrogate mother (Christine Bidaud-Garon)	142
X	Validity of the marriage between a former stepbrother and former stepsister (Cass civ 1e, 4 December 2013, appeal No 12-26066) (François Chénéde)	144
Germany		
Reforming the Law on Parental Responsibility		147
<i>Luise Hauschild</i>		
I	Introduction	147
II	The new law	148
(a)	Sole parental responsibility of the mother as a general rule	148
(b)	Possibility of judicial review	149
(c)	Simplified procedure according to s 155a of the Family Procedural Act	150

III	Prospects	151
Hong Kong		
	Reforming Hong Kong Family Law: Still More to Do?	153
	<i>Anne Scully-Hill</i>	
I	Introduction	153
II	Marriage: the meaning of ‘man’ and ‘woman’: <i>W v Registrar of Marriages</i>	154
III	Ancillary relief: equal division and matrimonial property	157
IV	Changing child law? The children’s dispute resolution pilot scheme, the UNCRC and the Law Reform Commission	161
V	Conclusion	163
India		
	Surrogacy for Single and Unmarried Foreign Persons: A Challenge under Indian Law	165
	<i>Anil Malhotra and Ranjit Malhotra</i>	
I	Introduction	165
II	Recent cases	166
III	Prevailing legal position	168
IV	Law for entry of foreigners into India	172
V	Bar on single and unmarried persons	172
VI	Indian law on surrogacy	173
VII	Challenges to restrictions on surrogacy by single and unmarried foreign persons	176
VIII	Conclusion: an unjustified bar on single and unmarried persons	179
Iran and Armenia		
	Rights and Obligations of Spouses in Iran’s Law Compared with Armenia’s	181
	<i>Grigor Bekmezryan and Gholam Reza Shirazi</i>	
I	Introduction	181
II	A spouse’s rights and duties under Iran’s law	182
III	Non-financial relations between spouses	182
	(a) Communal duties of spouses	183
	(i) Friendly association	183
	(ii) Cooperation in family welfare and education of children	184
	(iii) Loyalty	184
	(b) Allocated rights and obligations of spouses	185
	(i) Headship of the family	185
IV	Financial relations between spouses	191
	(a) Spouses financial independence principle	191
	(b) Marriage portion	192
	(c) The wife’s lien	193
	(d) Provision of family expenses	194
	(e) The wife’s alimony guarantee	196
V	A spouse’s rights and duties in the Republic of Armenia	196
VI	Conclusion	198

Ireland

Irish Abortion Law – Legislating to Stand Still?	201
<i>Maebh Harding</i>	
I Introduction	201
II The genesis of Article 40.3.3	202
III The extent of the duty imposed by Article 40.3.3	203
IV Blanket restrictions on other constitutional rights	204
V The lawful abortion	207
VI Limited rights to travel and information	208
VII The 1992 amendments to the Constitution	209
VIII A constitutional freedom to travel	211
IX Legislative restrictions on information	212
X Legislating for X	215
XI International pressure for change	218
XII European Court of Human Rights’ scrutiny of Irish abortion law	219
XIII The response to ABC	221
XIV The Protection of Life Act 2013	223
XV Conclusion	225

Italy

Joint Custody of Children on Separation and Divorce: The Current Law in Italy: An Overview of the Law and How it is Applied	227
<i>Federica Giardini</i>	
I Introduction	227
II The traditional custody model in Italian law up to 2006	228
III The reform brought in with law 54 of 8 February 2006: its guiding principles and content	229
(a) The guiding principles of the reform	229
(b) The content of the reform	230
IV Critical points emerging after the approval of the law	234
(a) The effects of the reform of 2006	236
(i) The effects of the reform of 2006 on filiation outside wedlock (formerly called ‘natural filiation’): the application of law no 54/2006 on ‘proceedings regarding parents who are not married’	236
V Some significant legal perspectives resulting from the application of the reform of 2006	237
(a) Quarrelling between parents and its influence on joint custody	237
(b) Denial of joint custody where the children refuse to entertain a relationship with the parent	240
(c) Joint custody even where one of the parents is living abroad	240
(d) Joint custody and provisions regarding the assigning of the matrimonial home	241
VI Hearing the views of children	242
VII Joint custody and family mediation	242
VIII The relationship between joint custody and contributions to the maintenance of the child	243
IX Joint custody after the filiation reform (law no 219 of 10	

December 2012 ‘provisions on the acknowledgment of “natural” children’)	243
Japan	
Two Landmark Decisions of the Supreme Court: One Too Late; the Other Still Early	245
<i>Yangwhan Kim</i>	
I Introduction	245
II The illegitimate child case	246
(a) Facts	246
(b) Court’s opinion	246
(i) Standard of judicial review	247
(ii) Constitutionality of the provision	247
(iii) On the binding nature of the decision in this case	248
(c) Comment	248
III AID case	249
(a) Facts	249
(b) Court’s opinion	250
Reversed and affirmed	251
(c) Comment	251
IV Conclusion	253
Kenya	
Changing the Constitution and Changing Attitudes: Recent Developments in Kenyan Family Law	255
<i>F Banda</i>	
I Introduction	255
II Constitution	256
III Matrimonial Property Act 2013	261
IV Inheritance	267
V Intersexuality	270
VI Conclusion	272
Korea	
When a Revealed Affair is a Crime, but a Hidden One is a Romance: An Overview of Adultery Law in the Republic of Korea	275
<i>Ann Black and Kwang-Soo Jung</i>	
I Introduction	276
II Historical perspectives on adultery	279
(a) From ancient kingdoms	279
(b) During the <i>Chosun</i> Dynasty	279
(c) Era of modernisation	281
III Overview of the current criminal law on adultery	283
(a) Elements of the crime of adultery	283
(b) Nature of the prosecution	285
(c) Condoning adultery	285
(d) Pardoning adultery	286
(e) Proof of adultery: direct versus circumstantial evidence	287

(f)	Evidence of adultery gathered through trespass	288
(g)	Other criminal sanctions	289
IV	Insights from the Constitutional Court on the criminalisation of adultery	290
(a)	The reasoning of the Justices <i>for</i> the constitutionality of art 241	292
(b)	The reasoning of the dissenting Justices <i>against</i> art 241's constitutionality	293
(c)	Reasoning of the dissenting Justice that art 241 was incompatible with the Constitution	295
(d)	Conclusion: Article 241 is constitutional	295
V	Implications of adultery in civil law	296
(a)	Overview	296
(b)	Connection between criminal and civil proceedings	298
VI	Choices for Korea: the future for its adultery laws	299
(a)	The evolving Constitutional Court	300
(b)	Social mores	302
(c)	Political parties and advocacy organisations	304
VII	Conclusion	307
Lesotho		
Protecting Orphans and Vulnerable Children in Lesotho: An Assessment of the Children's Protection and Welfare Act 2011		309
<i>Julia Sloth-Nielsen</i>		
I	Introduction	309
II	The context	310
III	The HIV/Aids context in Lesotho	312
IV	The provisions of the Act	314
(a)	Guardianship and child rights	314
(b)	Protection of property rights	315
(c)	Health-related provisions	317
(d)	Fostering and adoption	319
V	Conclusions	322
Macedonia		
Family Law in the New Civil Code of the Republic of Macedonia: Key Issues and Necessary Reforms		325
<i>Dejan Mickovik and Angel Ristov</i>		
I	Introduction	325
II	Place of family law in the Civil Code of the Republic of Macedonia	326
III	Changes in the regulation of cohabitation	328
IV	Introduction and regulation of marital agreements	329
V	Replacement of the term 'parental rights' with 'parental responsibilities'	332
VI	Predicting the possibility for children to express their opinion in all proceedings concerning their rights and interests	333
VII	Predicting specific legal protection of the family home	336

Mozambique**The Right to Alternative Care for Children Deprived of a Family Environment: Overview of International Norms and the Legislative Framework of Mozambique** 339*Usang Maria Assim and Aquinaldo Mandlate*

- I Introduction 339
- II International and regional framework governing the right to alternative care 340
 - (a) The family environment in international law and deprivation of a family environment 341
 - (b) Analysis of the legal framework: the CRC, the ACRWC and the UN Guidelines 344
 - (c) Forms of alternative care 348
- III The Mozambican legal framework: an analysis 353
 - (a) The right to alternative care as protected under the Children's Act 353
 - (b) The right to alternative care in the Mozambican Family Code of 2004 356
- IV Concluding remarks 359

The Netherlands**Dutch Co-motherhood in 2014** 361*Ian Curry-Sumner and Machteld Vonk*

- I Introduction 361
- Part I: Substantive Law 362
- II Legal motherhood for the birth mother's spouse/registered partner by operation of law 362
- III Legal motherhood for the birth mother's partner or the known sperm donor through recognition 363
 - (a) What happens if the birth mother gives a third party consent to recognise her child? 365
 - (i) The birth mother gives her consent to her female partner while the known sperm donor with 'family life' meant to recognise the child 365
 - (ii) The birth mother gives her consent to the known sperm donor but the co-mother meant to recognise the child 366
- IV Legal parenthood for the co-mother through judicial establishment 367
- V Rebutting the co-mother's legal parenthood 367
- Part II: Private International Law Consequences 369
- VI Introduction 369
- VII Applicable law rules 369
 - (a) Introduction 369
 - (b) Children born during marriage or registered partnership 370
 - (i) Determination of parentage 370
 - (ii) Denial of parentage 371
 - (iii) Birth outside of marriage 372

(c)	Recognition of the child by non-birth mother	372
(i)	Establishment of parentage	372
(ii)	Annulment of recognition	374
(d)	Judicial determination of parentage	374
(e)	Recognition of foreign judicial decisions and foreign legal acts and facts	375
VIII	Conclusion	376
New Zealand		
Child Poverty in New Zealand – Definitions, Consequences, and Possible Legislative Responses		377
<i>Mark Henaghan and Ruth Ballantyne</i>		
I	Introduction	377
II	What is child poverty?	378
III	The costs and consequences of child poverty	380
IV	Why New Zealand needs child poverty legislation	381
V	International child poverty legislation	383
(a)	United Kingdom	383
(b)	Wales	384
VI	Proposed New Zealand legislation	385
(a)	Child Poverty Reduction and Eradication Bill	385
(b)	Education (Breakfast and Lunch Programmes in Schools) Amendment Bill and Education (Food in Schools) Amendment Bill	389
(c)	Vulnerable Children Bill	391
VII	Conclusion	393
Papua New Guinea		
Customary Polygamy, Human Rights and the Constitution in Papua New Guinea		395
<i>John Y Luluaki</i>		
I	Introduction	396
(a)	Purpose of discussion	396
(b)	What is polygamy?	397
(c)	Polygamy in Papua New Guinea	398
II	Polygamy, women's rights and the international community	399
(a)	Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW)	400
(b)	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	401
(c)	Universal Declaration of Human Rights 1948	401
III	Arguments for and against polygamy	402
(a)	Arguments supporting polygamy	403
(i)	A distinguishing feature of customary marriage practices	403
(ii)	Polygamy performs certain important functions	403
(iii)	It is a man's customary 'right' to marry polygamously	405
(b)	Arguments against polygamy	405
(i)	Polygamy leads to HIV and AIDS	405
(ii)	Polygamy leads to population increase	405

(iii) Polygamy leads to a thinning of available resources	406
(iv) Polygamy causes domestic violence	406
(v) Polygamy is unconstitutional	407
(iv) Polygamy is unchristian and immoral	410
IV Polygamy in the courts	411
V Polygamy, cultural rights and the underlying law	414
VI Conclusions	417

Poland

Separation of Assets with Equalisation of Accrued Gains (Accruals): A Marital Property Regime for the Modern Family? 419

Anna Stępień-Sporek and Margaret Ryznar

I Introduction	419
II Concept of the regime	421
III Direction of amendments	425
IV Usefulness of the regime	427
V Conclusion	429

Puerto Rico

Electronic Visitation, Lesbian Adoption and Support 431

Pedro F Silva-Ruiz

I Electronic visitation	431
II Lesbian adoption	432
III Child support	433

Solomon Islands

Failing to Adopt a New Approach: The Law of Adoption in Solomon Islands 435

Jennifer Corrin and Eleanor Foote

I Introduction	435
II Background	436
III The legal system	437
IV Law on adoption	439
(a) Customary laws	439
(b) State law	441
(c) International law	444
(d) The Adoption Act 2004	447
(e) Case law	453
V Conclusion	454

Switzerland

New Rules on Parental Responsibility in Switzerland 457

Ingeborg Schwenzer and Tomie Keller

I Introduction	457
II General	458
III Main principles (art 296 CC)	458
IV Married parents	459
V Divorced parents (art 298 CC)	460

VI	Unmarried parents	461
	(a) Joint parental responsibility	462
	(i) Joint declaration (art 298a CC)	462
	(ii) Decision of the Child Protection Authority (art 298b CC)	464
	(iii) Decision of the court in connection with a paternity suit (art 298c CC)	465
	(b) Sole parental responsibility (art 298a(5) CC)	466
	(c) Abolition of the welfare advocate (<i>Beistand</i>) (art 309 CC)	466
VII	Change of circumstances (arts 134 and 298d CC)	466
VIII	Death of a parent (art 297 CC)	467
IX	Content of parental responsibility	467
	(a) Competence to solely decide (art 301(1bis) CC) in case of joint parental responsibility	467
	(b) Determination of the residence (<i>Aufenthaltort</i>) (art 301a CC)	468
X	Transitional law (<i>Übergangsrecht</i>) (art 12(4) and (5) FinT)	469
XI	Conclusion	470
United States		
Developments in Family Law in the United States of America in 2013		471
<i>Lynn D Wardle</i>		
I	Introduction to family law in the American legal system	471
II	Marriage law developments	473
III	Parentage cases	478
IV	Ongoing spousal and quasi-spousal relations	480
V	Ongoing parent–child relations	481
VI	Dissolution of marriage and its legal consequences	482
VII	Parent–child relations after dissolution or break-up	487
VIII	Conclusion	489
Zimbabwe		
The Constitution of Zimbabwe 2013 – A Constitutional Curate’s Egg		491
<i>F Banda</i>		
I	Introduction	491
II	Constitution	492
III	Marriage	494
IV	Protection from violence	497
V	Children	499
VI	Conclusion	503