

Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations	ix
List of Tables	xi
Acknowledgements	xiii
Introduction	1
1 Background, Scope of the Research and Justification	1
2 Research Questions	5
3 Research Methods	6
4 Summary of Chapters	7
CHAPTER 1	
Tax Compliance and Avoidance in Developing Countries	9
1.1 Defining Developing Countries	9
1.2 Noteworthy Differences between Developed and Developing Tax Systems	14
1.3 A Brief Overview of the Tax Systems of India, Brazil and South Africa	16
1.4 The 'Taxation Achilles' Heels' of Emerging Countries, and the Challenges to Promote Effective Reforms and to Counter Non-compliance	18
1.5 Is Tax Avoidance a Problem that Calls for a Legislative Response in Emerging Countries?	21
1.6 Conclusions	24

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 2	
Similar Features Shared by Statutory GAARs from Diverse Jurisdictions	27
2.1 GAAR as a Generic Comparative Concept and its Common Primary Elements	27
2.2 The First Common Denominator	30
2.2.1 The Characterisation of the Tax Avoidance Scheme or Transaction	30
2.2.2 Recommendations for Developing Countries on the Statutory 'Scheme' Element	39
2.3 Second Common Denominator	41
2.3.1 The Tax Benefit or Advantage	41
2.3.2 Recommendations for Developing Countries on the Statutory 'Tax Benefit' Element	46
2.4 The Third Common Denominator	47
2.4.1 The Purpose or Intent of the Taxpayer	47
2.4.2 Recommendations for Developing Countries on the Statutory 'Purpose' Test	54
2.5 Conclusions	55
CHAPTER 3	
How Do General Anti-avoidance Rules Differ?	57
3.1 Secondary Elements of GAARs	57
3.2 Tests Grounded on the Rationale	58
3.2.1 Reasonableness and Appropriateness	58
3.2.2 Recommendations on the Statutory 'Reasonableness' Test for Developing Countries	64
3.3 Tests Related to the 'Nature' of the Arrangement	64
3.3.1 Form and Substance: Artificiality, Complexity, Abnormality and Commerciality	64
3.3.2 The Codification of the 'Economic Substance' and 'Substance over Form' Doctrines	71
3.3.3 Recommendations on the Statutory 'Substance over Form' Tests for Developing Countries	74
3.4 Tests Related to the Form and Motive of the Transaction	74
3.4.1 'Business Purpose', 'Non-tax Purpose' and 'Bona Fide Purpose' Tests	74
3.4.2 Recommendations on the Statutory 'Form and Motive' Tests for Developing Countries	78
3.5 Tests Based on the Result of the Transaction in Relation to the Apparent Policy of the Legislation	79
3.5.1 Tests Based on Parliamentary Intention: GAARs and Purposive Interpretation	79

Table of Contents

3.5.2	The Codification of the ‘Abuse of Law’ and ‘Fraud of Law’ Doctrines	82
3.5.3	The Common Law ‘Anti-abuse’ Rules	84
3.5.4	Recommendations on the Statutory Targeting Mechanisms for Developing Countries	88
3.6	Conclusions	89
CHAPTER 4		
	General Anti-avoidance Rules and Doctrines in the Courts	93
4.1	A Multiple-Case Study for a Comparative Design	93
4.2	Judicial Responses to Tax Avoidance	95
4.3	The Case Law on the Primary Elements	102
4.3.1	Scheme or Arrangement	102
4.3.1.1	Step Transaction Doctrines	103
4.3.1.2	Indirect Transaction	110
4.3.1.3	Recommendations for Developing Countries on the ‘Scheme’ Element from the Case Law	112
4.3.2	Tax Benefit or Advantage	113
4.3.2.1	Identifying the Tax Benefit or Advantage	113
4.3.2.2	Recommendations for Developing Countries on the ‘Tax Benefit’ Element from the Case Law	116
4.3.3	Purpose or Intent	117
4.3.3.1	Ascertaining the Purpose of the Scheme to Obtain a Tax Benefit	117
4.3.3.2	Recommendations for Developing Countries on the ‘Purpose’ Element from the Case Law	124
4.4	Conclusions	125
CHAPTER 5		
	The Secondary Elements in Action	129
5.1	Reasonableness, Reasonable Expectation and Appropriateness Tests	129
5.1.1	The Diverse Legal Meanings and Approaches to Reasonableness	129
5.1.2	Recommendations on the ‘Reasonableness’ Test from the Case Law	133
5.2	Substance over Form	134
5.2.1	Doctrines Based on a Finding of the ‘Legal Nature’ of the Arrangements	134
5.2.2	Recommendations on ‘Form and Substance’ Tests from the Case Law	147
5.3	Form and Motive	149
5.3.1	Business Purpose, Tax and Non-tax Purposes, and Bona Fide Purposes	149
5.3.2	Recommendations on ‘Form and Motive’ from the Case Law	152
5.4	The Targeting Mechanism	153

Table of Contents

5.4.1	'Parliamentary Intention', 'Object, Purpose or Spirit', 'Scheme and Purpose' of the Legislation, 'the Choice Principle' and 'Parliamentary Contemplation'	153
5.4.2	Teleological Interpretation, 'Abuse of Law' and 'Fraud of Law'	161
5.4.3	Recommendations on 'Targeting Mechanisms' from the Case Law	164
5.5	Conclusions	165
CHAPTER 6		
	GAAR and the Protection of Taxpayers' Rights	169
6.1	Introduction	169
6.2	Safeguards Against Arbitrariness in the Operation of the GAAR: Exclusions for Protected Transactions, or a Guidance, Ruling and Clearance System	171
6.3	Safeguards of Consistency, Uniformity and Expertise in the Application of the GAAR: A Centralised Administrative Structure and an Advisory Panel	175
6.4	Checks and Balances: Judicial Review and the Burden of Proof	177
6.5	Safeguard Against Criminalisation: GAAR Penalty Regime	180
6.6	Safeguards Against a Retrospective GAAR	183
6.7	Discussion, Recommendations and Conclusions	185
CONCLUSIONS		
	The Potentials of a GAAR for Developing Countries	189
1	Tax Avoidance Is a Problem that Calls for a Tailored Legislative Response in Developing countries	189
2	General Drafting Recommendations for Developing Countries' GAARs	193
2.1	'Scheme', 'Transaction' or 'Arrangement'	193
2.2	'Tax Benefit or Advantage'	194
2.3	The 'Purpose'	195
2.4	'Reasonableness' or 'Reasonable Expectation'	196
2.5	'Form over Substance'	196
2.6	'Form and Motive'	197
2.7	Targeting Mechanism or Objects Clause	197
2.8	Taxpayers' Safeguards	198
3	Final Remarks and Recommendations for Future Research	199
	Bibliography	201
	Table of Cases	227
	Table of Statutes	233
	Index	235