

# Table of Contents

Acknowledgement	xv
Introduction	1
I Background and Overview of the Merger Directive	1
II Main Question and Sub-questions	5
III Justification of Topic and Research	6
IV Approach	7
V Relationship between Primary EU Law, Secondary EU Law and Domestic Law	10
VI Delimitations	11
CHAPTER 1	
The Scope <i>Ratione Personae</i>	13
§1.01 Introduction	13
§1.02 'Company'	13
[A] Introduction	13
[B] Literal Interpretation	14
[C] Schematic Interpretation	16
[1] Introduction	16
[2] Other EU Directives	16
[3] Article 54 of the TFEU	17
[D] Teleological Interpretation	20
[E] Recommendation	20
[1] Introduction	20
[2] Option 1: Use the Definition of the Term 'Company' in Article 3(1)(b) of the OECD Model Convention	21
[3] Option 2: Replace the Term 'Company' by the Term 'Entity'	22
§1.03 'Listed Form Requirement'	23
[A] Introduction	23

23	[B]	The Consequence of Being Listed in Annex I, Part A	
24	[C]	Annex I, Part A: Limitative or Exemplary Interpretation?	
26	[D]	Validity of the 'Listed Form Requirement'	
26	[1]	Introduction	
27	[2]	Objective of the Merger Directive	
28	[3]	Freedom of Establishment	
32	[4]	Freedom of Capital Movement	
32	[a]	Access to the Freedom of Capital Movement	
33	[b]	Capital Movement	
33	[c]	Concurrence with the Freedom of Establishment	
34	[d]	Restiction	
35	[e]	Company Level versus Shareholder Level	
37	[f]	Justification	
38	[5]	Article 18 of the TFEU	
39	[6]	The Unwritten EU Law Principle of Equality	
42	[7]	Treaty Non-discrimination Provision	
42	[a]	Introduction	
42	[b]	Article 24(1) of the OECD Model Convention	
48	[E]	Recommendation: Abolition of the 'Listed Form Requirement'	
48	[F]	Proposed CCCTB Directive	
50	[G]	SE and SCE	
51	[A]	'Residence Requirement'	\$1.04
51	[B]	Dual Residence within the EU	
52	[C]	Dual Residence outside the EU	
53	[D]	Deviations from the 'Place of Effective Management'	
54		'Tie-Breaker'	
54	[1]	Introduction	
54	[2]	Mutual Agreement Procedure	
55	[3]	Place of Incorporation	
57	[E]	Recommendation: Abolition of the 'Residence Requirement'	
58		'Subject-to-Tax Requirement'	\$1.05
58	[A]	Introduction	
59	[B]	Taxes Covered by Article 3(c) of the Merger Directive	
59	[C]	'Subject to Tax'	
59	[D]	'Without the Possibility of an Option or of Being Exempt'	
61	[E]	Recommendation: Abolition of the 'Subject-to-Tax Requirement'	
62		'Involving Companies from Two or More Member States'	\$1.06
62	[A]	Introduction	
62	[B]	'Involving'	
63	[C]	Company from Which Member State(s)?	
63	[1]	Introduction	
64	[2]	Company from One or from Multiple Member States?	

Table of Contents

23	[3] Company from One Member State: Decisive Criterion?	65
24	[a] Introduction	65
26	[b] 'Listed form Requirement'	65
26	[c] 'Residence Requirement'	66
27	[d] 'Subject-to-Tax Requirement'	68
28	[4] Company from Multiple Member States?	68
32	[D] Partial Application of the Facilities of the Merger Directive	69
32	[E] Recommendation: Relaxation of the 'Involvement Requirement'	70
33	12.27 UCITS	73
33	12.28 Conclusions and Recommendations	76
34		
35	CHAPTER 2	
37	The Scope <i>Ratione Materiae</i>	81
38	12.30 Introduction	81
39	12.32 'Merger'	84
42	[A] Introduction	84
42	[B] The 'Non-Liquidation Requirement'	85
42	[C] The Nature of the Consideration	86
48	[1] Introduction	86
48	[2] The Restriction to Securities	86
50	[3] The '10% Cash Payment Limitation'	88
51	[a] Introduction	88
51	[b] The Terms 'Nominal Value' and 'Accounting Par Value'	90
52	[c] Critique	90
53	[d] Buy-Out of Minority Shareholders	91
54	[4] 'Securities Representing the Capital'	92
54	[5] The 'Issuance Requirement'	95
54	[6] 'Triangular Mergers'	97
55	[D] The Value of the Consideration	98
57	12.65 'Division' and 'Partial Division'	102
58	[A] Introduction	102
58	[B] 'Branch of Activity'	103
59	[1] Introduction	103
59	[2] The <i>Andersen og Jensen</i> Decision	103
61	[3] Systematic Interpretation	108
62	[a] Capital Duty Directive	108
62	[b] VAT Directive	111
62	[4] Critique on the 'Branch of Activity Requirement'	113
62	[5] 'Leaving at Least One Branch of Activity in the Transferring Company'	115
63	[C] 'Dispute Divisions'	117
63	12.34 'Transfer of Assets'	118
64	12.35 'Exchange of Shares'	118

[A]	Introduction	118
[B]	The 'Voting Rights Requirement'	119
[C]	Critique on the 'Voting Rights Requirement'	121
[A]	Transfer of the Registered Office of an SE or an SCE	123
[B]	Interplay between Tax Law and Corporate Law	125
[C]	Introduction	125
[D]	Three Categories of Operations	125
[E]	Differences in Interpretation	129
[F]	Unnecessarily Restrictive Elements	131
[G]	Limited Coverage of Operations by Article 2 of the Merger Directive	132
[H]	Bridging the Gap between Tax Law and Corporate Law	133
[I]	Conclusion	135
CHAPTER 3		
[A]	Carry-Over of Balance-Sheet Values, Provisions, Reserves and Losses	143
[B]	Introduction	143
[C]	Carry-Over of Balance-Sheet Values at Company Level	145
[D]	Introduction	145
[E]	'Shall Not Give Rise to Any Taxation of Capital Gains' (at Company Level)	147
[F]	Which Member State Is Not Allowed to Tax?	147
[G]	Which Taxes May Not Be Levied?	147
[H]	Is the Taxation of Other Items of Income than Capital Gains at the Time of the Restructuring Operation Still Allowed?	148
[I]	Is Non-taxation Mandatory for the Taxpayer?	148
[J]	The Terms 'Real Value' and 'Value for Tax Purposes'	149
[K]	The 'Permanent Establishment Requirement' and the 'Taxable Income Requirement'	150
[L]	Pivotal Roles	150
[M]	Literal Interpretation	151
[N]	Historical Interpretation	151
[O]	Schematic Interpretation	152
[P]	Introduction	152
[Q]	Interplay with the 'Taxable Income Requirement'	152
[R]	Interplay with the 'Branch of Activity Requirement'	154
[S]	Interplay with the Term 'Permanent Establishment' in the Other Direct Tax Directives	154
[T]	Interplay with the Terms 'Agencies' and 'Branches' in Article 49 of the TFEU	156
[U]	Teleological Interpretation	157
[V]	Deliberation	158
[W]	Reconsidering the 'Permanent Establishment Requirement'	159

[A]	Introduction	118
[B]	The 'Voting Rights Requirement'	119
[C]	Critique on the 'Voting Rights Requirement'	121
[A]	Transfer of the Registered Office of an SE or an SCE	123
[B]	Interplay between Tax Law and Corporate Law	125
[C]	Introduction	125
[D]	Three Categories of Operations	125
[E]	Differences in Interpretation	129
[F]	Unnecessarily Restrictive Elements	131
[G]	Limited Coverage of Operations by Article 2 of the Merger Directive	132
[H]	Bridging the Gap between Tax Law and Corporate Law	133
[I]	Conclusion	135
CHAPTER 3		
[A]	Carry-Over of Balance-Sheet Values, Provisions, Reserves and Losses	143
[B]	Introduction	143
[C]	Carry-Over of Balance-Sheet Values at Company Level	145
[D]	Introduction	145
[E]	'Shall Not Give Rise to Any Taxation of Capital Gains' (at Company Level)	147
[F]	Which Member State Is Not Allowed to Tax?	147
[G]	Which Taxes May Not Be Levied?	147
[H]	Is the Taxation of Other Items of Income than Capital Gains at the Time of the Restructuring Operation Still Allowed?	148
[I]	Is Non-taxation Mandatory for the Taxpayer?	148
[J]	The Terms 'Real Value' and 'Value for Tax Purposes'	149
[K]	The 'Permanent Establishment Requirement' and the 'Taxable Income Requirement'	150
[L]	Pivotal Roles	150
[M]	Literal Interpretation	151
[N]	Historical Interpretation	151
[O]	Schematic Interpretation	152
[P]	Introduction	152
[Q]	Interplay with the 'Taxable Income Requirement'	152
[R]	Interplay with the 'Branch of Activity Requirement'	154
[S]	Interplay with the Term 'Permanent Establishment' in the Other Direct Tax Directives	154
[T]	Interplay with the Terms 'Agencies' and 'Branches' in Article 49 of the TFEU	156
[U]	Teleological Interpretation	157
[V]	Deliberation	158
[W]	Reconsidering the 'Permanent Establishment Requirement'	159

Table of Contents

118	[1] Introduction	159
119	[2] The Immediate Taxation of Hidden Reserves in the Light of the Freedom of Establishment	161
121	[3] Unsatisfactory Elements in the <i>National Grid</i> Regime	162
123	[4] Comparison between the Regime in the Merger Directive and the <i>National Grid</i> Regime	164
125	[5] Options for Exit Tax Regimes in the Merger Directive	165
125	[6] An Improved Exit Tax Regime À La <i>National Grid</i>	166
129	[7] The 'Restrictive' Definition or Allocation of Taxing Rights	168
131	[8] Allocation of Assets and Liabilities to the Permanent Establishment and the Subsequent Attribution of Profits	170
132	[E] The Perspective of the Member State of the Receiving Company	172
133	[F] The Transfer of a Permanent Establishment	173
135	[1] Introduction	173
	[2] Reinstatement of Losses	174
	[3] Free Choice of Legal Form	179
143	63.03 Carry-Over of Balance-Sheet Values at Shareholder Level	181
143	[A] Introduction	181
145	[B] Description of Article 8 of the Merger Directive	181
145	[C] Shareholder of Which Company?	182
	[D] Which Taxes May Not Be Levied Pursuant to Article 8 of the Merger Directive?	183
	[E] The Perspective of the Member State of the Shareholder	184
	[F] The Perspective of the Member State of the Shareholding	185
147	[1] Introduction	185
147	[2] Example 1: Cross-Border Merger	185
147	[3] Example 2: Exchange of Shares	186
	[4] Analysis	186
	[G] Change of the Regime Applicable to the Shareholding	187
	[1] Introduction	187
	[2] Articles 8(6) and 14(2) of the Merger Directive	188
	[3] Interaction with the Parent-Subsidiary Directive	188
	[4] Apportionment of the Capital Gain	189
	[5] Tax Treaty Override	191
	[H] A 'Taxable Income Requirement' and Exit Tax Regime in Article 8 of the Merger Directive	192
148	63.04 Carry-Over of Provisions or Reserves	193
148	[A] Introduction	193
149	[B] The Term 'Provisions or Reserves'	194
150	[C] 'Not Derived from Permanent Establishments Abroad'	195
150	63.05 Takeover of Losses	197
151	[A] Introduction	197
151	[B] Purpose of Article 6 of the Merger Directive	198
152		
152		
152		
154		
154		
154		
156		
157		
158		
159		

[C]	Article 6 of the Merger Directive Does Not Cover the Carry-Over of Other Deferred Tax Assets Than 'Losses'	198
[D]	Article 6 of the Merger Directive Only Addresses the Losses of the Transferring Company	200
[E]	Article 6 of the Merger Directive Provides for Losses to Be Carried Forward, but Not Carried Back	201
[F]	Article 6 of the Merger Directive Only Requires a Takeover of Losses If This Would Be Allowed with a Domestic Restructuring Operation	202
[G]	Article 6 of the Merger Directive Does Not Clarify Whether (or How) the Losses of the Transferring Company Should Be Apportioned to the Transferred Assets and Liabilities	203
[H]	Article 6 of the Merger Directive Does Not Specify against Which Profits the Losses of the Transferring Company Can Be Set Off	207
[I]	Article 6 of the Merger Directive Covers the Domestic, but Not the Cross-Border Takeover of Losses	208
	[1] Introduction	208
	[2] The <i>A Oy</i> Decision	210
	[a] Facts and Preliminary Questions	210
	[b] Restriction and Justification	210
	[c] Is the Finnish Measure Proportional?	211
[3]	When Are Losses 'Final'?	212
	[a] Introduction	212
	[b] Distinguishing Marks & Spencer Situations from <i>A Oy</i> Situations	212
	[c] Which Amount of Losses of the Transferring Company Can Be Taken into Account in the Member State of the Receiving Company?	214
	[d] Conclusion	217
[J]	Primary EU Law Does Not Compel Expansion of Article 6 of the Merger Directive	217
[K]	Expansion of Article 6 of the Merger Directive Is Preferable to the Merger Directive	219
[L]	Proposal to Expand and Improve Article 6 of the Merger Directive	219
[M]	The 'Comparable Circumstances Test' in Article 13(2) of the Merger Directive	219
	Merger Directive	221
	Hybrid Entities	222
[A]	Introduction	222
[B]	Overview of Provisions Governing Hybrid Entities in the Merger Directive	224
[C]	Different Perspectives on Hybrid Entities	226
[D]	Company Level	227
	[1] The Transferring Company Is a Hybrid Entity	227

Table of Contents

198	[2] The Transferring Company Is a Reverse Hybrid Entity	230
	[3] The Receiving Company Is a Hybrid Entity	231
200	[4] The Receiving Company Is a Reverse Hybrid Entity	233
	[E] Shareholder Level	234
201	[1] The Shareholder is a Hybrid Entity	234
	[2] The Shareholder is a Reverse Hybrid Entity	236
202	[F] The 'Opting-Out Regime' of Article 11 of the Merger Directive	237
	[1] The Transferring or Acquired Company Is a Hybrid Entity	237
	[2] The Receiving or Acquiring Company Is a Hybrid Entity	240
	[G] Reflections	244
203	[H.07] 'Valuation Rules'	246
	[A] Introduction	246
207	[B] The Valuation of the Securities Received in the Case of a Transfer of Assets	246
208	[C] The Valuation of the Assets and Liabilities Received in the Member State of the Receiving Company	248
208	[D] Valuation of the Securities Received by the Acquiring Company	249
210	[H.08] Conclusion and Recommendations	251
210		
210	Chapter 4	
211	The Combat of Tax Avoidance under the Merger Directive	263
212	[H.09] Introduction	263
212	[H.10] The Combat of Tax Avoidance under Article 15(1)(a) of the Merger Directive	264
212	[A] Brief Description of the Provision	264
	[B] 'Principal Objective or as One of Its Principal Objectives'	267
	[C] 'Valid Commercial Reasons'	268
214	[D] 'Refuse to Apply or Withdraw the Benefit of'	270
217	[H.13] Framework for the Interpretation of Article 15(1)(a) of the Merger Directive	273
217	[A] Introduction	273
219	[B] The Context of the Merger Directive	273
	[C] The Purpose of the Merger Directive	274
219	[D] The Fundamental Freedoms	276
	[E] The Principle of Proportionality	280
221	[F] The Principle of Legal Certainty	282
222	[H.14] Which Possible Types of Tax Avoidance Can Be Identified?	283
222	[A] Introduction	283
224	[B] The Deferral of Taxation by Converting, under the Merger Directive's Carry-Over Facilities, an Immediately Taxable Gain to a Gain That Is Taxable in the Future	283
226		
227	[C] The Loss of Taxing Rights	285
227	[D] The Compensation of Losses	286

[E]	The Obtainment of a Tax Benefit after the Restructuring Operation	288
[F]	The Avoidance of Taxes Not Covered by the Merger Directive	288
[G]	Conclusions	291
\$4.05	(How) Should the Merger Directive Be Amended?	292
\$4.06	Conclusion	295
CHAPTER 5		
\$5.01	The Avoidance of Double Taxation under the Merger Directive	303
\$5.02	Introduction	303
\$5.02	<i>The 3D I Srl Decision</i>	304
\$5.03	Conflicts of Interpretation concerning the Term 'Permanent Establishment'	306
[A]	Background	306
[B]	The Result: Double Taxation and Double Non-taxation	307
[1]	Example	307
[2]	Scenario 1: PE According to Member State A, No PE According to Member State B	307
[3]	Scenario 2: No PE According to Member State A, PE According to Member State B	308
[C]	Distinguishing Conflicts of Interpretation concerning the Term 'Permanent Establishment' from Other Conflicts of Interpretation	310
[1]	Introduction	310
[2]	Conflict of Interpretation concerning the Term 'Securities Representing the Capital'	310
[3]	The Solution of Conflicts of Interpretation concerning the Term 'Permanent Establishment'	311
[a]	Introduction	311
[b]	The Meaning of the Term 'Permanent Establishment' in Article 5 of the OECD Model Convention	311
[c]	Interpretation by the ECJ and the Risk of Diverging Interpretations	313
[d]	Interpretation by the ECJ and Bilateral Situations in Which No Conflict of Interpretation Exists	313
[e]	Interpretation by the ECJ and the Allocation of Taxing Powers by the Member States	314
[D]	Solution for Conflicts of Interpretation concerning the Term 'Permanent Establishment'	314
[1]	Solution: The Member State of the Receiving Company Follows the Interpretation by the Member State of the Transferring Company	314
[2]	Old Roots of the Solution	314



Table of Contents

288	[3] The Solution and the Principle of Good Faith in International Law	317
288	[4] The Duty of Consistent Interpretation in EU Law	320
291	[5] Counter-Arguments against the Proposed Solution	322
292	(E.04) Specification of the Exemption Method	325
295	[A] Different Methods of Avoiding Juridical Double Taxation	325
	[B] The 1969 Proposal Obligated Member States to Apply Either the Exemption Method or the Credit Method	326
303	[C] Arguments in Favour of the Specification of the Exemption Method	327
303	[D] Obstacles with the Specification of the Exemption Method	327
304	(E.05) The Merger Directive and 'Triangular Cases'	328
	[A] Introduction	328
306	[B] The Taxation of Dividends, Interests and Royalties Attributable to the Permanent Establishment of the Receiving Company	328
306	[C] The Taxation of Dividends That Relate to Profits Realised with the Activities of the (Former) Transferring Company	330
307	[D] Solutions	331
307	(E.06) Conclusion	333
308		
	Chapter 6	
	Proposal for the Amendment of the Merger Directive	337
	Chapter 7	
	Overall Conclusion	347
310	(F.01) Introduction	347
310	(F.02) Summary of Conclusions	347
	[A] Chapter 1: The Scope <i>Ratione Personae</i>	347
310	[B] Chapter 2: The Scope <i>Ratione Materiae</i>	351
	[C] Chapter 3: Carry-Over of Balance-Sheet Values, Provisions, Reserves and Losses	356
311	[D] Chapter 4: The Combat of Tax Avoidance under the Merger Directive	366
311	[E] Chapter 5: The Avoidance of Double Taxation under the Merger Directive	372
313	(F.03) Main Shortcomings and Possible Solutions	375
313		
314	Bibliography	381
314	Table of Cases	393
314	Table of Treaties, Regulation, Directives and Communication	403
314	Opinions of the European Economic and Social Committee	407