

## CONTENTS

Preface	vii
Contents	ix
Table of Cases	xxiii
Table of EU and International Legislation	lxix
Table of UK Statutes and Foreign National Legislation	lxxvii
Table of Cases before the ECHR	xciii
Table of Cases before the ECtHR	xcix
Table of European Cases	cxxiii
Table of Rules	cxxv
Table of Statutory Instruments	cxxvii

### PART ONE

1 The European Convention On Human Rights	1
A Introduction	1
B Origins and Influence	2
I The Universal Declaration of Human Rights	2
II The Council of Europe	2
III The European Convention on Human Rights	3
IV The influence of the Convention	5
C Procedure	7
I Institutional reform	7
II The procedure prior to November 1998	9
III The procedure under Protocols 11 and 14	10
Institution of proceedings	11
Legal representation and legal aid	12
Interim measures	13
Preliminary consideration	17
Written pleadings	18
Joinder and simultaneous examination	18
Expedition	18
Admissibility	19
Exhaustion of domestic remedies	20
The six months rule	32
Anonymity and confidentiality	34
Substantially the same	35
Application incompatible with the Convention	36
Territorial application	36
State responsibility	38
Standing	39

Victim status	41
Manifestly ill-founded	45
Abuse of the right of petition	45
Estoppel	46
Post admissibility procedures	48
Factual investigations	48
Friendly settlement	49
Withdrawal	50
The pilot judgment procedure	51
Relinquishment to a Grand Chamber	53
Oral hearings	53
Evidence and burden of proof	54
Judgment on the merits	57
Just satisfaction	58
Pecuniary loss	60
Non-pecuniary loss	60
Costs	64
Subsequent referral to the Grand Chamber	65
Third party interventions	66
Advisory opinions	68
Interpretation, revision and rectification	68
Execution of court judgments	69
D Reservations and Derogations	70
Reservations	70
Derogations	71
The Future of the court: beyond Protocol 14 <i>de minimis non curat praetor</i>	74 76
2 Principles of Interpretation	79
A Introduction	79
I The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	79
II Object and purpose	80
B The court's interpretative techniques	82
I Practical and effective interpretation	83
II Rights to be broadly construed/restrictions to be narrowly interpreted	85
III Permissible limitations must not impair the essence of a Convention right	88
IV Evolutive interpretation	88
V Practice in other jurisdictions	94
VI Ordinary meaning	96
VII <i>Travaux Préparatoires</i>	99
VIII Autonomous terms	100
IX Implied rights	101
X Positive obligations	104
XI Implied limitations	106
XII Waiver of Convention rights	110
XIII Convention to be read as a whole	112
XIV The <i>lex specialis</i> principle	113

XV The Rule of Law	114
XVI Principle of legal certainty	115
XVII Necessary in a democratic society	119
XVIII Proportionality	122
XIX Subsidiarity	128
XX Fourth instance doctrine	129
XXI Margin of appreciation	130
C Specific Provisions	143
I Non-discrimination	143
II Abuse of rights	147
III Convention not to prejudice existing rights	148
3 The Human Rights Act 1998	151
A Introduction	151
B Interpretation	152
C Retrospective Application in Criminal Proceedings	154
D The Convention Rights	159
I The rights incorporated	159
II The omission of Articles 1 and 13	159
III Extra-territorial application of the Convention and the HRA	159
IV The relevance of Articles 16 to 18	162
V Derogations	163
VI Reservations	168
VII Protocols	168
VIII Relevance of the Strasbourg jurisprudence	172
IX Freedom of expression and freedom of religion	177
X Saving for existing rights	177
E Application to Public Authorities	178
I The duty to act compatibly	178
II Scope of the obligation imposed on public author- ities	179
III Hybrid bodies	180
IV Parliament is not bound by section 6(1)	182
V The position of the courts	182
VI Rules of common law	183
F Application to Legislation	185
I The new approach to statutory interpretation	185
II Legislation enacted after the Human Rights Act	191
III Incompatible legislation	192
IV Declarations of incompatibility	193
V Right of Crown to intervene	195
VI Remedial orders	195
G Claims and Remedies	197
I Free-standing claims	198
II Reliance on Convention rights	198
III The "victim" requirement	199
IV Remedies	201
V Damages	203

VI Judicial acts	205
H Miscellaneous Provisions	206
I Commencement	206
II Costs	207
III The Act does not create criminal offences	208
4 The Definition of a Criminal Charge	209
A Introduction	209
B Criminal Proceedings	210
I General principles	210
II The <i>Engel</i> criteria	211
III "Administrative" offences	214
IV Tax and customs penalties	216
V Forfeiture orders made against third parties	218
VI Criminal confiscation orders	220
VII Civil recovery orders	223
VIII Competition law penalties	223
IX Regulatory offences	224
X Enforcement proceedings	226
XI Contempt	227
XII Wasted cost orders	231
XIII Tribunals of inquiry	231
XIV Offences against military discipline	232
XV Offences against prison discipline	233
XVI Professional disciplinary proceedings	238
XVII Disciplinary proceedings against civil servants	239
XVIII School exclusions	239
XIX Election offences	240
XX Measures adopted for the prevention of disorder or crime	241
XXI Breach of the peace	242
XXII Anti-social behaviour orders	243
XXIII Terrorism	246
XXIV Issues arising under Article 5	248
XXV Comparative law position	249
C Charge	250
I Autonomous interpretation	250
II Comparative law position	254
5 Rights Relating To Arrest and Detention in Police Custody	257
A Introduction	257
B Deprivation of Liberty	258
I The Strasbourg caselaw	258
II Comparative approaches	261
C The "legality" requirements of Article 5(1)	261
D Arrest on Reasonable Suspicion and Related Grounds	265
I General	265
II Criminal offences	265

III Competent legal authority	266
IV Reasonable suspicion	266
E Arrest or Detention for Breach of a Court Order	268
F Detention to Secure Compliance with a Legal Obligation	269
G The Right to be Given Reasons for Arrest	271
H Information to be Provided at the Moment of Charge	273
I Detention in Police Custody	274
J Habeas Corpus	277
K Ill-Treatment in Custody	278
L Access to Legal Advice in Police Custody	281
6 Entry, Search and Seizure	285
A Introduction	285
B The Police and Criminal Evidence Act 1984	286
I PACE Codes of Practice	286
II Entry, search and seizure under warrant	287
III Entry, search and seizure without a warrant	295
IV Seizure and retention of evidence	297
C The Terrorism Provisions	300
D The Convention Approach	304
I General	304
II Powers of entry	305
III Search and seizure	306
E Comparative Approaches	310
7 Covert Investigation and Entrapment	315
A General Principles	315
B Earlier Challenges to the United Kingdom's Covert Surveillance Regime	319
C The Regulation of Investigatory Powers Act 2000	325
I Interceptions	325
II Direct surveillance, intrusive surveillance and the use of covert human intelligence sources	329
III Investigation of electronic data protected by encryption	332
IV Scrutiny of investigatory powers	332
D Challenges to the Lawfulness of Covert Investigations	334
The interplay between Article 8 and Article 6	334
Freestanding Article 8 claims	335
Complaints about the retention and use of investigatory material	335
E Entrapment	339
I The Strasbourg caselaw under Article 6	339
II In English law	343
III Comparative approaches	347
IV Admissions obtained by subterfuge	348
V Accomplices and participant informers	350

8 Bail	355
A Introduction	355
B General Principles	355
I The first limb of Article 5(3)	356
Pre-charge detention in terrorism cases	359
II The second limb of Article (3)	363
C "Relevant" Grounds for Refusal of Bail	366
I The Strasbourg principles	366
Burden of proof	367
Risk that the accused will fail to appear for trial	367
Interference with the course of justice	369
Prevention of further offences	370
The preservation of public order or the accused's own protection	371
Irrelevant considerations	371
II Application to the Bail Act 1976	373
Paragraphs 2(a) and (c): risk of flight and interference with justice	374
Paragraph 2(b): risk of further offences	374
Paragraph 3: the defendant's own protection	374
Defendants facing non-imprisonable offences	375
Absolute prohibitions on the right to pre-trial bail	376
Section 25 of the Criminal Justice and Public Order Act 1994	376
Other statutory inroads into the right to bail	379
Paragraph 2A: offence committed whilst defendant already on bail	380
Paragraph 6: defendant absconding whilst on bail in the same proceedings	381
Paragraph 6ZA: defendants charged with murder	383
I Paragraphs 6A–6C: class A drug users	383
D Conditions of Bail	384
E Procedural Requirements	389
I General	389
II A fully adversarial hearing	390
Disclosure of material relevant to the application to detain in custody	391
III Legal representation	395
IV Presence of the accused	396
First instance bail hearings in England and Wales	397
Appellate bail hearings in England and Wales	399
V A hearing in public?	401
VI The duty to give a reasoned ruling	402
VII Practical obstacles	403
VIII Withdrawal of bail	404
XI Appeals	406
X Periodic reconsideration of remand in custody	408
F The Length of Pre-Trial Detention	410
Custody time limits in England and Wales	411
G Compensation	414

9 Issues in Pre-Trial Procedure	415
A Legal Representation and Related Matters	415
I Introduction	415
II Mandatory representation	415
III Choice of representation	417
IV The right to effective representation	419
V Legal professional privilege	422
VI Legal aid in criminal cases	430
B Cautioning and Discontinuance	434
C Delay	435
I When does time begin to run?	436
II When does time cease to run?	438
III What amounts to a breach?	439
IV Remedies for breach of the "reasonable time" guarantee	442
D Publicity, Fair Trials and Contempt	447
I General	447
II Pre-trial publicity and the presumption of innocence	453
III Freedom of expression	459
IV Protection of the identity of offenders	465
E Disclosure and Public Interest Immunity	465
I Introduction	465
II The Strasbourg caselaw	466
III The Criminal Procedure and Investigations Act 1996	472
IV The Attorney General's Guidelines (2005)	479
V The Magistrates' Courts	481
VI Canada	482
VII Public interest immunity	484
10 Special Procedures for Terrorist Cases	501
A Introduction	501
B Terrorism and Human Rights	502
C Terrorism Act 2000	507
Definition of terrorism	507
Proscribed organisations	509
Other offences	510
Terrorist property	511
Stop and search	512
Pre-charge detention	513
D The Anti-Terrorism, Crime and Security Act 2001	515
Asset seizing	515
Part 4 detention without charge	516
SIAC and closed material	517
E Prevention of Terrorism Act 2005	518
Control orders	518
Proposals for reform	523
F The Terrorism Act 2006	524
G Counter Terrorism Act 2008	527

H Asset Freezing	527
I Terrorism and Torturer	531
Deportation	531
Evidence obtained through torture	534
11 Procedural Principles	535
A Double Jeopardy	535
I Introduction	535
II The approach in other jurisdictions	536
III England and Wales	538
IV Part 10 of the Criminal Justice Act 2003	540
Acquittals	544
The evidence pre-conditions	544
Interests of justice pre-condition	546
Foreign acquittals	548
European <i>ne bis in idem</i> developments	549
V Article 14 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	551
VI Article 4 of Protocol 7	553
VII Part 10 Criminal Justice Act 2003—Compliance with ECHR Protocol 7, Article 4 and I.C.C.P.R. Article 14(7)	559
B The Right to an Independent and Impartial Tribunal	560
I General principles	560
II Jury bias	569
III Summary proceedings for contempt of court	574
C The Right to a Hearing in the Presence of the Accused	577
D Severance	583
E The Protection of Vulnerable Witnesses	584
I Introduction	584
II Anonymity	584
III Screens	592
IV Hearings in camera	595
F Trial of Juveniles in the Crown Court	595
12 Admissibility of Evidence	597
A The Evaluation of Evidence	597
B Rules of Admissibility	599
C Hearsay, Confrontation and Witness Statements	599
I The general Strasbourg approach	599
II The statutory provisions in England and Wales	603
III Applying the Strasbourg jurisprudence to the statutory provisions in England and Wales	606
D Admission of a Co-Defendant's Plea of Guilty	608
E Evidence of the Accused's Previous Convictions	609
F Psychiatric Evidence Relating to a Co-Defendant	610
G Polygraph Evidence	611
H Expert Evidence	611

13 Self-Incrimination and the Exclusion of Unlawfully Obtained Evidence	613
A Introduction	613
B The Privilege Against Self-Incrimination	613
I The Strasbourg caselaw	613
II Self-incrimination and the Human Rights Act	623
C Adverse Inferences From Silence	627
I The Strasbourg caselaw	627
II Adverse inferences and the Human Rights Act	632
III Comparative approaches	634
D Unlawfully Obtained Evidence	634
I The Strasbourg caselaw	634
II Comparative approaches	641
III Exclusion of evidence under the Human Rights Act 1998	644
14 The Course of Evidence and Witness Protection	655
A Introduction	655
B Cross-Examination of Rape Complainants on Sexual History	655
C Special Measures Directions and the Youth Justice and Criminal Evidence Act 1999	658
D Witness Anonymity	660
15 The Burden and Standard of Proof	667
A Introduction	667
B Reverse Onus Provisions	667
I Introduction	667
II The Strasbourg caselaw	670
III The United Kingdom case law	674
The decision in <i>Lambert</i>	677
The decision in <i>Johnstone</i>	680
Further appellate decisions before <i>Sheldrake</i>	681
The <i>Sheldrake</i> decision	683
IV Commonwealth and U.S. jurisprudence	687
V Canada	687
VI South Africa	690
VII The United States Supreme Court	693
VIII The approach of the Privy Council	694
IX Burdens of proof post-conviction	695
X Strict liability offences	697
C The Standard of Proof	698
16 Retrospectivity and the Principle of Legal Certainty	701
A Introduction	701
B Certainty of Definition	702
I At common law generally	702
II The treatment of bye-laws	703
III The Strasbourg caselaw	704
IV Comparative approaches	709

V Legal certainty under the Human Rights Act	711
C Judicial Development of the Elements of an Offence	717
D Crimes under International Law	722
E War Crimes	723
17 Issues of Criminal Responsibility	725
A The Age of Criminal Responsibility	725
B Trial of Young Defendants	730
C Positive Obligations Towards Juveniles	735
D Insanity	737
E Diminished Responsibility	742
18 The Substantive Criminal Law	745
A Introduction	745
B The Right to Respect for Private Life	745
I General principles	746
II The compatibility of the Sexual Offences Act 2003	748
III Sadomasochist "assaults"	749
IV Assisting suicide	751
C Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion	752
I General principles	752
II Religious exemptions	753
III Prosecution for religious activity	754
IV Ethical and moral values	754
D Freedom of Expression	755
I Obscenity offences	756
II Artistic expression	759
III Race hate and other hate speech	760
IV Blasphemy	765
V Defamatory libel	766
VI Defamation of judges	769
VII Speech attacking the state	770
VIII Disclosure of official secrets	772
IX Free speech and public order	773
X Election offences	776
E Freedom of Assembly and Association	776
I General principles	776
II Offences under the Public Order Act 1986 and Criminal Justice and Public Order Act 1994	779
III A right to assemble on private property?	782
IV Freedom of association	783
F Other Issues	784
19 The Rights of Victims of Crime	785
A Introduction	785
B Obligations to Prevent Infringements of Rights Under Articles 2 and 3	786

C Obligation to Have in Place Laws which Penalise Infringements of Basic Rights	790
I Protection of Article 3 rights	790
II Protection of Article 2 rights	794
Justifiable force	794
Abortion	803
Patients in a persistent vegetative state: withdrawal of treatment and Euthanasia	806
Other Surgical Procedures	809
III Protection of Article 8 rights	810
IV The protection of other rights	811
V Section 7(8) of the Human Rights Act	813
D Duty to Investigate Alleged Breaches of Articles 2 and 3	813
E Obligation to Prosecute or Give Reasons	821
F Rights of Victims and Witnesses in Criminal Trials	823
I Protecting the identity of witnesses	823
II Protecting witnesses' rights during the trial	825
III Victims, witnesses and confidential medical records	827
G Victims' Rights and the Sentencing Process	828
H Positive Obligations and Article 4	832
20 Sentencing and Related Issues	835
A Challenges to the Severity of Sentences	835
I Disproportionately severe sentences as "inhuman" punishment under the Convention	836
II Constitutional disproportionality in other jurisdictions	841
III Disproportionately severe sentences and Articles 8 to 11	843
IV Disproportionality and Protocol 1	848
V Disproportionate penalties and European Community law	848
B Preventative Sentences	848
I Discretionary sentences of life imprisonment	849
II Detention during Her Majesty's Pleasure	851
III Mandatory life sentences for murder	852
IV Indeterminate sentences for dangerous offenders	856
V Hospital orders with restrictions without limit of time	857
VI Extended sentences	858
C Custodial Sentences: Credit for Time Served	859
D Equal Treatment in Sentencing	860
E Consent to Community Penalties	863
F Proceedings Against Fine Defaulters	864
G Sentencing Procedure	864
I Confiscation of the proceeds of crime	865
II Guilty pleas and defendants' rights	869
III Disclosure and sentencing	871

CONTENTS

H The Prohibition on Retrospective Penalties	871
I The meaning of "penalty"	871
II Retrospectivity—the meaning of "applicable at the time the offence was committed"	875
I Recommendation for Deportation	882
J Indefinite Preventive Orders	886
21 Appeals	887
A General Principles	887
I Application of Article 6 to appeals	887
II Retrospective application of the Human Rights Act	889
B The Requirements of Article 6 on Appeal	890
I The general position	890
II The right to free legal representation and a public hearing in the presence of the accused	890
No hearing	891
Oral hearing in the defendant's presence but without representation	893
Oral hearing in the defendant's absence	895
Oral hearing in the defendant's absence and without representation	896
The criminal appeal system in England and Wales	896
III Reasons in appeal proceedings	897
IV Loss of time and other procedural sanctions on appeal	899
V Appeals and the reasonable time guarantee	902
VI Substituted verdicts	902
C Unfair Trials and Unsafe Convictions	903
I Reinterpreting the Criminal Appeal Act	903
Curing first instance Article 6 defects	913
Alternative remedies	914
II The duty to reopen proceedings following adverse ECtHR finding	915
D Declarations of Incompatibility in criminal appeals	917
E The Criminal Justice Act 2003	920
I Prosecution appeals	920
II Retrial for serious offences	921

APPENDICES

1 European Material	923
2 Protocol to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, as amended by Protocol No.11	935
3 Protocol No.6 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms Concerning the Abolition of the Death Penalty, as amended by Protocol No.11	937

CONTENTS

4 Protocol No.7 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms Concerning the Abolition of the Death Penalty, as amended by Protocol No.11 801	939
5 United Kingdom Material	943

INDEX