

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i> .....	v
<i>Preface</i> .....	vii
<i>Dedication</i> .....	ix
<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	xvii
<i>Table of Legislation</i> .....	xli

## CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

1. Overview.....	2
2. Overview of the Legal System in Hong Kong.....	2
(a) Criminal courts in Hong Kong.....	3
(b) Civil courts in Hong Kong.....	9
3. Overview of Trial Procedure.....	12
(a) Criminal trials.....	13
(b) Civil trials.....	14
4. Important Concepts in the Law of Evidence.....	14
(a) The concept of relevance.....	14
(b) Difference between weight and admissibility.....	15
(c) Direct evidence v circumstantial evidence.....	15
(d) Factual evidence v opinion evidence.....	19
(e) Oral evidence v documentary evidence.....	20
5. Assessment of Evidence.....	21
(a) Approach in criminal appellate courts.....	21
(b) Approach in civil appellate courts.....	28

## CHAPTER 2 BURDEN AND STANDARD OF PROOF

1. Introduction.....	34
(a) Burden of proof and standard of proof.....	34
(b) Legal burden and evidential burden.....	34
2. Burden and Standard of Proof in Criminal Trials.....	34
(a) General principles.....	34
(b) Prosecution's burden.....	35
(c) Defendant's burden.....	50
3. Reverse Onus in Criminal Trials.....	58
(a) Position prior to the Court of Final Appeal's decision in <i>Hin Lin Yee v HKSAR</i> and <i>Kulemesin v HKSAR</i> .....	59
(b) Court of Final Appeal in <i>Hin Lin Yee v HKSAR</i> and <i>Kulemesin v HKSAR</i> .....	62
4. Burden and Standard of Proof in Civil Trial.....	73
(a) Burden of proof.....	73
(b) Standard of proof.....	73

### CHAPTER 3 COMPETENCE AND COMPELLABILITY OF WITNESSES

1. Introduction.....	78
(a) Take oath or affirm before giving evidence.....	78
(b) Witness summons.....	79
2. Competence.....	83
(a) General principles.....	83
(b) The accused.....	83
(c) A convict or an interested person.....	83
(d) Minors.....	84
(e) Mentally incapacitated persons.....	86
(f) Co-accused(s).....	88
3. Compellability.....	88
(a) General principles.....	88
(b) The accused.....	88
(c) Spouse of the accused.....	90
(d) Co-accused(s).....	93

### CHAPTER 4 WITNESSES

1. Introduction.....	97
2. Examination-in-Chief.....	97
(a) Leading questions forbidden.....	97
(b) Bolstering the credibility of a witness.....	98
(c) Previous consistent statements.....	98
3. Cross-Examination.....	115
(a) The rule in <i>Browne v Dunn</i> .....	116
(b) Collateral finality rule.....	121
(c) Special rules in sexual offences.....	126
4. Re-Examination.....	128
5. Questions by the Court.....	128
6. Special Treatment of a Witness's Evidence.....	129
(a) Lie directions.....	129
(b) Flight directions.....	134
(c) Warnings in sexual offences.....	136
(d) Tainted witness.....	140
(e) Police witnesses.....	141
(f) Lifestyle evidence in drug cases.....	142
7. Re-Opening of a Party's Case.....	143
(a) Re-opening of the prosecution's case.....	143
(b) Re-opening of the defence case.....	144

## CHAPTER 5 RIGHT OF SILENCE

1. Right of Silence as a Defendant's Right .....	148
2. Defendant's Pre-Trial Right of Silence .....	149
(a) Reasonable grounds of suspecting a person .....	149
(b) Laying charge .....	149
(c) Taking record of interview or video-recorded interview .....	150
(d) Right of silence and undercover investigation .....	152
3. Defendant's Right of Silence During Trial .....	152
(a) Right to elect not to give evidence in trial .....	152
(b) Directions to the fact-finding tribunal .....	157
4. Privilege against Self-Incrimination .....	160
5. Brief Comparison with the English Position .....	164

## CHAPTER 6 HEARSAY EVIDENCE

1. Introduction .....	168
(a) Reliability of hearsay evidence .....	168
(b) The best evidence rule .....	169
(c) Right to confront .....	169
(d) Allowing the fact-finding tribunal to assess demeanour of a witness .....	170
2. What is <i>not</i> Hearsay? .....	170
(a) Out-of-court statements admitted for ulterior purposes .....	171
(b) Implied assertion .....	172
(c) Original evidence v hearsay evidence .....	174
The Court of Final Appeal's Rulings .....	176
(a) <i>Secretary for Justice v Lui Kin Hong Jerry</i> .....	176
(b) <i>HKSAR v Oey Hengky Wiryo</i> .....	177
Common Law Exceptions to Hearsay .....	179
(a) Confession or admission .....	180
(b) Dying declaration .....	181
(c) <i>Res gestae</i> .....	183
(d) Co-conspirator's rule .....	188
Statutory Exceptions .....	189
(a) By consent: ss. 65B and 65C of the Criminal Procedure Ordinance .....	189
(b) Documentary records in criminal trials .....	192
(c) Public documents .....	193
(d) Bank records .....	195
(e) Computer records .....	196
(f) Giving evidence by live television link, video recording, etc .....	201
(g) Miscellaneous documents .....	203
† Hearsay in Civil Proceedings .....	203
(a) Weight to be placed on hearsay evidence .....	204
The Way Forward .....	206
(a) The English Criminal Justice Act 2003 .....	206
(b) Law reform in Hong Kong .....	207

## CHAPTER 5 RIGHT OF SILENCE

1. Right of Silence as a Defendant's Right .....	148
2. Defendant's Pre-Trial Right of Silence .....	149
(a) Reasonable grounds of suspecting a person .....	149
(b) Laying charge .....	149
(c) Taking record of interview or video-recorded interview .....	150
(d) Right of silence and undercover investigation .....	152
3. Defendant's Right of Silence During Trial .....	152
(a) Right to elect not to give evidence in trial .....	152
(b) Directions to the fact-finding tribunal .....	157
4. Privilege against Self-Incrimination .....	160
5. Brief Comparison with the English Position .....	164

## CHAPTER 6 HEARSAY EVIDENCE

1. Introduction .....	168
(a) Reliability of hearsay evidence .....	168
(b) The best evidence rule .....	169
(c) Right to confront .....	169
(d) Allowing the fact-finding tribunal to assess demeanour of a witness .....	170
2. What is <i>not</i> Hearsay? .....	170
(a) Out-of-court statements admitted for ulterior purposes .....	171
(b) Implied assertion .....	172
(c) Original evidence v hearsay evidence .....	174
3. The Court of Final Appeal's Rulings .....	176
(a) <i>Secretary for Justice v Lui Kin Hong Jerry</i> .....	176
(b) <i>HKSAR v Oey Hengky Wiryo</i> .....	177
4. Common Law Exceptions to Hearsay .....	179
(a) Confession or admission .....	180
(b) Dying declaration .....	181
(c) <i>Res gestae</i> .....	183
(d) Co-conspirator's rule .....	188
5. Statutory Exceptions .....	189
(a) By consent: ss. 65B and 65C of the Criminal Procedure Ordinance .....	189
(b) Documentary records in criminal trials .....	192
(c) Public documents .....	193
(d) Bank records .....	195
(e) Computer records .....	196
(f) Giving evidence by live television link, video recording, etc .....	201
(g) Miscellaneous documents .....	203
6. Hearsay in Civil Proceedings .....	203
(a) Weight to be placed on hearsay evidence .....	204
7. The Way Forward .....	206
(a) The English Criminal Justice Act 2003 .....	206
(b) Law reform in Hong Kong .....	207

**CHAPTER 7 CONFESSION**

1. Confession as an Exception to Hearsay.....	210
2. What Makes a Confession Admissible?.....	210
(a) Relevant and unequivocal.....	211
(b) Declaration against self-interest .....	213
(c) Voluntariness.....	216
3. Rules and Directions for the Questioning of Suspects and the Taking of Statements.....	222
(a) History and purpose of the Rules and Directions .....	222
(b) The Rules and Directions.....	224
4. Procedures in Considering Admissibility of Confession .....	237
(a) General.....	237
(b) The residual discretion to exclude the confession .....	240
(c) Procedures that determines admissibility .....	243
(d) Giving reasons for the ruling of admissibility.....	246
5. Evidential Value of a Confession.....	247
6. The Apology Ordinance and its Implications on Admissions.....	251

**CHAPTER 8 ILLEGALLY OBTAINED EVIDENCE**

1. Introduction.....	256
2. Rules on Illegally Obtained Evidence.....	256
(a) General principle .....	256
(b) Exceptions.....	257
3. The Rules in <i>R v Sang</i> and <i>Secretary for Justice v Lam Tat Ming</i> .....	259
(a) Residual discretion to exclude evidence whose prejudicial effect outweighs the probative value.....	259
(b) <i>R v Sang</i> .....	259
(c) <i>Secretary for Justice v Lam Tat Ming</i> .....	260
(d) Fundamental rights and residual discretion .....	263
4. Undercover Operations, Entrapment, and Telephone interception.....	266
(a) Exclusion of evidence obtained by entrapment and undercover operations.....	267
(b) Stay of proceeding on the ground of abuse of process .....	272
(c) Exclusion of telephone interceptions.....	274

**CHAPTER 9 IDENTIFICATION EVIDENCE**

1. Introduction.....	278
2. Identification Parade .....	278
(a) Conducting an identification parade.....	280
(b) Non-compliance of procedures of identification parade.....	281
(c) Alternative visual identification procedures .....	283
3. Dock Identification.....	286
(a) Exceptions to dock identification .....	286
(b) Establishing basis for dock identification .....	288
(c) Fact-finding tribunal comparing the defendant in the dock with other evidence .....	288

4. Admissibility of Identification Evidence.....	291
(a) Introduction.....	291
(b) <i>Voir dire</i> .....	292
(c) Withdrawing identification evidence.....	293
5. Directions in Relation to Identification Evidence: The <i>Turnbull</i> Directions.....	296
(a) The <i>Turnbull</i> Directions.....	297
(b) When would <i>Turnbull</i> Directions be needed?.....	299
(c) Specific <i>Turnbull</i> Directions.....	299
6. Other Types of Identification Evidence.....	302
(a) Voice identification.....	302
(b) Facial mapping.....	303
(c) Fingerprint.....	304
(e) DNA evidence.....	305

## CHAPTER 10 CHARACTER EVIDENCE

1. Introduction.....	308
2. Good Character.....	308
(a) The English position: <i>R v Berrada</i> and <i>R v Pye</i> directions.....	309
(b) Hong Kong's position: <i>HKSAR v Tang Siu Man (No 2)</i> .....	311
(c) The <i>Specimen Directions</i> .....	315
(d) Post- <i>HKSAR v Tang Siu Man (No 2)</i> .....	317
(e) Omission as material misdirection.....	320
3. Bad Character.....	321
(a) The English Common Law position.....	322
(b) Position in Hong Kong: <i>HKSAR v Zubeed Ali</i> .....	326
(c) Further complications.....	328
(d) Evidence of similar facts and its use.....	333
(e) Uncharged acts.....	334
(f) Overriding residual discretion.....	336
4. Section 54(1)(f) of the Criminal Procedure Ordinance.....	337
(a) Exception s.54(1)(f)(i): some admissible evidence exists.....	338
(b) Exception s.54(1)(f)(ii): defendant raises a good character of himself.....	338
(c) Exception s.54(1)(f)(iii): giving evidence against co-defendant.....	340
(d) The English Criminal Justice Act 2003.....	341
(e) Conclusion.....	343

## CHAPTER 11 OPINION EVIDENCE

1. Introduction.....	346
2. Rules on Opinion Evidence.....	346
(a) General principles.....	346
(b) Exceptions.....	347
3. Expert Opinion.....	348
(a) Expert <i>ad hoc</i> .....	350
(b) Qualifications of an expert.....	352
(c) Scope of expert opinion.....	355
(d) The ultimate issue.....	356
(e) Duty of an expert.....	360

**CHAPTER 12 PRIVILEGE**

1. Introduction.....	366
2. Legal Professional Privilege .....	366
(a) General.....	366
(b) Scope of the privilege.....	367
(c) Extent of privilege.....	369
(d) Exceptions to privilege.....	373
3. Public Interest Immunity.....	376
<i>Index</i> .....	381

<http://www.pbookshop.com>