

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Foreword by Gerard McCoy SC</i> .....	v
<i>Foreword by Hectar Pun SC</i> .....	vii
<i>Foreword by Piya Muqit</i> .....	ix
<i>Preface</i> .....	xi
<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	xix
<i>Table of Legislation</i> .....	xxxiii
<i>Table of Treaties &amp; Conventions</i> .....	xxxvii
<i>Table of Abbreviations</i> .....	xli

## PART I

### SUBSTANTIVE LEGAL FRAMEWORK IN HONG KONG

#### CHAPTER 1 NON-REFOULEMENT LAW IN HONG KONG

Pre-USM: The Development of Non-refoulement Law in Hong Kong .....	3
The USM: An Overview of the USM .....	11

#### CHAPTER 2 THE CONVENTION AGAINST TORTURE ('CAT')

Non-refoulement: Principle in CAT .....	13
<i>Prohibition against non-refoulement under CAT is absolute</i> .....	14
<i>Threshold/standard of proof</i> .....	14
<i>All relevant considerations</i> .....	15
Definition of 'Torture' under Section 37U(1) of the Immigration Ordinance .....	21
<i>Infliction of severe mental pain or suffering</i> .....	21
<i>Intention</i> .....	23
<i>For a specific purpose</i> .....	24
<i>Involvement of a public official or other persons</i> <i>acting in an official capacity</i> .....	24
<i>Excluding pain or suffering arising only from,             inherent or incidental to lawful sanctions</i> .....	28

#### CHAPTER 3 CRUEL, INHUMAN OR DEGRADING TREATMENT OR PUNISHMENT ('CIDTP')

Non-refoulement Principle and 'Absolute and Non-derogable' Rights .....	31
HKBORO Section 8, Article 3 – Torture and CIDTP .....	32
<i>Minimum level of severity</i> .....	33
<i>Standard of proof – 'genuine and substantial risk'</i> .....	34
<i>Definition of CIDTP</i> .....	37

<i>Medical or scientific experimentation without consent</i> .....	40
<i>Generalised violence and humanitarian conditions amounting to CIDTP</i> .....	40
CIDTP Cases.....	43

#### **CHAPTER 4 RIGHT TO LIFE**

'Absolute and Non-Derogable Rights' .....	56
<i>Death penalty</i> .....	57
<i>The right to life in armed conflict</i> .....	62
<i>Other express exceptions</i> .....	63
<i>Obligations with regard to the right to life</i> .....	65
Arbitrarily Deprived of Life.....	69
Non-refoulement Principle.....	69
<i>Non-refoulement to a State to face the death penalty</i> .....	72
<i>Non-refoulement to a place in a state of humanitarian crisis</i> .....	73

#### **CHAPTER 5 PERSECUTION**

Persecution as Part of the USM .....	75
Definition of a Refugee.....	77
<i>Well-founded fear</i> .....	77
<i>Persecution</i> .....	84
Internal Protection Alternative .....	102
<i>Cessation</i> .....	103
Exclusion and Expulsion Grounds.....	104
<i>Article 1D</i> .....	105
<i>Article 1E</i> .....	106
<i>Article 1F</i> .....	107

#### PART II

#### THE UNIFIED SCREENING MECHANISM

#### **CHAPTER 6 AN OVERVIEW OF THE USM**

Commencing a Non-refoulement Claim.....	113
<i>The claimant must wait until the permission to stay has expired</i> .....	113
<i>The Written Signification</i> .....	114
<i>A claimant may not be removed to the torture State once a non-refoulement claim is made</i> .....	116
<i>The briefing session with the Immigration Department</i> .....	117
<i>Referral to the Duty Lawyer Service for free legal representation</i> .....	117
<i>Written request for return of the NCF</i> .....	117

#### **CHAPTER 7 STAGE 1 OF THE USM**

DLS Eligibility Test .....	119
Assigning a Lawyer, Interpreter and Court Liaison Officer .....	119

The Initial Conference .....	120
<i>Detention pending final determination</i> .....	123
<i>Withdrawal of a claim</i> .....	124
<i>Re-opening a withdrawn claim</i> .....	124
PDPO Documents .....	125
Completing the NCF.....	126
<i>Part 1 – Biographical Information</i> .....	128
<i>Part 2 – Documentation</i> .....	129
<i>Part 3 – Basis of Your Claim</i> .....	130
<i>Part 4 – Travel Details</i> .....	133
<i>Part 5 – Completion of this Claim Form</i> .....	134
<i>Part 6 – Interpreter's Confirmation &amp; Part 7 – Your Confirmation as a Claimant</i> .....	135
Transitional Arrangements .....	135
<i>Supplementary Claim Form</i> .....	135
<i>BOR 2 – right to life</i> .....	136
The Second Conference .....	136
<i>Preparing for the Second Conference</i> .....	136
<i>Settling Q.35 at the Second Conference</i> .....	137
<i>Advising the claimant on particular matters</i> .....	138
<i>Advising on merits</i> .....	138
<i>Requesting medical examination</i> .....	139
<i>Translation of the NCF</i> .....	139
Deadlines and Extensions .....	139
Legal Submissions .....	140
<b>CHAPTER 8 STAGES 2 &amp; 3 OF THE USM</b>	
Stage 2 of the USM.....	147
<i>Screening Interview</i> .....	149
<i>Medical examination</i> .....	152
Stage 3 of the USM.....	153
<i>Substantiated claims</i> .....	154
<i>Revocation of a substantiated decision</i> .....	155
<i>Unsubstantiated claims</i> .....	155
<i>When a torture claim is finally determined</i> .....	156
<i>Limitation on subsequent claim</i> .....	157
<i>Advising the claimant</i> .....	157
<i>To appeal or not to appeal?</i> .....	158
<b>CHAPTER 9 STAGE 4 OF THE USM</b>	
Statutory and Administrative Schemes for Appeal/Petition.....	163
Filing an Appeal/Petition .....	163
Directions Hearings .....	165
Oral Hearing or Decision on the Papers? .....	166
Matters Prior to the Hearing .....	168
Skeleton Submissions .....	170
The Hearing .....	171

Decision .....	174
Revocation .....	175
Withdrawal .....	175

## CHAPTER 10 JUDICIAL REVIEW

by PY Lo

Judicial Review .....	177
List of Judicial Review Grounds with regard to the USM.....	183

## CHAPTER 11 EVIDENCE

Admissibility and Weight.....	215
Claimant's Testimony .....	215
Documentary Evidence.....	218
Authenticity.....	219
Expert Evidence.....	221
Role.....	221
Limits .....	222
<i>Finding and instructing experts</i> .....	223
<i>Reviewing expert reports</i> .....	224
<i>Medico-legal reports</i> .....	224
Credibility .....	226
<i>Behaviours capable of damaging credibility</i> .....	226
<i>Evidence to be considered in assessing credibility</i> .....	228
<i>A structured approach to credibility assessment</i> .....	229
<i>The 'refusal mindset'</i> .....	237
Further Reading .....	238

## CHAPTER 12 COUNTRY OF ORIGIN INFORMATION IN PROCEDURES OF INTERNATIONAL PROTECTION

by Andrea Jakober & Reinhold Jawhari

What is Country of Origin Information? .....	239
Functions of COI.....	240
<i>Scope of COI</i> .....	241
<i>Limits of COI</i> .....	242
What is Good COI? – Quality Standards and Principles .....	244
<i>COI quality standards</i> .....	244
<i>Principles for researching and using COI</i> .....	248
From Case to Questions .....	250
Sources .....	252
<i>Source assessment</i> .....	253
<i>Dubious sources</i> .....	255
Cross-checking Information.....	256
<i>Cross-checking techniques</i> .....	256
Tools to Support COI Research .....	256
<i>ACCORD's ecoi.net</i> .....	256
<i>UNHCR's Refworld</i> .....	257
<i>EASO COI Portal</i> .....	258

## CHAPTER 13 OTHER MATTERS

Interpreters .....	259
Difficult Claimants.....	260
The Role of ISS and Assistance Given to Non-refoulement	
Claimants.....	262
The Role of NGOs .....	262
The UNHCR .....	263
Criminal Charges and Convictions .....	264
Fees .....	265
Challenges and Change.....	265
<i>Differences between the definition of persecution risk by the Immigration Department and the RC</i> .....	266
<i>Access to legal representation when making written significations</i> .....	266
<i>No protection against chain refoulement</i> .....	266
<i>Unreported decisions</i> .....	267
<i>28 days for returning NCF inadequate</i> .....	267
<i>Medical evidence</i> .....	267
<i>Prescheduling SI</i> .....	267
<i>Behaviour damaging credibility</i> .....	268
<i>The USM is not unified</i> .....	268
<i>Part VIIC whilst only applying to torture claims purports to apply to all grounds</i> .....	268
<i>Low number of substantiated claims</i> .....	268
<i>Sharing of resources</i> .....	269
<i>Right to work</i> .....	269
<i>Delay</i> .....	269
Testing the Boundaries of the USM.....	270

## APPENDIX

App 1: Immigration Ordinance (Cap 115), Pt VIIC(1)–(3).....	271
App 2: Immigration Ordinance (Cap 115), Sch 1A .....	289
App 3: Hong Kong Bill of Rights Ordinance (Cap 383) .....	299
App 4: Important Articles - Treaties and Conventions.....	315
<i>Index</i> .....	319